COST-EFFECTIVENESS OF PUBLISHING EDUCATIONAL MATERIALS IN AFRICAN LANGUAGES
PERSPECTIVES ON AFRICAN BOOK DEVELOPMENT

Titles in the series
1 Cost Effectiveness of Publishing Educational Materials in African Languages, English and French editions, ed. Maureen Woodhall


3 A Bibliography of Publishing and the Book Chain in sub-Saharan Africa, 1996, Hans Zell

In preparation
Les habitudes de Lecture en Afrique sub-Saharienne et les Apprentisages Traditionnels, Sophia Gazza

Distribution and Dissemination Systems for Educational Materials in West Africa, Chief Aigboje Higo and Philippe Gabriel

Accessibility to Educational Materials by the School Population in Africa, ed. Diana Rosenberg

Fiscal and Legal Constraints to Intra-African Trade in Books
COST-EFFECTIVENESS OF PUBLISHING EDUCATIONAL MATERIALS IN AFRICAN LANGUAGES

EDITED BY MAUREEN WOODHALL
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements vii
List of authors and participants ix

1 INTRODUCTION – MAUREEN WOODHALL 1
Purpose of workshops and case studies
Methodology of the case studies
The cost-benefit and cost-effectiveness framework
Problems encountered in the case studies
Policy issues
Cost issues
Issues of benefits and effectiveness
Strategies for minimizing costs
Conclusions
References

2 THE GAMBIA – ABDOULIE JOBE 25
The social, economic and educational context
Language policy
Policy on publishing in national languages
Strategies for minimizing costs
Cost of publishing
Benefits and effectiveness
Conclusion
References

3 MADAGASCAR – LOUIS LAI SENG 43
Introduction: the context of the study
Language policy
Publishing policy
Strategies for minimizing costs
Costs of textbooks
Impact of educational materials in Malagasy
Conclusion
Notes
4 NAMIBIA – LAURENTIUS DAVIDS

Introduction
Language policy
Policy on publishing in national languages
Strategies for minimizing costs
Costs of publishing educational materials
Perceived benefits and effectiveness
Conclusions
References

5 SENEGAL – GASTON PIERRE COLY

Introduction and acknowledgements
The social, economic and educational context
Language policy
Policy on publishing in national languages
Strategies for minimizing costs
Costs of publishing and supplying
Benefits and effectiveness
Conclusion
References

6 ZAMBIA – SHADREK HAKALIMA

The social, economic and educational context
Language policy
Policy on publishing educational materials
Present strategies for minimizing costs
Cost of publishing or providing educational materials
Perceived benefits and effectiveness
Conclusions

APPENDICES

1 Madagascar: Decision no. 1.001-90/MINESEB 117
2 Madagascar: Ministry of Public Education circular July 1992 119
3 Madagascar: Memo from the Ministry of Public Education Secretary-General 24 June 1993 121
4 Namibia: List of languages in use 123
5 Namibia: Price list, Out of Africa Publishers 124
6 Namibia: Census indicators, 1991 125

Glossary 127
Index 129
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Association for the Development of Education in Africa Working Group on Books and Learning Materials organized the two workshops on cost-effectiveness of publishing educational materials in national languages, held in Dakar in March and July, 1996, and commissioned these case studies. The meetings of the workshops were hosted by the Ministry of Basic Education and National Languages, of Senegal, and were opened by the Minister of Basic Education and National Languages, M. Mamadou Ndoye. Administrative arrangements for the workshops were made by Madame Fatou Somare, of the Ministry of Education, and translation was provided by M. Aymerou Mbaye. Financial assistance for the workshops and case studies was provided by the Association for the Development of Education in Africa, the Overseas Development Administration (ODA), DANIDA and FINNIDA.

I would like to thank all these organizations and individuals for their contributions to the success of the workshops and case studies, also the translators of the case studies, Valerie Zitoun, Tony Berrett and Stuart John, who translated the initial outline of the case studies into French. I would particularly like to thank Dr Carew Treffgarne of the ODA, Convenor of the Working Group on Books and Learning Materials, and Mrs Carol Priestley, of the International African Institute, for arranging the workshops and providing administrative support for the case studies, and all the participants of the workshops, for their lively and stimulating discussions, as well as the authors of these five case studies.

Maureen Woodhall
December 1996
Figure i  States used as case studies in this book.
LIST OF AUTHORS AND PARTICIPANTS

WORKSHOP FACILITATOR AND EDITOR OF THE CASE STUDIES
Maureen Woodhall
Research Fellow
Department of Education
University of Wales Aberystwyth
Aberystwyth SY23 1HD, UNITED KINGDOM

AUTHORS OF THE CASE STUDIES
Gambia
Abdoulie Jobe
Local Languages and Principal Curriculum Officer
National Curriculum Research and Professional Development Centre
Ministry of Education
Orange Street
Banjul, GAMBIA

Madagascar
Dr Louis Lai Seng
Director
Unité d’Étude et de Recherche Pédagogiques
Complexe Scolaire Ampefiloha
BP 5090
Antananarivo, MADAGASCAR

Namibia
Mr Laurentius Davids
Education Officer for Khoekhoegowab
National Institute for Educational Development:
Private Bag 2034
Okahandja, NAMIBIA
Senegal
Gaston Pierre Coly
Direction de l’Alphabétisation et l’Education de Base (DAEB)
Ministère de l’Education de Base et des Langues Nationales
BP. 15743
Dakar, SENEGAL

Zambia
Dr Shadreck Hakalima
Books Procurement Unit
Ministry of Education
Mogadishu Road
PO Box 50093
Lusaka, ZAMBIA

OTHER WORKSHOP PARTICIPANTS

Niger
M. Laouali Amani
Chef de la Cellule Langues Nationales
Institut National de Documentation, de Recherche et
d’Animation Pédagogiques (INDRAP)
B.P. 10184
Niamey, NIGER

Senegal
Mme Sonja Diallo
Associates in Research and Education for Development (ARED)
Centre Amadou Malick Gueye (ancien Bopp)
BP 5270
Dakar, SENEGAL

INTERPRETATION

M. Amerou Mbaye
Conseiller Technique pour l’Enseignement de la Langue Anglaise
Pièce 33 Bis, 2ème Etage
Ministre de l’Education Nationale
Immeuble rue Calmette
Dakar, SENEGAL
INTRODUCTION

MAUREEN WOODHALL

Purpose of workshops and case studies

The five case studies on the cost-effectiveness of publishing educational materials in national and local African languages, published in this volume, were commissioned in 1996 on behalf of the Association for the Development of Education in Africa (ADEA) by its Working Group on Books and Learning Materials. The UK’s Overseas Development Agency (ODA), which is the lead agency of the ADEA Working Group on Books and Learning Materials, organized two workshops on the topic of publishing books and other educational materials in African national languages, and commissioned these five case studies of the costs and benefits of educational materials in African languages. Maureen Woodhall acted as facilitator for the two workshops and subsequently edited the five case studies. The workshops provided a valuable opportunity for participants from both anglophone and francophone countries in Africa to share ideas and experience of language and publishing policies, particularly the policy and practice of publishing in national languages, and to review their countries’ experience in a cost-benefit and cost-effectiveness framework.

The participants came mainly from Ministries of Education or from agencies responsible for the production or procurement of educational materials. They were experts in language policy or in publishing in national languages in their respective countries, but for most participants this was the first time that they had encountered the concepts of cost-benefit and cost-effectiveness analysis. It was certainly the first time that they had attempted to apply these concepts to the publication of books and educational materials in national languages. Although the concepts were unfamiliar, their relevance to questions about how best to use scarce resources in order to encourage and sustain literacy, and to improve educational effectiveness and quality, was generally recognized. Participants from the five countries represented in these case studies therefore
welcomed the opportunity to gather information about the costs of publishing materials in national and local languages, to try to identify the benefits of using these materials, both in schools and in adult literacy programmes and other non-formal education, and to review strategies to promote and encourage publication and use of educational materials from the point of view of cost-effectiveness.

The first workshop was held in Dakar, 25–27 March 1996, and was attended by representatives from six countries: The Gambia, Madagascar, Namibia, Niger, Senegal and Zambia. A full list of the participants is given on page ix. The meeting was hosted by the Ministry of Basic Education and National Languages in Senegal, and was financed jointly by the ADEA, the ODA, and the Danish and Finnish development agencies [DANIDA and FINNIDA].

The first workshop had four main objectives:

1. To share experiences and compare language policies in the six countries, including government policies on national languages, the use of national and local languages in schools and non-formal education, and policies on publication and distribution of educational materials.
2. To identify problems, issues and strategies for minimising costs of publication, or promoting publication of materials in national or local languages.
3. To explore and discuss concepts of cost-benefit and cost-effectiveness analysis, and their relevance for improving understanding of policy issues, constraints and effects of alternative language and publishing policies.
4. To develop and agree a common framework and timetable for the case studies of cost-effectiveness of publishing educational materials in national and local languages.

It was agreed that the representatives of all the six countries represented at the first workshop would each write a case study of policies and experience of publishing educational materials in national languages in their own country. The case studies should be completed in three months, and should cover the following topics:

- Social, economic and educational context
- Official government policies on language, and the use of national and local languages in education
- Policy on development, publication and distribution of books and educational materials
- Strategies to minimize costs of publication in national languages
- Actual or estimated costs of publication in national languages
- Perceived benefits and effectiveness of materials in national languages
- Conclusions: Future strategies and developments.
After the first workshop the participants gathered information for the case studies, including data on costs of publication of materials in their countries, considered what information was available on benefits and effectiveness of these materials, and wrote the first drafts of their case studies. These drafts were discussed at the second workshop, held in Dakar from 1 to 3 July, attended by four participants from The Gambia, Madagascar, Namibia and Senegal. Subsequently a case study on Zambia was sent, although the author could not attend the July workshop. Unfortunately the representative from Niger was not able to attend the second workshop, or to complete the case study on Niger, due to pressure of work.

This chapter summarizes the main features, findings and conclusions of the five case studies, which have been edited, translated and are now published by ADEA in both French and English.

**Methodology of the case studies**

No additional funds were available for surveys or detailed data collection for the case studies. The time available for data collection and for completion of the case studies was extremely limited, and all the participants had to undertake the case studies while carrying out their normal duties. They were all therefore subject to severe time and financial constraints.

The case studies are based on available data, including official reports, other government documents and statistics, and published information on educational indicators, the use of local and national languages, costs of publication and availability and use of educational materials in national languages. These were supplemented, where possible, by:

- informal questionnaires
- interviews with officials, teachers, and publishers
- examples provided by publishers and by government or non-government agencies responsible for developing, publishing and distributing educational materials.

As this was the first time such an analysis had been attempted in any of these countries, all the case studies emphasize that there was a lack of data, particularly on costs, that there have been no systematic efforts to develop measures of the effectiveness of using materials in local languages, and the constraints of time and limited budgets meant that no special surveys or collection of data were possible. Where questionnaires were used to collect data, as in Senegal, the response rate was very low, either because this was the first time such information had been requested, or because it
was regarded as commercially sensitive. The authors therefore emphasize that their findings and conclusions are based on personal experience and informal and impressionistic rather than scientific evidence.

The cost-benefit and cost-effectiveness framework

Resources for education are scarce, particularly in developing countries, and even more particularly in Africa, where governments face severe financial constraints, coupled with rising demand for education. The need to ensure that resources are used as efficiently and effectively as possible has encouraged policy makers and planners to turn to economic tools, including cost-benefit and cost-effectiveness analysis, for guidance in planning investments in the education sector, in order to identify the most productive ways of combining physical and human resources, which will yield the greatest benefits from a given monetary outlay.

Cost-benefit analysis

Cost-benefit analysis of educational investments involves measurement of all the costs that must be incurred by governments, families or individuals, when they provide or participate in formal or non-formal education, and all the benefits that may be expected in the future, for society as a whole or for the educated individuals, from developing or acquiring literacy and other skills generated by formal schooling or non-formal education and training. Costs are measured both in terms of direct costs and opportunity costs, and benefits are measured in monetary terms, using data on the average lifetime earnings of workers with different levels of education. The income streams are compared over time, in order to estimate the expected rate of return from investment in different levels or types of education.

This rate of return can be calculated from the point of view of the economy or society as a whole (the social rate of return), in which case the costs include both direct costs such as teachers’ salaries, expenditure on books, materials, equipment and buildings, and the opportunity cost of earnings forgone by school pupils or students who are in the education system rather than in productive employment. Alternatively the rate of return can be calculated from the point of view of a family’s or individual’s own personal investment (the private rate of return), in which case the costs that are taken into account are only those incurred by pupils, students or their families, including fees, expenditure on books and other
materials, and the individual’s earnings forgone. In both cases the benefits of education are measured mainly in terms of direct benefits, in the form of the additional lifetime earnings of educated workers, in comparison to those who are illiterate, or have completed only minimal schooling, since workers who are educated can expect better job prospects and higher earnings than those with less, or no, formal or non-formal education. The private benefits enjoyed by the educated individuals are measured after tax, but the social benefits are measured before tax.

The underlying assumption of using lifetime earnings to measure the economic benefits of education, for estimates of the social rate of return, is that the higher earnings of educated workers reflect their higher productivity in the labour market. Some rate-of-return studies also try to take account of the indirect benefits, sometimes described as ‘externalities’ or ‘spill-over’ benefits, that are generated for society as a whole by the activities of educated adults and young people, but these are difficult to measure, and their inclusion in cost-benefit analysis of education remains problematic and controversial.

There is now an extensive literature on the rate of return to educational investment, with estimates of the social and private rates of return to different types or levels of schooling in more than 60 countries [Psacharopoulos and Woodhall, 1985; Woodhall, 1992 give a summary of the main conclusions of cost-benefit analysis of education in both developed and developing countries]. Despite the difficulties of measuring both direct and indirect benefits in precise and accurate monetary terms, and the uncertainties surrounding rate-of-return calculations, cost-benefit analysis can provide a useful framework for the assessment and systematic comparison of alternative investments. Such a framework has been used by both governments and funding agencies to guide broad investment decisions, such as determining relative priorities for investment or aid projects in different levels of education, or comparing the economic profitability of general versus vocational secondary education. Cost-benefit analysis of education, particularly the comparison between social and private rates of return, is also highly relevant to the question of how education should be financed, and how costs of different levels of education and training should be shared between individuals, families, employers, local communities and central government.

Cost-benefit analysis is of less use, however, for guiding decisions about alternative ways of using resources within schools, literacy programmes or other forms of education. The relative benefits of investing in additional teacher training versus increasing the supply of books or school equipment, or erecting new school buildings, cannot generally be measured in terms of
rates of return, since the benefits are not usually measurable in monetary terms. There are a few examples of cost-benefit studies where the benefits of an investment are measured not in terms of additional lifetime earnings, but by estimated cost savings due to reduced educational wastage. These savings, expressed in monetary terms, can then be compared with the extra costs incurred by investment in teacher training, school materials or other interventions. For most comparisons of alternative ways of using resources, however, an alternative form of analysis – cost-effectiveness analysis – has been developed, that does not require specification and measurement of benefits in monetary terms.

Cost-effectiveness analysis

Educational policy makers or managers frequently need to identify the most cost-effective way of using resources, in order to minimize the costs of achieving a given standard of performance, or to maximize the results achieved from a given expenditure. Whereas cost-benefit analysis requires both costs and benefits to be measured in monetary terms, cost-effectiveness analysis measures the cost of resources in monetary terms, then compares the effects or outcomes of alternative ways of using these resources, in terms of quantifiable but non-monetary measures. For example comparisons of the cost effectiveness of alternative forms of education, such as traditional classroom-based teaching and distance education, may use examination results, or scores in specially administered tests of achievement, as measures of effectiveness. Similarly test scores can be used as measures of the ‘output’ of different teaching methods, in order to evaluate the cost-effectiveness of alternative combinations of ‘inputs’. Another measure of effectiveness of different programmes, used in several studies, is the differential rate of educational wastage, in the form of repetition and drop-out from school or from other programmes.

There are many examples of cost-effectiveness analysis to evaluate the use of educational technology, such as school radio or television. Another potential use of cost-effectiveness analysis would be to compare part-time in-service training of teachers with formal full-time upgrading programmes in teacher training colleges. In this case detailed data on the costs of the two alternatives would have to be compared with measures of the effectiveness of the retrained teachers. Such measures might include the subsequent performance of pupils in their classes (measured in terms of examination results or progression rates) or judgements of school inspectors and headteachers about the quality of their teaching. Other ways in which cost-effectiveness analysis has been used is to identify the most cost-effective combination of inputs to achieve a
given policy objective, such as to improve educational quality or access.

**EXAMPLES OF COST-EFFECTIVENESS ANALYSIS OF EDUCATIONAL MATERIALS**

There have been many attempts to apply this tool to the evaluation of the cost-effectiveness of textbooks or other educational materials. An early study for the World Bank (Heyneman, Farrell and Sepulveda-Stuardo, 1981), based on studies in Brazil, Chile, El Salvador, Ecuador, India, Iran, Malaysia, Thailand and Uganda, concluded:

The evidence available suggests that an investment in textbooks will produce learning gains; and that this is more likely to occur as a result of a textbook investment than it is as a result of other educational interventions such as teacher training. We do not know the relative rates of financial return for an investment in texts as compared to an investment in other scholastic improvements, nor how to maximise that pay-off under varying conditions. Efforts to gather more precise information is important, because investment programmes in textbooks are likely to increase.

*Heyneman, Farrell and Sepulveda-Stuardo, 1981: 245*

Other research for the World Bank has confirmed the positive relationship between books and learning outcomes. After reviewing 22 studies of the effectiveness of textbooks, Fuller (1986) concluded: ‘The positive impact of instructional materials – especially those directly related to reading and writing – is consistent’ (Fuller 1986: 29).

The most recent review of cost-effectiveness studies regarding attempts to improve the quality of primary education in Sub-Saharan Africa [Heneveld and Craig, 1996] found that:

The impact of textbook use is far greater in African countries because of their scarcity compared with the abundance of textbooks available in industrial countries. The evidence is very strong that children in developing countries who have access to textbooks and other reading materials learn more than those who do not have access. Textbooks are the single most important instructional material and are particularly effective where teachers use teaching guides with them.

*Heneveld and Craig, 1996: 20*

A study of rural primary schools in Brazil [Harbison and Hanushek 1992] examined the cost-effectiveness of various factors by measuring the cost per pupil of different school inputs, and measuring output in terms of scores on language and mathematics tests and also drop-out and repetition rates. The effectiveness of investment in educational ‘software’, (textbooks and writing materials) was compared with investment in ‘hardware’ (school
facilities and furnishings), in terms of the percentage change achieved in drop-out and repetition rates for a given expenditure. Cost-effectiveness was measured in terms of two indicators: years saved and dollars saved by the investment. The years saved is a simple quantitative measure of the total reduction of time needed for a cohort to complete primary schooling, if average repetition and drop-out rates fell by these percentages. By multiplying years saved by the average cost per pupil-year a figure of dollars saved could be calculated. A summary of the research concluded that:

The results are stunning. A $1 investment in software (textbooks and writing materials) returns $9.67 in direct efficiency savings from improved flow through the system. An estimate greater than $1 indicates that any investment is more than fully offset through efficiency gains, i.e. that it is self-financing.

_Hanushek et al., 1992: 20_

The research in Brazil suggests that investment in software, including textbooks, was far more cost-effective than investment in hardware. The authors call these ‘self-financing investments’ since they generate immediate benefits, in the form of improved flow of students through schools, as well as longer-run returns in the form of increased labour market productivity and higher earnings for those who complete primary schooling. While these results are very encouraging, this form of cost-effectiveness analysis is very demanding in terms of data requirements. The study in Brazil was able to use a very rich set of data on pupil performance in specially administered tests in order to derive measures of cost-effectiveness, but such data are rarely available in developing countries.

**The effectiveness of educational materials in national languages**

In their study of what determines ‘effective’ schools, Heneveld and Craig (1996) list an appropriate language of instruction as an important factor determining pupil achievement in developing countries, but there have been few studies that use a cost-effectiveness framework to compare pupils taught in different languages.

Many educationalists believe that teaching children in their mother tongue is more effective than teaching in a foreign or ‘imposed’ language, particularly in the early years in primary education, and there is research evidence to support this belief, although the results of different studies are surprisingly mixed. There has been extensive research on the effects of language of instruction on learning outcomes, but very little of this research uses a cost-effectiveness framework.
One recent study that did attempt to apply cost-effectiveness analysis to evaluate provision of bilingual education was carried out for the World Bank in Guatemala [Patrinos and Velez, 1995]. Like the cost-effectiveness study conducted in Brazil by Harbison and Hanushek, this measured benefits in terms of reductions in repetition and drop-out rates among primary school pupils taught in bilingual programmes in Guatemala, under the National Bilingual Education Programme [Programa Nacional de Educacion Bilingue, or PRONEBI], and concluded:

Significant efficiency gains from bilingual education can be estimated by using the differential repetition and drop-out rates registered for the bilingual and control student groups and the differential unit cost data. While bilingual education is more expensive than traditional, Spanish-only schooling, learning outcomes are greater. Greater learning outcomes are reflected in lower repetition rates. Lower repetition rates, in turn, reduce the cost of supplying schooling. Thus bilingual education is justified when raising learning outcomes and improving efficiency more than offset the cost differential involved in bilingual education.... Bilingual education in Guatemala is an efficient public investment. This is confirmed by a crude cost-benefit exercise. A shift to bilingual education in Guatemala would result in considerable cost savings as a result of reduced repetition.... The cost savings due to bilingual education, even allowing for its higher cost, is estimated at over...US$5.6 million in a year. A reduction in drop-out and its effect on personal earnings is estimated as an increase in individual yearly earnings of an average of... US$33.8. As a conclusion the PRONEBI program is a good educational investment in Guatemala.

Patrinos and Velez, 1995: 2

There has been no similar cost-effectiveness study of bilingual or mother-tongue teaching in Africa, although there have been a few evaluations of education in local or national languages in particular countries including Nigeria [Akinasso, 1993], Mali [Ministre de l'Education de Base du Mali, 1996] and Kenya [Cleghorn, Merrit and Abagi, 1989]. These studies and other research on language acquisition and learning outcomes were recently reviewed in a report produced for the ADEA by the Working Group on Educational Research and Policy Analysis [WGER&PA 1996]. The report summarized results of research on languages of instruction and the implications for education in Africa, together with an overview of experience in six African countries, [presented in case studies of Botswana, Kenya, Mali, Nigeria, South Africa and Tanzania]. The review concluded:

With regard to pedagogical effectiveness, research shows that language of learning [LOL] policies which favour mother tongues in the early years of basic education result in improved and faster
acquisition of knowledge by pupils. Furthermore mother tongue
LOL instruction is effective in promoting the acquisition of second
language competencies.

WGER&PA, 1996: ii

The study notes, however, that without careful planning problems
of implementation may weaken the effectiveness of language-of-
learning policies and mother-tongue teaching. Two important
factors that are often overlooked are the need for clarity of objec-
tives in any policy statement, and the need to take account of atti-
tudes towards language on the part of those who will be affected by
the policy decision (for example teachers, parents and employers).
The report also notes that ‘the most commonly identified tech-
nical problems that arise as a result of inadequate language plan-
ning include... poor quality and irrelevance of textbooks and
outdated teaching methodology.’ It adds:

Recent research indicates that the long term benefits of producing
learning materials in mother tongue LOL outweigh their high initial
publishing costs. Both the progress in computer technology and its
easy accessibility have made it possible to considerably reduce the
heavy cost of offset printing. The emergence of desktop publishing,
for instance, is resulting in the growth of national publishing indus-
tries that will ultimately reduce the dependency of African coun-
tries on foreign publishers.

WGER&PA, 1996: ii

In the light of these conclusions the Working Group makes the
following recommendations for policies determining the language
of learning in Africa:

An increasing number of African researchers across the continent
are joining voices to draw the attention of policy-makers to the posi-
tive political, economic and, more importantly educational benefits
that could be derived from moving toward LOL policies that take
into account the above research findings. By and large, they recom-
end that African countries move toward implementing bilingual
or multilingual language-of-learning policies whereby mother
tongues and the Languages of Wider Communication (English,
French, Spanish, Portuguese) are used in a systematic manner, so as
to suit both the educational needs and political realities of African
countries.

Also, researchers are calling for more empirical studies to be
carried out in order to provide reliable guidance for policy-makers,
especially in those countries where experiences have not been
empirically documented.

WGER&PA, 1996: iii

These conclusions and recommendations underline the need to
look at the question of language of instruction, and particularly the
availability and provision of educational materials in national
languages, in a cost-effectiveness framework. Unfortunately, despite the assertion that recent research indicates that the long-term benefits of producing learning materials in mother tongue language-of-learning outweigh their high initial publishing costs, there is very little systematic research that attempts to quantify both costs and benefits of publishing educational materials in African national and local languages. The case studies presented in this volume are therefore very much a pioneering effort, and attempt to carry out empirical documentation of costs and benefits in five countries.

**Problems encountered in the case studies**

All the authors experienced problems in conducting the case studies. The most serious was the difficulty of obtaining detailed data on either costs or benefits. The decision was taken during the first workshop that no attempt would be made to apply cost-benefit or rate-of-return analysis to the publication of educational materials in national languages. Although the case studies speak of the ‘benefits’ of mother-tongue teaching and of producing and using materials in national languages, there was no attempt to measure these benefits in monetary terms. The comparison of costs and outcomes therefore represents an attempt to apply cost-effectiveness, rather than cost-benefit, analysis.

Even with this more limited objective, there were formidable problems. On the cost side there was very little ‘hard’ data, and many publishers were unwilling to provide what was seen as commercially sensitive information. It was particularly difficult to get estimates of ‘hidden’ costs, such as the time of staff in government departments or agencies, who are often heavily involved in curriculum development and the design of educational materials, but do not receive specific payment for this work, as it is considered part of their normal duties. In theory it would be possible to cost this input of professional time, on the basis of normal civil service salary scales, but none of the case studies attempted to do this. There were other examples of hidden costs, such as support from international donors and funding agencies. However some of the case studies, for example, Dr Lai Seng’s study of Madagascar and Pierre Coly’s study of Senegal, were able to obtain examples or illustrations of cost data from specific publishers or non-government agencies.

On the benefit side there was an almost complete lack of quantitative measures of the effectiveness of materials in national languages, such as comparisons of test scores or wastage rates among pupils taught in national languages as opposed to English or
French. As already mentioned, neither time nor funding permitted the collection of data specifically for these case studies. Thus it was not possible to calculate cost-effectiveness ratios, as Harbison and Hanushek did for Brazil. Because of the lack of ‘hard’ data on benefits or effectiveness it was agreed that the case studies would present information on perceived benefits, rather than measured benefits.

Another problem encountered by some of the authors was that language policy is regarded as politically sensitive, so that officials or teachers were not always willing to discuss their experiences frankly, particularly where, as in Zambia, what actually happens in schools does not always conform with official policy declarations, or where, as in Madagascar, there has recently been a change of official policy on the language of instruction.

Policy issues

The five countries represented in these case studies are extremely diverse, in terms of history, size, ethnic and linguistic distribution within the population, and economic conditions. For example, whereas Zambia achieved independence in 1964, Namibia became independent only in 1990; in Zambia there are 72 different languages or dialects spoken, while there are 50 in Namibia and 28 in Senegal, but in Madagascar there is only one indigenous national language, Malagasy. The World Bank estimates of GNP per capita in 1994 ranged from US$200 in Madagascar, US$230 in The Gambia and US$250 in Zambia, to US$600 in Senegal and US$1970 in Namibia, although the latter figure disguises very wide variations between white and black, rural and urban populations. There are, therefore, considerable differences in the language policies adopted in these five countries, and in the way these have been implemented.

The first policy issue highlighted in the case studies is the government’s choice of language or languages as the country’s official language, and to be used as the medium of instruction in schools. All the case studies discuss this issue in some detail, At the time of independence all the governments faced the problem of determining a policy on the national language (or languages) to be used for official purposes, for general communication and for education. Several of the case studies explain the factors or criteria their governments used to determine that choice.

In Zambia and Namibia, where many local languages were spoken, the problem was particularly severe. In 1964, the government of Zambia decided that none of the languages, including the seven main national languages spoken in the country, commanded
sufficient support to be chosen as the national language for the country as a whole, they therefore opted for English as the official means of communication, and as the medium of instruction in schools. Politicians in Namibia, however, had already begun to develop a language policy for the country before independence, and determined that while English should be the official language, the nine main national languages would be used as languages of instruction in primary schools.

On the other hand, Madagascar’s constitution defines Malagasy as the national language, but French is used as the language of administration and the country has recently seen a fundamental shift of government policy on the question of whether the language of instruction in schools should be Malagasy or French.

All the case studies describe how the official language policy of their countries has evolved, and the factors that influenced the selection of the national language(s).

The differences between countries illustrate another fundamental issue, namely how many languages it is feasible to designate as ‘national’ languages. Although the number of languages spoken in several of the countries is large, all of these governments have identified a smaller group of ‘main’ languages, spoken by substantial proportions of the population, which will be used as the country’s principal national languages. The number of languages identified as the main national languages varies from nine in Namibia, seven in Zambia and six in Senegal – although in practice in Senegal only four of the six main national languages are actually used in education – to three in The Gambia. The latter, although it has a smaller total number of languages than any of these countries, has still chosen to concentrate on the main languages spoken by the largest groups in the country, and selected three languages to be used alongside English in schools.

The case studies all show how their country’s language and education policies have evolved over time, and continue to evolve, in response to changing circumstances and political decisions. Only in Madagascar has there been a fundamental change of policy, when a change of government led to the decision to revert to the use of French as the medium of instruction in schools. In the other four countries change has been more gradual. Laurentius Davids records how the Namibian government has encouraged the use of national and local languages in primary schools from the time of independence, and is introducing national languages gradually, with a planned timetable. Other countries, including The Gambia and Senegal, initially adopted English or French as the language of instruction in all schools, and only after some years have shifted to a policy of allowing national languages to be used in the early years of primary schooling. Pierre Coly believes that in Senegal colonial
and post-colonial traditions have failed to exploit the country's linguistic diversity. In The Gambia there is a National Languages Project, designed to develop a new curriculum and materials for schools, using the three main national languages, and in Senegal a number of experimental schools or classes have been established which use one of the main national languages. In Zambia, on the other hand, English was officially the language of instruction in all schools for many years, although Shadreck Hakalima explains how actual practice in schools was often quite different from the official policy, largely for practical reasons. The government has recently changed the language policy for schools, in response to this divergence between policy and practice.

Such divergence between the official policy of a country and what actually happens in schools is often quite common. Dr Lai Seng notes that in Madagascar 'teachers have not always followed official instructions.' Since the change of government policy teachers may adopt techniques such as explanations in Malagasy, summaries in French, or other methods in the light of their own language skills or as circumstances dictate. Shadreck Hakalima explains that in Zambia, during the time when English was the official medium of instruction in schools, teachers often resorted to local languages because they realized that pupils did not understand them when they taught in English. Now, however, when the policy allows use of local languages, teachers may not know the language of the area where a school is situated, or may be willing to teach in a local language but lack suitable materials. There may be difficulties in identifying what actually happens in schools, however, given the lack of surveys or other hard evidence in most of the countries. Inspectors' reports may be misleading, since both teachers and pupils may be constrained by the presence of school inspectors.

Other policy issues surrounding the choice of languages to be used in education are raised in the case studies. In several countries the languages used in non-formal education, particularly in adult literacy campaigns, may differ from the language used in schools, since the target population and the objectives are different. This may raise problems, however, since educational materials published for formal education cannot be used for non-formal, and vice versa.

Another important issue raised in several of the country studies is the ability of teachers to teach in different national or local languages, and the importance of the languages used and taught in teacher training. Shadreck Hakalima's description of the training of teachers in Zambia shows the severity of the problem. Teacher training is conducted entirely in English, including the principles of linguistics and how to teach reading and writing in local languages. Although students have the opportunity to learn a local
Zambian language as a subject in the teacher training colleges, this may not be the language of the area to which they are subsequently posted, and they are expected to acquire this language on their own. The situation is further complicated by the fact that there may be two or three different languages spoken in a district. Under the new policy of teaching in the language used in the local area, teachers have the responsibility of choosing the most appropriate language for their classes. This is likely to cause considerable problems where there are several different languages in use in a region, and where children may come from a wide area.

Publication of books and other materials in national and local languages is often the responsibility of commercial publishers or non-government organizations, rather than government agencies, although again the situation varies in different countries. In The Gambia the Ministry of Education’s Curriculum Research and Professional Development Division is responsible for the development of instructional materials, and these are produced by another government agency, the Book Production and Materials Resources Unit; so far this Unit has produced materials in the three main national languages, as well as English. But Abdoulie Jobe notes that the government of The Gambia has not yet developed a specific policy on publishing in national languages. Similarly in Senegal, Pierre Coly points out that there is no government policy on publishing in national languages, but whereas in The Gambia government agencies have both developed and produced materials for schools in national languages, in Senegal production of materials in national languages has been entirely the work of non-governmental organizations.

Even when publishing in national languages is entirely in the hands of non-government agencies or commercial publishers, the government plays a crucial role in terms of curriculum development, it often has the ultimate authority to approve or withhold approval for the use of textbooks in schools, as well as determining both financing policies and the resources available for the purchase of books. Thus government policies determine what publishers regard as commercially viable. In Namibia the government’s policy is to involve the private sector as much as possible in both the production and distribution of materials in national languages, but Davids notes that ‘the publishing market is driven by demand from the government.’ He quotes the Association of Namibian Publishers, which has called for a close partnership between government and commercial publishers, in developing strategies to encourage publication in national languages.

In the past publishing was a government monopoly in many countries, which meant that the costs of publishing educational materials were often distorted by hidden subsidies. Data on costs
were either unavailable, or appeared artificially low because of undeclared subsidies for paper or other raw materials, staff salaries, or production and distribution costs. Increasingly governments are trying to encourage the development of a free market in publication and distribution of educational materials, and are reducing or eliminating subsidies, and introducing cost sharing as a result of economic and fiscal constraints. These policy changes have wide-ranging implications both for the costs of publishing and for the demand for educational materials. Several case studies consider the role of subsidies, when they describe or propose strategies for minimizing costs or promoting publishing in national languages. For example Pierre Coly suggests a range of subsidies that could be introduced by the government in Senegal to help publishers of materials in national languages, and Davids quotes the Association of Namibian Publishers which suggests that one way forward would be for government and publishers to agree what educational materials are needed, which national languages represent commercially viable markets for private sector publishers, and which require government subsidies or even publication by government agencies, on the grounds of their small size. However such proposals need to be evaluated in the light of general government economic, as well as educational, policies.

Cost issues

All the case studies emphasize the lack of hard data on costs of publishing materials in national languages, and previous sections have explained why there was no scope for special surveys to collect cost data. Nevertheless, some useful information is provided on costs, often on the basis of illustrations provided by a few publishers or non-governmental organizations, as in the case studies for Madagascar, Namibia and Senegal. One of the crucial issues raised in many of the case studies is the importance of economies of scale. An example is provided by a publisher in Namibia, which is publishing materials in 12 languages; the pre-production costs for a teacher’s guide are the same (N$8,000) in all these languages, but in the case of Oshindonga there is a demand for 850 books, resulting in a unit cost of N$26, but only five copies of the book are needed in Setswana, resulting in a unit cost of N$1,600. There are other vivid examples of the effects of economies of scale, which is a crucial factor determining the cost of publishing in some national languages, if there are only small numbers of speakers. However it was emphasized in the Workshop discussions that although economies of scale might suggest that publishers should aim for a large print run to minimize unit costs,
the realities of storage and distribution of books in many African countries makes this impractical or unwise.

There is very little detailed information on unit costs, however, and the case studies note that where figures are available, they often vary widely, owing to differences in quality of books or other factors. Changing technologies, for example the introduction of desktop publishing, is already having a profound effect on costs of publishing in some countries, including changing the relationship between number of copies produced and unit costs.

Wider availability of such innovations may help to reduce costs of publishing in national languages in the future, but other factors such as reductions in subsidies, noted above, may increase them.

Although some governments are trying to reduce subsidies, because of the need to cut overall government spending, there are still substantial hidden subsidies, that make it very difficult to estimate the real costs of publishing educational materials. Many of the case studies note that the costs of developing textbooks are not reflected in the estimates of the cost of producing materials in national languages, since the time of curriculum development experts, advisers and teachers involved in the development, writing or translation and evaluation of textbooks is not costed – for such personnel are usually government servants, paid from government funds. So in The Gambia, for example, the languages panels responsible for the development of materials in national languages are mostly public employees, and in Zambia the Curriculum Development Centre, which has responsibility for preparing materials for schools, including those in local languages, is fully government funded.

In some cases data were available only on the price of books, sold in the market, rather than costs, but the two concepts are quite different, as several case studies demonstrate. The examples given for Madagascar show that the sale price of books produced and sold by a German adult education agency are the same, regardless of actual costs, but the unit cost of two books, both sold at a price of 2,000 Malagasy francs, ranges from 1,774 to 9,000 francs. Similarly in Namibia, the price of books sold by one publisher is the same, regardless of language, although as explained above, the actual unit costs vary widely because of economies of scale and other factors. This represents a vivid example of ‘cross-subsidization’ by the publisher, meaning that purchasers of books in a language spoken by large numbers are, in effect, subsidizing speakers of minority languages. This may be a necessary strategy in a period when language and publishing policy in Namibia is still in transition, but it does raise the question whether it will be sustainable in the long run.

Books were provided free in the past in many countries, but
financial constraints mean that increasingly governments in many African countries are now introducing cost-sharing in order to reduce the strain on dwindling government budgets. The Zambian government hopes to move towards a situation where school books are published commercially, and sold at market prices, but Shadreck Hakalima stresses that although this change of government policy has begun to influence publishers, so far change has been slow, and a commercial book industry has not yet developed in Zambia. In The Gambia a book rental scheme has been introduced, as a form of cost sharing, but this also is a new development, and so far it applies only to textbooks in English, although it is intended to extend the scheme to books in national languages in the future.

Financing policies, therefore, are crucial both for the magnitude of costs [i.e. what cost elements are included in estimates of the cost of producing educational materials] and also for how costs are shared between government, non-government agencies, schools and the end users of books [i.e. pupils in schools, adult participants in literacy programmes etc.]. Several case studies note that the shift towards wider cost sharing raises important questions of equity and affordability for poor families, or speakers of minority languages, but such issues could not be fully explored in these studies.

**Issues of benefits and effectiveness**

There are no hard data on benefits or effectiveness of educational materials in national languages in any of the countries. As explained above, it was not possible to collect data on pupil achievement or repetition or drop-out rates, and since such data did not exist already, it was impossible to quantify the benefits of using materials in local or national languages.

The National Language Project in The Gambia, which will provide educational materials in three national languages, is an experimental three-year project which will involve evaluation of outcomes, including assessment of pupil performance in selected schools using national languages in Grades 1–3, compared with a study of the performance of pupils in selected control schools. This will provide valuable data that can be used both to assess the benefits of using national languages in primary schools in The Gambia, and to measure the cost-effectiveness of the teaching materials developed for the pilot stage. Since the pilot project is just beginning, however, no results are yet available.

Despite the lack of hard data, many examples were given of *perceived* rather than measured benefits. These include:

- educational benefits (e.g. improved pupil learning, reduced drop-out or repetition)
• social benefits (e.g. better dissemination of information about health, HIV/AIDS etc.)
• cultural benefits (e.g. fostering pride in national cultural identity, increasing awareness of African oral traditions).

In The Gambia, for example, although no measurable results are yet available from the pilot project or from the use of national languages in adult literacy classes, Abdouli Jobe suggests eight types of benefit that have been observed (though not measured) from improved levels of literacy in national languages. These benefits relate to employment, public affairs, transmission of essential information, religion and culture.

The case studies give several examples of perceived educational benefits of using national languages in schools, such as improved understanding by pupils, particularly in the first years of primary schools. However, these are not always translated into measurable improvements in performance. For example the case study of Madagascar reports that when Malagasy was used as the main medium of instruction in primary and junior secondary schools, as well as in adult literacy classes, between 1976 and 1989, there was a better understanding of what was taught, on the part of pupils; the practice made young people feel more adequate and gave pupils the freedom to express themselves; it strengthened Malagasy cultural identity, and the increase in the number of Malagasy readers encouraged the growth of writing in that language. Dr Lai Seng believes that ‘the population’s political maturity and level of technical knowledge increased, thanks to closer and more diverse links with the written word.’ However, he also records high rates of repetition and drop-out in primary schools. His analysis makes clear that the decision to use the national language as the medium of instruction in Madagascar did not automatically lead to improvements in performance. However, he stresses that this may have been due to failures of implementation, including a shortage of textbooks, inadequate training of teachers and other problems.

This serves as a necessary reminder that it is not always easy to distinguish between the perceived benefits of using national languages in education, and the effectiveness of providing educational materials in these languages. Several of the case studies do seem to switch imperceptibly between discussion of the benefits of using national languages in education, and discussion of the effectiveness of educational materials. Many of the case studies provide eloquent testimony of the importance of reading materials for teaching and sustaining literacy skills, whether at school level or in adult literacy campaigns, but however heartfelt the pleas for more and better reading materials, those responsible for allocating government or school budgets are unlikely to respond with extra
resources without convincing evidence that this will be cost-effective. Unfortunately the kind of evidence produced by Harbison and Hanushek for Brazil is not yet available in Africa.

Some of the case studies suggest that there may be perceived problems, as well as benefits, when countries change their policy on the language of instruction in schools or promote the use of national languages in education. For example, Dr Lai Seng observes that during the period of ‘Malagachization’ in Madagascar, parents were often unconvinced of the benefits, or even hostile. As he puts it: ‘The parents said they saw no point in sending their children to school to learn Malagasy when they already knew it.’ Perceived problems mentioned in other case studies include a lack of job opportunities that use local languages, shortage of teachers that are familiar with different languages, as well as shortages of reading materials in many national or local languages. These problems are all seen as potentially reducing the possible benefits or effectiveness of using local languages in schools.

**Possible strategies to minimize costs of publication in local languages**

Several examples are given of strategies that have been, or could be used by governments to reduce costs of publication or use of books in local and regional languages. Strategies already in place in some countries include donor funding of materials in national languages, as in Madagascar and Zambia, import tax or duty concessions to reduce the cost of imported materials, which are already in place in Zambia, and are proposed for Senegal by Pierre Coly, together with other tax concessions and subsidies for non-governmental organizations and agencies involved in producing materials in national languages. Another strategy already in place in several countries, including The Gambia and Zambia, is for governments to subsidize the costs of development and preparation of books and materials, by paying the salaries of staff engaged in curriculum development, authorship or translation.

Other proposals are made in several case studies for government assistance to help the development of a book industry. In Senegal, for example, Pierre Coly argues for a strengthening of educational resource centres, which already exist in the country but are not yet effective. He also advocates selective subsidies for raw materials and publishing equipment for educational publishers, tax concessions and other subsidies. He also proposes various ways of encouraging authors to develop new materials in national languages. A recognized system of commissioning authors to write or translate educational materials, with adequate fees or royalties, backed up
by a legally enforceable system of author's copyright, would provide encouragement for teachers, writers and other professionals to become involved in the design and development of educational materials. Coly suggests that in Senegal this should take place under the auspices of the already established Union of Senegalese Writers in National Languages (USLAN). In other countries, where such an organization does not yet exist, other mechanisms may be needed to encourage the authorship and development of new materials. In Namibia the Association of Namibian Publishers has made various proposals for greater cooperation between government and commercial publishers.

The fact that some languages are spoken in several different countries suggests that there is scope for regional and cross-national cooperation between countries that share local or regional languages, such as Senegal and The Gambia, Mali and Guinea, or Namibia and Angola. There are already a few isolated examples of such coordinated efforts, but participants at the workshops argued for greater cooperation across national boundaries. This would increase demand and thus reduce the costs of providing materials in some regional languages, such as Wolof, which is common to both The Gambia and Senegal, as well as other countries in West Africa. A strong case was also made for regional cooperation between Namibia, South Africa, and other neighbouring countries, in order to foster the development and production of books in local and national languages common to more than one country in Southern Africa.

**Conclusions**

These case studies are seen as very much a first attempt, but one which should be continued in the future to encompass more detailed studies in the five countries concerned, and extended to cover other countries in Africa, in order to increase understanding of the concepts of cost-effectiveness and to apply them to a range of policy issues where previously they have been neglected. Although there are still many gaps in information, and further refinements are needed to develop fully comparable estimates of costs and effectiveness, the case studies are seen as a valuable first step towards greater understanding of issues and sharing of experience.

The work done for these studies has raised a number of important issues. For example, the case studies draw attention to the need to distinguish: a) between official policy statements on language policy and what actually happens in schools; and b) between the costs of book production and the selling price of these
books. They underline the need to collect better data in order to plan and monitor the introduction of new policies on language of instruction and provision of materials in national languages. Systematic surveys may be needed to collect data, not only on costs and educational outcomes, but also on the languages spoken by pupils and teachers in different types and levels of education, and different regions, and on the availability and use of educational materials in different languages.

More work is needed to collect accurate estimates of costs of book development, preparation, production and distribution, and to estimate the hidden costs and subsidies of publishing educational materials. Similarly, more work is needed to translate the perceived benefits, described in several of these case studies, into measurable benefits, such as improved standards of literacy and learning, and lower rates of repetition and drop-out. The relative cost-effectiveness of different kinds of materials, different production technologies, and different ways of training and encouraging teachers to use materials in national languages, also need to be explored.

Several case studies underline the importance of the whole question of the training of teachers to teach effectively in local and national languages. This is clearly a vital issue in any country planning to introduce a change of the language of instruction in schools. Another issue that requires further research is the optimum length of time for pupils to learn in their mother tongue, or in a local or national language, and the optimum time at which to introduce bilingual or multilingual teaching. There are considerable differences between countries. Some believe that two or three years of mother-tongue teaching are sufficient, while other countries provide for more years of teaching in national languages.

These case studies demonstrate the importance of inter-relationships and linkages between government policies on language and educational policies, including policies on school progression, curriculum, financing and teacher training. Such government policies also affect publishers’ willingness to develop and publish books and materials in local languages, which in turn determines the accessibility of reading materials which can significantly enhance or impede the ability of new literates to maintain their literacy skills.

Finally, although the case studies are only a first step, they all share a conviction, and indeed demonstrate the relevance of the concepts of cost-benefit and cost-effectiveness analysis, to the question of whether, and how, countries should promote the production, provision and use of educational materials in national and local languages. There is now strong evidence, both from Africa and from other developing countries, that textbooks and
other educational materials are not only an important resource for schools and for non-formal education, but that increasing the supply and use of such materials can be one of the most cost-effective investments of public resources. These case studies show that the question of the language of these materials, which is increasingly recognized as an important educational, as well as cultural and political issue, must also be addressed in a cost-effectiveness framework. It is hoped that these case studies will serve to stimulate and encourage other research in this field, as well as to disseminate the results of these pioneering efforts to apply cost-effectiveness analysis to the provision of educational materials in national languages.

References


Fuller, Bruce (1986), Raising School Quality in Developing Countries: What Investments Boost Learning? World Bank Discussion Papers, No. 2.


The social, economic and educational context

The 1993 census of the population of The Gambia records that in that year the country had a population of 1.03 million, with an annual growth rate of 4.2 percent. A little over 60 percent of the population is within the age range of 0–24 and 42.5 percent within the range of 0–14. The population projection for 1995 was 1.13 million. This shows a significant acceleration in the rate of population growth.

The country is situated on the west coast of Africa and has an area of 10.689 sq. km. The latest World Bank estimates of national income give a figure for Gross National Product (GNP) per capita in 1994 of US$ 330.

Central Statistics Office figures give the following estimates for the percentage literacy rate:

- National average 41%
- Male 55%
- Female 27%

School enrolment

The annual education statistics published by the Planning Unit of the Ministry of Education show that in 1994/5 the total enrolment of primary school was 113,419, which was 7.5 percent higher than in 1993/4. In 1993/4 and 1992/3 the enrolment growth rates were 8.4 percent and 7.3 percent respectively. Female enrolment in primary schools increased from 41 percent in 1992/3 to 42.1 percent in 1993/4, and to 42.6 percent in 1994/5.

The total enrolment in junior secondary schools (formerly called middle schools) totalled 21,050 in 1994/5, an increase of 17.6 percent over the previous year's enrolment. The rate of growth in enrolment during 1993/4 and 1992/3 was 4.2 percent and 18.7 percent respectively. Female enrolment in junior secondary
schools in 1992/3, 1993/4 and 1994/5 remained fairly constant at 38.0, 37.3 and 37.8 percent respectively. The total enrolment in 1994/5 in senior secondary schools (formerly known as high schools) was 10,517, which was 14.1 percent more than in 1993/4. The rate of growth in enrolment in 1993/4 and 1992/3 was 5.3 percent and 19.6 percent respectively.

The Education For All mid-decade review examined all sectors of the education system and revealed several important issues relating to quality, relevance and accessibility of the education system. The review showed that The Gambia has a high illiteracy rate, and that illiteracy is more prevalent in rural than in urban areas. It has been established that there is a correlation between illiteracy and poverty. Hence strong emphasis is placed on the eradication of illiteracy to alleviate poverty.

Insufficient instructional materials, a high percentage of unqualified teachers and the need to make the curriculum more relevant make it imperative to give greater consideration to the quality and relevance of the type of basic education being provided.

The future quantitative objectives for enrolment are as follows [Figure 2.1]:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Base Year 1995</th>
<th>Mid-term 2000</th>
<th>Target 2005</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gross enrolment ratio (average)</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gross female enrolment ratio</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illiteracy rate (average)</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female illiteracy rate</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The education structure

The structure of the education system in The Gambia is 6–3–3, namely six years of primary, three years of junior secondary and three years of senior secondary schooling. A nine-year period of basic education is followed by a selective cycle of secondary education. The drop-out rates at primary and junior secondary levels, coupled with the limited places in senior secondary schools, do not allow significant enrolment at the senior secondary level.

After successful completion of twelve years of schooling, students are believed to be adequately prepared for university education or for entry to other tertiary institutions. The emphasis of educational policy is, among other things, to increase access,
relevance and quality of education, and to ensure that it is sustained in a cost-effective way.

**Repeaters and drop-outs**

Children who repeat grades in school are seen as not having the competencies required for promotion to the next grade. This is an indication of inadequate learning outcomes. Failure to achieve satisfactory progression rates through the various grade levels in school may be the result of many factors, including the use of English as a medium of instruction. English is imbued with a culture alien to the learners, and its use as the medium of instruction renders the language(s) which the pupils use at home useless from the point of view of the school. This in turn means that pupils interpret the rejection of their languages as indicating that the school is rejecting them for what they are. Low retention and high drop-out rates can be seen as an indication of shortcomings in the school system.

There has not been any systematic collection of data on school drop-out, but the Planning Unit of the Ministry of Education used an indirect method, based on cohort estimation, in an attempt to analyse the drop-out rate. This is a technique borrowed from demography, which involves distinguishing between students taking the following routes:

- Promotion to the next grade
- Repeating the same grade
- Dropping out of school.

The advantage of using this method is that it allows estimation of national progression rates, but the effect of inter-regional migration of students is nullified, because in the total count these students remain in the system. It also takes no account of pupils who drop out, but later re-register.

Data from 1991/2 to 1994/5 have been analysed. The situation throughout this period is more or less the same, as far as total and female rates of repetition and drop-out are concerned. For total enrolment, the rates are 14 percent and 7 percent for repeaters and drop-outs respectively in both 1993/4 and 1992/3, and 15 percent and 7 percent in 1991/2. Similar trends have been observed for the female enrolment during these years, although there are some anomalies in the case of girls in Grade 4, which require further research and analysis.

The repetition rates are very high at the end of the entry grade (19, 19 and 20 percent respectively for the three years) and also for the exit grade (25, 20 and 21 percent respectively). The reason for high repetition rates at the entry and exit stages can be easily
explained as being due to a) below-school-age admission at the entry stage, and b) lack of sufficient places in Grade 7.

The combined rate of repetition and drop-out is very high. The combined rates were 22, 21 and 21 percent in 1992/3, 1993/4 and 1994/5 respectively. In other words every year more than one in five of all pupils either repeat a grade or drop out of school. Appropriate measures are required to control and reduce the rates of repetition and drop-out, in order to reduce the level of educational wastage and ensure the optimal use of available resources.

**The language situation**

The official language of the country is English. No survey has yet been conducted to ascertain how many children speak different languages in schools. However, the 1993 distribution of the Gambian population by ethnicity shows the following (Figure 2.2):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity / Language</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mandinka/Jakanka</td>
<td>353 840</td>
<td>39.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fula/Tukulor</td>
<td>168 284</td>
<td>18.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wolof</td>
<td>136 546</td>
<td>14.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jola/Karoninka</td>
<td>95 262</td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saralhule</td>
<td>79 690</td>
<td>8.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serere</td>
<td>24 710</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manjago</td>
<td>7 458</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banbarra</td>
<td>6 194</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Gambians</td>
<td>11 023</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnicity not stated</td>
<td>2 578</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Central Statistics Office 1993.*

**Language policy**

Prior to independence, and indeed until 1973, English was used as the medium of instruction in schools and teacher training. In 1973 it was felt that The Gambia had reached a stage in history when the expectations and requirements of society demanded the implementation of educational change. It was felt then that the teaching of languages in the initial stages of the primary schools should be inextricably woven with the culture. This led to the realization of a need for the learning and maintenance of Gambian indigenous languages. The Educational Policy, [chapter 17.6] stated:
The use of local languages in primary schools will be developed. It is recognised that both learning and retention rates are likely to be higher if children are taught in the mother-tongue, supported by appropriate materials. This will include the teaching of English.

Many writers have developed the hypothesis that a child who comes to school with a language of his/her own, and who is then required to learn a second language, is bound to have problems which are different from those of a child who is taught in his/her mother-tongue. Children may fail to learn effectively because:

- they cannot develop their thinking power while at the same time trying to master a target language
- the initial years at school are not used to expand their ideas and self-expression in the language they take to school.

The above policy pronouncement was intended to address these issues by encouraging use of local languages. Unfortunately implementation was vitiated by setbacks due to lack of funds.

The 1988–2003 Education Policy came into being after the first National Conference on Education. One cornerstone of this policy is a dual commitment to a broadly based education for Grades 1–9, including teaching in and of the three main national languages [Mandinka, Wolof, Pulaar], and the radical improvement of the quality of learning in the first nine years of formal schooling. This involves improving the relevance of curricula, as well as improving teaching and learning practices.

In line with these long-term targets the National Languages Project has the objectives of both improving the content of the school curricula, and seeking to identify ways of enhancing both teacher effectiveness and opportunities for pupil learning. At the same time, the project is designed to create institutional capacity, especially within the Curriculum Research and Professional Development Division of the Ministry of Education, to develop and sustain the use of national languages in Gambian schools.

The development objective underlying this policy is reflected in the guiding principles for Gambian education and the aims of school education which are contained in the Education Policy (1988–2003), which states:

Education must be closely related to the actual life and working circumstances of Gambians, to the languages and the social and religious values which underpin the nation’s heritage, and to the economic and social needs and expectations which are associated with life in a cash economy and increasingly technological and interdependent world.

It further states that the work of the school should include the promotion of: ‘... a broad education which will enable the school learner to develop to his or her full potential and thereby
contribute to life in his or her community and the nation at large.’

In furtherance of these underlying principles and aims for school education it is proposed that the curriculum for Grades 1–6 should include national languages (Mandinka, Wolof, and Pulaar), which should be the media of instruction for Grades 1–2 and taught as subjects from Grade 3 onwards. English, which is the official language of the country, should be taught as a subject from Grade 1 and become the medium of instruction from Grade 3.

The policy further states that at the junior secondary level a broad-based curriculum should be developed to provide a logical and related continuation of the work undertaken in Grades 1–6. Provision should be made for national and foreign languages – i.e. Mandinka, Wolof, Pulaar, English and French or Arabic.

According to the Education Policy (1988–2003) non-formal education in The Gambia is governed, among other things, by the following considerations:

- A mass campaign that takes into account the specific needs of the target groups.
- National languages, English and Arabic are the languages of instruction. Other indigenous languages may be used if the resources are available and if it is appropriate to the needs of particular target groups.
- Attention must be given in all functional literacy programmes to the need to sustain literacy. This also applies to literacy for primary school leavers. Cost-effective ways of providing reading materials in rural libraries, resource centres, and through news sheets etc. should be considered.
- Non-formal education programmes should encourage the learning of new skills as a component of functional literacy activities. There should be an expansion of rural skills centres to meet this need.
- All development programmes introduced in The Gambia should have basic education components.

The Education Policy identifies the issues to be given due consideration and addressed accordingly at the formal level as: access, equity and quality. Equal opportunity and access for all is emphasized. The increased access should be matched by high quality education. This, among other things, includes the development of instructional materials for competencies in the areas of literacy, numeracy, life skills and culture.

For those who, for one reason or another, failed in the formal system, opportunities are provided in non-formal education programmes and projects offering literacy and post-literacy training, skills training and income-generating activities, civic education and environmental awareness schemes.
The government of The Gambia is aware of the dire need to change and increase the effectiveness of existing strategies for education, to reform educational administration and to establish measures to deal with the basic necessities of teaching and learning in the most cost-effective way. The major hurdle besetting instruction and learning in our schools is the problem of instructional materials in printed form. This is a crucial issue, which is not seen simply in the context of teaching techniques, but rather within the economic framework of the entire educational process.

Emphasis is currently being placed on instructional materials, since they are considered to form the nucleus of education, in the light of the great number of unqualified teachers in the educational system. It is realized that without these teaching and learning tools, mere knowledge of teaching methods will not suffice for achieving effective teaching and learning, particularly in the first cycle of education. Textbooks form the most basic instructional materials, and the extent of their use varies according to Grade levels, according to their availability and according to whether they are supplied free or are sold, and at what price.

One of the fundamental aims of education is to help children acquire literacy skills. In the absence of the required books and reading materials mere acquisition of these skills would be futile. Avenues must be provided for these skills to be used, and to prevent relapsing into illiteracy. Books can enhance personal fulfilment both in terms of reading for pleasure and the search for information.

In the context of the Gambian situation, where there is desire for mass literacy, links between the home and school and mass transmission of knowledge, access to books in national languages is seen as essential.

The Educational Policy of the government states:
• A general complaint is the shortage of instructional materials.
• It is proposed that expenditure per student be significantly increased in respect of learning materials, the cost of which will be borne by both government and user.
• The procurement and distribution of learning materials will be in the hands of the Services Division of the Ministry of Education and monitored at the school level by the Inspectorate Unit.
Policy on publishing in national languages

Context

The Curriculum Research and Professional Development Division (CRPDD) is, among other things, charged with the responsibility for research and preparation of curriculum materials for the primary, junior and senior secondary levels of education in The Gambia. These responsibilities include the implementation of the government’s policy statements, in terms of curriculum development, drawing up the syllabus and the content for instructional materials.

Panellists work with curriculum specialists in these activities. A matrix of subjects have been chosen for development of teaching and learning materials. These include course books for Mandinka, Wolof and Pulaar languages, Mathematics, Science, Social and Environmental Studies and their accompanying teachers’ handbooks.

Availability of textbooks

No detailed plan has yet been drawn up for textbooks in national languages. However, for many years, as stated earlier, there has been a serious shortage of textbooks, notably at the primary school level. In 1987 the government decided to establish a textbook policy. With the help of the World Bank the first phase of the project was initiated and new books were introduced for Grades 1–9 in the core subject areas of English, Mathematics, Science and Social and Environmental Studies. Subject panels at the Curriculum Research and Professional Development Division (CRPDD) wrote syllabuses and textbooks in the core subjects for Grades 1–9. The books were printed overseas by Macmillan Education, while the teacher’s guides were printed in The Gambia by the Book Production and Material Resources Unit (BPMRU). It is envisaged that eventually all books will be printed by this unit. It is hoped that the publication of textbooks in national languages will also be treated as a matter of urgency, as was the case for those in English.

With the cooperation of UNESCO a contract was signed in 1994 for printing and publication of materials in Mandinka, Wolof and Pulaar. The objectives of this project were:

1. To print and publish 1,650 copies of Grade 1 materials in Mandinka for the following subjects: Language (450 copies), Mathematics (300 copies), Science (300 copies), Social and Environmental Studies (300 copies), and supplementary readers (300 copies).
2 To print and publish in Wolof 1,050 copies of Grade 1 materials for the following subjects; Language (450 copies); Mathematics (300 copies) and supplementary readers (300 copies).

3 To print and publish in Pulaar 1,350 copies of Grade 1 materials for the following subjects; Language (450 copies); Mathematics (300 copies); Science (300 copies); and Social and Environmental Studies (300 copies).

**Project Costs**

The total estimated costs of this project are as follows [Figure 2.3]:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Materials (Paper, cardboard, duplicating ink, staples etc.)</td>
<td>$7,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Printing and publishing</td>
<td>$7,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>$15,000</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The locally written national language instructional materials were published by the Non-formal Education Services Unit and printed by private printers, using off-set litho and duplication facilities. Emphasis was placed on low-cost production, rather than on providing a high-quality product with colour. The availability of photocopiers, word processors and laser printers has enhanced the production of small print-runs at low-cost. Text layout and illustrations have been produced by the national languages panel. It is heartening to record here that Projet d’Appui à la Diffusion et à l’Enseignement du Français en Gambie (PADEF) donated to the CRPDD a word processor and laser printer, at the time of writing this report. With these facilities, together with a photocopier, it is now possible for the CRPDD to operate a small in-house printing operation, instead of contracting the printing of all materials to commercial enterprises.

**Textbook rental scheme**

Since the Ministry of Education does not have the required funds to provide books free of cost, a textbook rental scheme was introduced in 1992/3. The main objectives of the scheme are:

- to increase the number of textbooks for use in schools
- to make sure that the content and scope of the textbooks are in line with the school syllabi
- to ensure a continuous supply of funds to re-stock books by introducing user charges.
Students are required to pay an annual rental fee for use of books. Money collected is kept in a special bank account and is used to replace copies of books that are damaged [about every three years], or to purchase additional copies as student enrolment increases. When the scheme is well established, the intention is to provide enough books for the first and second cycles of education [Grades 1–9].

Figure 2.4 shows how the Textbook Rental Scheme is administered at central, district and school level.

**Figure 2.4** Administration of the Textbook Rental Scheme

1. **Central Level**
   - Permanent Secretary
   - Chief Education Officer
   - Deputy Chief Education Officer (Services)
   - Textbook Administrative Officer

2. **District Level**
   - Principal Education Officer
   - Head-teacher
   - Textbook Fund Administrator

3. **School Level**
   - Textbook Fund Administrator
   - Administrative Assistant
   - Storekeeper
   - Rental Fee Collector

The Textbook Fund Administrator is a teacher selected at the school level and made responsible for the management of the textbooks and rental fees. He/she is in charge of:

- collecting rental fees from learners
- distributing books to learners at the school
- issuing textbook ledgers to class teachers and ensuring their proper handling
- ascertaining that books are properly taken care of
- collecting books at the end of each academic year, storing them, and returning the Textbook Inventory Recording Form.

The collection of rental fees is the responsibility of the Textbook Fund Administrator. This requires handling large sums of money, issuing receipts and keeping records and accounts. Students are encouraged to pay rental fees, within the following guidelines:

- There should be no punishment to learners, other than denying them the use of books, should they fail to pay their fees.
Learners should pay according to the rates shown in Figure 2.5.

It should be noted that if a school has both morning and afternoon shifts, then learners should be charged the sharing rate. Likewise if two learners are sharing books in the morning shift, then each learner should be charged one quarter of the full rental rate. Learners pay for textbooks which are lost or damaged. The cost of damaged books is set at one quarter of the full value of the book.

At present these charges apply only to books in English. When the National Languages Pilot Project becomes active (due in September 1996), the rental scheme will apply for the first grades (1–3) during the initial three years of the project, but the scale of charges is still to be determined.

Once the rental scheme is fully operational, it is proposed that expenditure per student on textbooks should be significantly increased, with the cost of textbooks being shared between the government and users.

**BOOK DISTRIBUTION**

After rental fees have been collected from pupils, books are distributed to schools and the teachers in turn issue them to learners. Distribution is spread over a short period of time and the government provides trucks for this exercise. Textbooks in national languages are to be distributed in the same manner, and under the same scheme as English language textbooks, when the national languages project is launched.

**Strategies for minimizing costs**

It is generally assumed that where the required textbooks are made available they may have a direct influence on the quality of teaching and will also help motivate teachers in the national languages pilot project. In the light of the above assumption, the government plans to increase the proportion of recurrent expenditure devoted to: a) stationery, teaching aids and supplies; b) curriculum reform workshop/seminars.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grades</th>
<th>Learners Sharing</th>
<th>Learners using own set of books</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grades 1–4</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>20.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grades 5–6</td>
<td>15.00</td>
<td>30.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grades 7–9</td>
<td>75.00</td>
<td>150.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Books written elsewhere in the sub-region are comparatively easy to translate and/or to adapt to meet Gambia’s specific needs, since many of the neighbouring countries share similar cultures. It is important to note that Gambians can read Senegalese publications and Senegalese too can read Gambian publications in Wolof, Mandinka and Pulaar.

The Book Production and Material Resources Unit (BPMRU) of the Ministry of Education is government owned and financed. The Unit already has experience of publishing trial texts for use in schools. The happy result is that this institution can boast of publishing good quality books for use in our schools under difficult circumstances. For example, where typewriters do not have the necessary symbols, a lot of the writing was done by hand. The BPMRU should be given the necessary equipment for typesetting, for example typewriters with the required characters for writing the national languages. They can then be in a position to print large quantities of materials.

**Cost of publishing**

The CRPDD is mainly responsible for designing instructional materials in national languages, but the private sector does prepare some materials, ranging from school primers to functional literacy materials. These materials are mostly in the form of inexpensive printed and mimeographed materials. The CRPDD makes sure that all textbooks for use in school are systematically checked, to ensure that they are compatible with the approved syllabuses, and that the language level, illustrations and teaching/learning activities are appropriate for the children.

Attempts are continually being made to bring about close collaboration between curriculum specialists and private producers of instructional materials in national languages. Some non-governmental organizations are generous enough to offer the Curriculum Research and Professional Development Division permission to print textbooks, since it is a non-profit-making venture. There may be adjustments and adaptations to this policy in the future.

Textbook production in the Curriculum Research and Professional Development Division is normally financed under the specific budgetary allocation provided as part of the annual government budget process, based on estimates of departmental recurrent revenue and expenditure. The budget allocations, unfortunately, have always been inadequate. The allocation is intended to cover all subject areas, and it is not sufficient to meet the demand for textbook preparation in the national languages.
As indicated earlier, discussions are under way to use textbooks from other sources, alongside those written by CRPDD when the project becomes fully active. Such networking may reduce the pressure on government funding for writing instructional materials.

**Authorship**

The national languages panel, comprising CRPDD staff, teachers and other people from the private sector, have the following functions:

- To design and produce teaching/learning materials in Wolof, Mandinka and Pulaar, using indigenous resources and translation from English.
- To work together in the planning and preparation of curriculum materials.
- To edit and illustrate instructional materials.

The panellists serve as writers, and honoraria are usually paid for their services. However, it is heartening to note that these people are dedicated to the development, promotion and implementation of the national languages, so that they are willing to devote time to the designing and production of instructional materials, even if it is without additional remuneration, except for the basic lunch provided for the panel members.

Budgetary restrictions are causing a reduction in government expenditure per pupil, particularly for non-salary items. The government’s major concern is the payment of salaries to CRPDD staff, and to provide office space, furniture and secretarial services.

**A breakdown of costs**

In general the breakdown of costs of publishing instructional materials in national languages is as follows:

1. **Pre-press**
   - typesetting
   - production of camera ready copy
   \[ D82.00 \text{ per book} \]

2. **Raw materials**
   - off-set and duplicating paper
   - cardboard
   - coloured duplicating paper
   - electronic stencils
   - ink
   \[ \begin{align*}
   & \text{D65.00 per ream} \\
   & \text{D250.00 per ream} \\
   & \text{D105.00 per ream} \\
   & \text{D50.00 each} \\
   & \text{D53.00 per tube}
   \end{align*} \]

3. **Printing**
   - printing (duplicating)
   - binding (stapling)
   \[ \begin{align*}
   & \text{D0.50 per run} \\
   & \text{D0.05 per page}
   \end{align*} \]
4. **Administrative Overheads**

Some private publishing enterprises incur cost on rent, transportation, telephone and utilities. No detailed information is available.

5. **Hidden Costs**

There are in some cases other resources in the form of donations in kind or in cash. No details are available.

6. **Unit Costs**

On the basis of the elements and costs listed above, the unit cost of publishing and printing books and educational materials can be estimated. The average unit cost of a locally produced book in Mandinka, published by a non-profit-making mission, is estimated to be D11.50 for an A5 book of 68 pages. An English equivalent would cost D29.00. An English primer imported from overseas normally costs D40.00.

One reason for the cost difference is that there are likely to be hidden costs for the book produced by a non-profit missionary organization. Nearly all non-governmental organizations are interested simply in trying to cover production costs, rather than covering their full overhead costs. It is realized that if all the costs of materials, labour and overheads are taken into account, most books are sold at a price that only covers material cost. Some NGOs ask learners to pay D5.00 for national language primers, but even this price presents difficulties for many learners. Generally the percentage of the total cost covered by the market price is only 20 percent.

Prices can be kept low if all agencies collaborate and use the same primer sets. The justification for such a policy would be that all non-governmental organizations share similar aims, namely to help eradicate illiteracy in order to build up the people as a basis for further development, to provide reading materials on health, development and civic topics and culture and religion; and help to preserve the Gambian heritage. It would also avoid unnecessary duplication of work. Another strategy for minimizing costs is to use low-cost duplicating, since this will be cheaper than printing, even though printing will provide a higher quality product.

**Benefits and effectiveness**

The national languages project may be described as an experimental research and development project, which includes research to identify the most effective basis for developing materials and for training teachers how to use them. The suitability of the materials and the adequacy of the teachers’ skills will be tested on a pilot
scale over a three-year period in Grades 1–3 of the selected schools. As a means of assessing the impact of the use of the national languages on pupil achievement and teacher effectiveness, there will be a parallel study of control classes in nine selected schools. The three-year duration of the experimentation and development phase (including staff development) will make possible an on-going investigation, trial, evaluation and revision of the pilot materials and their content, together with an evaluation of the methodology for training teachers to use these pilot materials.

There has never been any previous project, since the country became independent, that has sought to develop national languages or to encourage their use in schools. Therefore, the research and pilot aspects of the project are of crucial importance. In the absence of a contextual database that can provide evidence on the current situation as a starting point, it makes sense to adopt a strategy that makes use of what is derived through systematic enquiry, experimentation and generation of evidence on the potential use of national languages in our schools. Although some similar work has been carried out in other countries, there is a strong awareness of the limitations of applying such findings to the national context in The Gambia. The decision has therefore been taken to adopt this experimental and evaluative approach.

The project is intended to contribute to the improvement of pupil attainment in schools, in the hope that this will result in pupils performing better and staying longer in school. This in turn can lead to better educated young men and women who can play more effective roles in development than the traditional roles in the past.

It is believed that opportunities exist to enhance the development of children’s potential and the improvement of their well-being through a broad-based education which imparts survival and development skills. The adequate use of national languages in the formal sector will strengthen the ties between the formal and non-formal sectors. It is hoped that:

- The use of national languages will lead to acquisition of literacy skills for their own sake by children in school.
- Such acquired skills will be used in turn as a bridge to the acquisition of the target national language, English.
- There will no longer be the difficulties that pupils currently experience in conceptualizing in a foreign language at school.

The project should also generate research data for the development and description of the three national languages. In addition, curriculum specialists should gain skills in the areas of research and applied and theoretical linguistics, in readiness for the
eventual generalization of the project after the pilot phase is completed. The project will not impose on government any significant increase in its wage bill, since its implementation will be mainly by teachers and by CRPDD staff who are already in the system.

As regards non-governmental organizations in the field, it has been observed that the skills that are most useful for self-employed adults are literacy, computational skills and agricultural knowledge. Even though the benefits of using national languages have not been measured accurately, it is observed that:

- Apart from improved literacy, people’s self-esteem is being raised.
- Since some literacy materials treat health subjects and income-generating activities, the newly acquired literacy can lead to better job opportunities and employment prospects. Some newly literate adults become facilitators at literacy centres or become language helpers. There is some evidence that some learners use skills learned in class in conjunction with their employment and also become more interested in public affairs.
- People become interested in reading for pleasure and information.
- People communicate in print.
- Acquired literacy skills are used in learning a foreign language, English.
- People use their new linguistic skills to translate and transliterate religious texts.
- Through literacy, people understand more about their civic rights and can contribute in the strengthening of the democratic process.
- The written national languages can now be the pre-eminent preserver of the Gambian culture.

**Conclusion**

The government of The Gambia is well aware of the need to improve existing educational strategies and to put in place effective mechanisms or measures to provide the basic prerequisites of teaching and learning.

However, it has not always been possible to devise the most effective and economical means of confronting the problems that have arisen. One such problem is how to produce instructional materials in national languages in the most cost effective manner. This case study is an attempt to contribute towards the identification and solution of this problem.
Considering the time that pupils devote to books for learning purposes it becomes very clear that the cost per hour of providing adequate textbooks is minimal. In The Gambia, with its large proportion of rural population, non-formal education has a key role to play in enhancing social participation among the people.

The issues highlighted in this study should be used by policy makers to design and orient the publishing of instructional materials in national languages, in order to achieve a strategy that is both conducive to effective teaching and learning and can be sustained. The conclusion of the study is that the objective should not be simply to install the most up-to-date technology, or high speed printing presses, but to put at the disposal of our learners – both children and adults – adequate and durable textbooks, at the lowest possible cost.

References


Acknowledgements

The author would like to thank Aihaji Ba Trawally of the National Languages and Material Development Sector (NL&MDS), and Mr Kebba Touray of the Skill Development component of Women In Development, for agreeing to be interviewed, and Mrs Debra Newsome of the Association of Baptists for World Evangelism (ABWE) and Sister Marlies Luck of WEC International, for completing the questionnaires sent to them.

Last but not least, I must thank Mrs Princess Drammeh and Miss Gladys Conteh of the Curriculum Research and Professional Development Division for typing this chapter.
Introduction

Owing to a number of constraints, this study lays no claim to being exhaustive or scientific, in the sense of a thorough piece of systematic research carried out with proper methods and techniques. First, there was a time constraint. We were given three months to carry out this study; but because of my professional obligations and those of my associates, it was not possible to devote enough time to the study for it to be a major piece of research. Secondly, resources were extremely limited as there was no budget for research expenses (surveys, travel, supplies etc.).

These two factors determined the methodology that would be used in the study. There would be no surveys, no questionnaires administered to representative samples and so no statistical treatment. The research work was limited to:

- perusal of documents
- interviews
- observation
- group discussions and
- drawing conclusions from our own experiences.

It is important to consider the context in which this study was conducted in relation to the policy that prevails in the Ministry of Education. Following a change of regime in the country in 1991, the current Minister of Education was in favour of a return to French in education. This policy takes the form of the use of French as both a taught language and the language of instruction throughout secondary education and for some subjects at primary level.

Given all the above, this study has only a limited scope and is in no way a plea for any particular policy.
The economic context

Madagascar is an island in the Indian Ocean some 400 km east of Africa. It has an area of 592,000 sq. km with a population of 13 million, 50.93 percent of whom are female. This population is young, with 64 percent being under 25. The population is growing by about 2.7 percent per annum and has a fertility rate of 6.1. Rural dwellers account for 70 percent of the population, while the urban population is growing by 5.7 percent per annum.

The World Bank’s estimate of GNP per capita in 1994 was US$200. This means that Madagascar is among the world’s poorest countries. The minimum wage is equivalent to 160 French francs. In 1993 debt servicing represented 76 percent of operating income. The country is experiencing rampant inflation, which is eroding household purchasing power. Thus, 74 percent of the population is living below the poverty threshold (estimated at 247,600 Malagasy francs – Fmg1 – per annum).

The environment is deteriorating at an accelerating rate because of erosion, deforestation and natural disasters (tropical depressions, cyclones, floods). This situation aggravates the country’s communication difficulties. Some regions are cut off from the rest of the island for three or even six months of the year.

The combination of these factors has a strong and negative impact on the school situation. In 1993 19 percent of primary schools were closed. The school enrolment ratio fell from 73.5 percent in 1978 to 62 percent in 1994. In some areas it fell to 35 percent. The repeat rate is high: 36 percent in primary, and 20 percent in secondary schools. In such circumstances, illiteracy is bound to grow. According to recent estimates more than 40 percent of the population is illiterate.

Faced with this situation the government has taken recovery measures in various areas such as initial and lifelong training (reopening training schools), improving school facilities, providing textbooks, strengthening the capacity of academic services, establishing programme-contracts between schools and village communities for the rehabilitation of buildings and infant enrolment. This recovery policy is supported by a variety of partners, both multilateral (World Bank, UNICEF, UNESCO, ACCT) and bilateral (France, United Kingdom, Germany, USA, Japan etc.).

Language policy

The language situation in Madagascar

The island of Madagascar was peopled by a series of waves of Indonesian, Malay, Arab and African immigrants, overlaying an
indigenous population. The mixing of these peoples has shaped a unique language with numerous dialects, an original morphology and syntax and a lexicon rich in foreign contributions.

Article 4 of the 1992 Constitution enshrines Malagasy as ‘the national language’ of the country. This basic text, like the law on education and training, is silent on the status of other languages, notably French. But French is used not only in administration but also as the language of instruction, concurrently with Malagasy. In addition, Malagasy is often used even by nationals, especially city-dwellers, in various situations ranging from ordinary communication between individuals to teaching and culture, including professional life.

This state of affairs flows from the absence of a language policy underpinned by law and consistently applied. The world of education also suffers from this situation.

The term ‘languages of instruction’ is used here to refer to the languages that teachers use to give their courses, whether orally or in writing. We are thus not dealing with dialects or languages used by teachers in non-teaching situations.

Languages of instruction according to ministerial instructions

In the 1990–91 and 1991–92 academic years the use of languages in educational establishments was authorized as follows:

- for primary education: Malagasy, except for the teaching of French which is conducted in French
- for secondary education:
  a) Malagasy for the teaching of Malagasy, ethics and civics, and the history and geography of Madagascar;
  b) French for the teaching of French, science, the history and geography of other countries, and philosophy.

Since the 1993/4 academic year, following the change of political regime in the country, the return of French as the language of instruction has been ordered by the Minister of Education. That has involved:

- at the primary level, the publication of a circular specifying that Malagasy shall remain the language of instruction for the first two years of school and for the other three years the language of instruction for Malagasy, ethics, civics, hygiene, the history of Madagascar, aesthetics and productive activities, with French being used for the teaching of arithmetic, general knowledge and geography
- at the secondary level, the publication of new curricula drawn up in French (except for Malagasy and foreign languages), and thus supposed to be taught in that language.
For the record, between 1976 and 1990 Malagasy was the language of instruction in primary schools and colleges (junior secondary schools) and French along with Malagasy were the languages of instruction in lycees (senior secondary schools).

**Practice in the Classroom**

It goes without saying that in the light of the prevailing language situation in the country, the repeated changes of languages used in education and the training of teachers over the last 20 years have seriously affected teachers’ classroom practice. That means that teachers have not always followed official instructions.

From 1976 to 1990 a minority of colleges continued to teach in French despite the fact that education was supposed to be in Malagasy. Some teachers who had difficulty in giving their courses in Malagasy resorted to French.

Since the ‘return to French’, in 1990 in colleges, and since 1992 throughout the system, the most common practice has been ‘explanations in Malagasy and summaries in French’. The reason for this is that, on the one hand, teachers have either become unused to using French or are not sufficiently fluent in that language, or even may not really know it at all; on the other hand pupils do not understand what is said in French since they have not been taught the language.

The upshot is that some teachers act according to what they feel is right, while others do so in the light of their own language skills, or as circumstances dictate. It must be acknowledged that the freedom granted to teachers at one time, to be able to use dialects, Malagasy and French concurrently in class, made them used to practices that were not always educationally orthodox, but they could justify themselves by pointing to bilingual examination subjects. The situation in teacher training institutions hardly differs from that prevailing in schools.

During the period of ‘Malgachization’ (1976–90), classes had to be taught in Malagasy and at present they have to be given in French. But the reality differs from the regulations, in other words, trainers use both languages, preferring Malagasy for oral use and French for writing.

**Adult literacy programmes**

Literacy courses in Madagascar, even under the First Republic, were always given in Malagasy. The age of learners justified such a choice of language, especially as what was involved was functional literacy. Thus we can say that while there has been instability in language policy in schools, there has been stability in the area of literacy training.
Publishing policy

Publishing policy in the area of school books has gone through two distinct phases:

- 1976-1989: period of Malgachization
- 1990-today: period of opening-up.

This section looks at these two periods successively. From the outset it must be stressed that the publishing policies that have been followed to date flow from the general policies of the government and especially the language policy adopted.


In terms of general policy, this period saw the establishment of socialist structures. The regime’s chief concerns were ideological. As a result, diplomatic relations were oriented towards the Eastern bloc of so-called ‘progressive’ countries which, unfortunately, did not help the government to produce schoolbooks.

In terms of educational policy, this was a period when the establishment of the triad ‘Malgachization, democratization and decentralization of education’ was emphasized. But this vast reform lacked the means to match its ambition. Since the government was unable to provide pupils with textbooks it had to limit itself to the production of ‘teaching books’ for teachers, which were not strictly textbooks or guides but rather compilations of teaching notes. They were of course written in Malagasy.

What was produced was essentially intended for primary education. During the period under review 20 titles were produced for primary schools. Between 10,000 and 60,000 copies of each title were published, with reprinting for works funded by the WWF or UNICEF.

The authors were officials in the Ministry of Education, mainly teachers seconded to various departments who were assisted, where necessary, by teachers from the area who, after educational meetings, would send them files or documents. They were not paid as authors.

The Ministry itself funded the printing of these books and took responsibility for their distribution, through its own devolved services. Publishing expenses for some titles were borne by donors. Such was the case with Mba ho velona and Ny voary. These books did not reach all schools because of a defective distribution system and because the number of copies published was sometimes lower than actual requirements.

At one time the Ministry sold these books. The receipts were turned over to a central school cooperative fund, managed by the
Peri- and Para-school Services Board whose responsibilities included the distribution of books sold in provincial directorates and school districts. The system did not work, however, for lack of sufficient customers. So there had to be a return to free distribution.

Commercial sales policies were also adopted for school textbooks which were developed by teachers privately and sold by small publishing houses. The Ministry would buy these books from its own budget and entrust the devolved services with their distribution to schools. In this way, teachers, and sometimes pupils, would have a few textbooks.

2. The period of opening-up: 1990–today

After 1987 the government began to liberalize. In the area of education the Report on the Development of Education, drawn up by UNESCO in 1986, reoriented government policy. A programme to improve the quality of education was adopted and implemented, starting in 1989. It was supported by donors and lenders (World Bank, UNICEF, UNPFIA etc.), executive agencies (UNESCO, ACCT) and donors (France, Germany, United Kingdom, United States, WWF etc.).

This new education programme runs totally counter to the publishing policy of the previous period, in that it gives emphasis to the provision of quality educational aids to pupils. Its projects conform to the provisions of existing regulations, as regards languages of instruction.

Crédit de Renforcement du Secteur Educatif (CRESED), a project financed through a loan from the World Bank to Madagascar, has also financed five textbooks in Malagasy and two Mathematics textbooks in Malagasy for primary schools. The authors of these textbooks were officials in the Ministry of Education assigned to a project financed by a German aid agency, Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ). They did not receive any royalties. They had carried out research and trials before writing the textbooks and accompanying guides. Their work ended with the delivery of the manuscripts.

CRESED took over from the GTZ the responsibility for financing the printing and distribution of books. Each title aims to have one textbook for every two pupils. The books belong to the schools, but parents share in the costs by paying 500 Fmg per annum per pupil. The money collected in this way is distributed as follows:

- 85 percent to the school
- 10 percent to the office of the Administrative and Educational Area
- 5 percent to the office of the school district.
For the district and Administrative and Educational Area levels, the money serves to reimburse the local bodies for the costs of distributing the books. Furthermore the Ministry levies 500 francs from the educational budget for each book distributed, to be allocated to school districts with a view to future reprints.  

Finally, as during the previous period, private authors are publishing works in Malagasy. In terms of their physical and educational qualities these textbooks are inferior to the books produced by the Ministry.

**Strategies for minimizing costs**

Successive governments in Madagascar, despite adopting different policies on the language to be used as the medium of instruction in education, took the same attitude towards educational materials in Malagasy: all educational materials, whether in Malagasy, French or other languages, have been treated in the same way.

There are therefore no specific government policies or strategies to reduce or minimize the costs of publishing books in Malagasy. Indeed such strategies are hardly likely in the current period which has returned to the use of French as the medium of instruction in schools.

**Costs of textbooks**

**General considerations**

As stated above, the government does not show particular concern for books published in Malagasy, and there are no specific strategies designed to reduce the cost of books in the national language. The publishing policies outlined above are concerned with books both in Malagasy and in French and English. This equality of treatment also prevails in private publishing.

Publishers use offset litho duplication for printing books. They pay a tax of 25 percent on imported paper. The average sale price of a locally published textbook is 8,255 Fmg (FF11.3).

**Publishing costs**

This section draws on three sources of illustrative data on costs of publication of textbooks in Madagascar. Only one publisher, SEDICO, unreservedly provided detailed information on the determinants of locally produced textbooks. A German adult education agency, DVV, which has financed literacy activities in the country, provided information on unit costs, total costs and sale prices of a selection of books produced for adults, and information is available
on the cost of textbooks financed under the World Bank CRESED project. The data are summarized in the following four tables.

THE EXAMPLE OF SEDICO

As stressed above, the costs of textbooks are independent of the language used. Figure 3.1 is based, for the purposes of illustration, on an 80-page science textbook for the third year of primary school.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure 3.1 Cost illustration for a print run of 1,000 copies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inputting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laser paper 100Fmg/2pages: (100 x 40)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ink 400 Fmg/page; (400 x 80)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make-up + design 1.500Fmg/page: (1 500 x 80)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Film 2.500Fmg/page; (2 500 x 82)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plate 3.500Fmg/page; (3 500 x 82)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Camera + make-up + transfer-plate 47Fmg/page; (47 x 80)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imported 48.8g newsprint 13Fmg/page; (13 x 80 x 1 000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cover 482Fmg/cover; (482 x 1 000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misc. (packaging, transport, postage)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publishing costs 32Fmg/page; (32 x 80 x 1 000)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| TOTAL | 4 865 760 |

On the basis of the figures in Figure 3.1 the cost price for one book is:

\[
\frac{4,865,760}{1000} = 4,866 \text{ Fmg.}
\]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure 3.2 Cost illustration for reprinting 1 000 copies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Newsprint 13Fmg x 80 x 1 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cover 482Fmg x 1 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misc. 100 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publishing costs 32Fmg x 80 x 1 000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| TOTAL | 4 182 000 |

The cost price for one book, calculated on the basis of the figures in Figure 3.2 is:

\[
\frac{4,182,000}{1,000} = 4,182 \text{ Fmg.}
\]

On the market this textbook sells for 7,000 Fmg.\(^4\) In general, the price range of SEDICO textbooks is between 6,500Fmg and 8,750Fmg.
THE EXAMPLE OF THE DVV

Figure 3.3 provides information on books published for DVV, a German adult education agency, by the TSIPIKA company. The books are intended for adults, especially women and farmers. It should be noted that the sales prices, in virtually all cases, are markedly lower than the unit cost.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Copies</th>
<th>Unit cost</th>
<th>Total cost</th>
<th>Sale price</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ampio aho hanampiako ny hafa 1</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td>2 000</td>
<td>9 000</td>
<td>18 000 000</td>
<td>2 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ampio aho hanampiako ny hafa 2</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td>2 000</td>
<td>9 000</td>
<td>18 000 000</td>
<td>2 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ampio aho hanampiako ny hafa 3</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td>2 000</td>
<td>9 000</td>
<td>18 000 000</td>
<td>2 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voly vary maro anaka (SRI)</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td>3 000</td>
<td>3 800</td>
<td>11 400 000</td>
<td>2 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omby vary be ronono 1</td>
<td>1993</td>
<td>5 000</td>
<td>1 774</td>
<td>8 872 315</td>
<td>2 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omby vary be ronono 2</td>
<td>1993</td>
<td>5 000</td>
<td>1 774</td>
<td>8 872 315</td>
<td>2 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nosy wak-wak</td>
<td>1995</td>
<td>2 000</td>
<td>10 215</td>
<td>20 430 000</td>
<td>2 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roba-toahana</td>
<td>1995</td>
<td>2 000</td>
<td>10 215</td>
<td>20 430 000</td>
<td>2 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tadidy 96</td>
<td>1995</td>
<td>4 000</td>
<td>6 200</td>
<td>24 800 000</td>
<td>4 500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tadidy 96</td>
<td>1995</td>
<td>5 000</td>
<td>7 300</td>
<td>36 500 000</td>
<td>4 500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tena hiompy kisoa</td>
<td>1995</td>
<td>5 000</td>
<td>3 320</td>
<td>16 600 000</td>
<td>2 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vaty fanentanana</td>
<td>1995</td>
<td>3 000</td>
<td>9 700</td>
<td>29 100 000</td>
<td>2 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiompy tantely</td>
<td>1995</td>
<td>2 000</td>
<td>8 100</td>
<td>16 200 000</td>
<td>2 000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

THE EXAMPLE OF TEXTBOOKS PROVIDED UNDER THE CRESED PROJECT

Figure 3.4 presents information about books provided under the CRESED project. These textbooks are not intended for sale. They are distributed free to schools.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>296 870</td>
<td>15 097</td>
<td>351 310</td>
<td>17 977</td>
<td>17 813</td>
<td>16 650</td>
<td>281 440</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>761</td>
<td>7 000</td>
<td>1 722</td>
<td>21 450</td>
<td>15 797</td>
<td>19 500</td>
<td>1 364</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>226 004</td>
<td>106 679</td>
<td>604 956</td>
<td>385 607</td>
<td>281 392</td>
<td>324 675</td>
<td>383 884</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59 574</td>
<td>12 571</td>
<td>111 471</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>126 122</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>295 579</td>
<td>728 022</td>
<td>716 427</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>509 006</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* The distribution costs of some guides and textbooks are combined, as there is joint distribution.
The costs in these tables are not fully comparable since they do not all include the same elements. The DVV and CRESED books include hidden costs which lower both their stated unit cost and their sales price.

**Impact of educational materials in Malagasy**

**Preliminary note**

In the absence of reliable statistics on the results of the use of textbooks in Malagasy, the conclusions set out below have been based on empirical observations. Care is therefore required in any future use of these conclusions. Furthermore, the present section covers only the period 1976–1989, because that was the time when all textbooks in use in primary schools were in Malagasy, except for textbooks used for teaching French and English. The remainder of this section refers to Malgachization rather than textbooks in Malagasy, since education was given in that language during the period under consideration.

**The internal efficiency of Malgachization**

Article 10 of Law 78-040 of 7 July 1978 defines Malgachization as ‘the adaptation of educational curricula and methods to national needs and aims’, which also ‘involves the use of the national language as the language of instruction’. The use of Malagasy, with its regional variants, was thus required in schools during this period.

The result was a better understanding of what was taught on the part of pupils, partly because the teachers expressed themselves in a language they spoke fluently and partly because the pupils had no language problems in understanding and expressing themselves at school. This educationally advantageous situation flowed from the fact that teachers and learners were at ease in the languages they were using in class. Yet everyone agreed that the generation of pupils of this period of Malgachization did not write Malagasy very well. In addition, surveys of the educational system carried out in 1986–7 revealed an alarming situation, including:

- a 50 percent repetition rate in the first year of primary school
- a drop-out rate of 11 percent in primary school
- a school retention rate (from primary to final year of secondary school) of 30 percent
- a success rate:
  - of 29.9 percent in the CEPE (end of primary school examination)
It is important to know the reasons for these poor results. The Malgachization of education must be seen in context. First, it was a component of an educational policy within a development policy that failed. Could it have succeeded as a component within a policy which as a whole failed to live up to its promises? The question remains open. Secondly, this educational policy had ambitious quantitative targets which glossed over the quality of teaching. Finally, Malgachization was not carried through in favourable conditions. There was a shortage of textbooks, and, where there were any, they were not of good quality, teachers were poorly trained but highly politicized, the educational bureaucracy functioned poorly and the teaching back-up was desperately short of personnel. This list could be extended.

In short, to be fair to Malgachization, it cannot be entirely blamed, by itself, for the internal inefficiency of the educational policy of the time, since not all its effects were negative. The final judgement on Malgachization is yet to be made.

The external effectiveness of Malgachization

This section looks at the school results and the results of adult literacy programmes. It deals with the use made of what was learned in school by learners in civilian life.

Benefits

The use of Malagasy in teaching and in adult literacy courses strengthened Malagasy cultural identity, made young people feel more adequate and gave pupils the freedom to express themselves.

In class, the fear of making mistakes in language, which had prevailed when teaching was in French, disappeared. Learning English no longer had to rely on translation from French, but could proceed directly from Malagasy to the language of Shakespeare, which represented an enormous educational advance. Official Malagasy was enriched by contributions from the island’s many dialects, thus giving life to the basic cement of the country’s national unity. Literate parents became able, to some extent, to follow what their children were studying, which allowed them to use their new skills.

The increase in the number of readers of Malagasy encouraged the growth of writing in that language. The number of bilingual newspapers or newspapers published in Malagasy alone rose. For example, UNESCO launched newspapers in the national language in the framework of its ‘rural press’ project. The population’s
political maturity and level of technical knowledge increased, thanks to this closer and more diverse link with the written word. Relations with the bureaucracy were better because it used the language of the people in both oral communication and in writing. Citizens could now play a greater part in public affairs, without any need for an intermediary, thereby strengthening the process of democratization that was under way.

PROBLEMS

Despite these undeniable advantages, which cannot unfortunately be quantified or broken down systematically, a few reservations are in order.

In the first place, there was a certain degree of mistrust on the part of some parents towards Malgachization, because, in their view, it did not teach their children enough French. In fact such parents confuse linguistic knowledge and teaching. They believe that knowledge of French necessarily involves a high academic level. Such a view, superficial and false though it may be, is quite widespread in the countryside and did not help the universalization of primary education. It was one of the factors contributing to school drop-out in the rural areas. The parents said they saw no point in sending their children to school to learn Malagasy when they already knew it.

Secondly, it must be acknowledged that the school performance of pupils during the period of Malgachization was often unsatisfactory. School-leavers at that time displayed many shortcomings, notably in French. This linguistic inadequacy was a heavy handicap for them, even amounting to a blemish, when they were searching for a job, or trying to carry on a trade. For in Malagasy society there is a prejudice that associates competence with knowledge of the French language.

These two points are part of the argument put forward by advocates of a return to French in schools today. There too, care is needed to ensure that the statement of intent on the language of instruction is accompanied by the necessary measures so that it does not fall into the same weaknesses as the policy of Malgachization.

Conclusion

Despite the previous manifestations of Malgachization, and given the advantages that it produced, it would be unreasonable to abandon the production of educational materials in Malagasy in future, particularly those intended for participants in literacy courses. It would be wiser to seek to reduce their costs.
One solution would be to draw up a national school book policy, and for two reasons. The first lies in the fact that the resources available to the state are limited and the government will not be able indefinitely to subsidize or give away educational books, even for school pupils. Reducing and sharing the costs of these books will thus become inevitable, but as part of an overall policy. Secondly, since neither the state nor the private sector makes any distinction between books in Malagasy and books in foreign languages, including French, issues related to textbooks in the national language can only be dealt with in the framework of an overall approach.

Such a policy would seek to put books on the market at prices people can afford. All the people, companies, agencies and government departments involved in the book sector would have to be involved in drafting such a policy. Means will have to be found to reduce the cost of the necessary inputs for book publishing. That will require a decision reached on the basis of a national consensus. For, if the state does not want to lose the benefit of the use of educational textbooks in Malagasy, that is the route that will have to be taken.

Notes

1. 1 Malagasy franc (Fmg) = 0.730 French francs
2. Emphasis has been used to stress the uniqueness of Malagasy.
3. In the Official Journal laws, ordinances, decrees and orders are published in Malagasy and French. Other regulation are issued either in Malagasy or in French. In the private sector there are no legal provisions governing the use of Malagasy or French.
4. Decision No 1001-96/MINESEB on the use of languages in educational establishments at levels I, II and III, of 1 October 1990 [see Appendix].
5. Circular No 92/00154187/MIP/DEP.1 of 7 July 1992 [see Appendix 1].
6. This was done without repealing decision 1001-90/MINESEB of 01.10.90.
7. From 1960-1972, when teaching was in French.
8. The reform called for the construction of one school in every Fokontany [basic community], one CEG in every district, one secondary school in every department, and one university centre in every province and the recruitment of 14,000 teachers for primary education alone.
9. Published in 1988, funded by UNICEF; it is a natural sciences book.
10. Published in 1987, funded by the WWF; it is a reading book.
11. The main sponsor of the programme is the World Bank through CRESED [Crédit de Renforcement du Secteur Educatif].
12. About 70 centimes (1 FF = 730 Fmg).
13. Letter from the Secretary-General to Provincial Directors in Appendix III.
14. That is equal to one-sixteenth of the minimum starting wage of an unskilled worker (112,000 Fmg: 7,000) and to 3.5 kg of rice (7,000 : 2,000): a peasant or worker consumes about 500 g per day.
15. This situation deserves special attention, since in the present case, the majority of teachers in colleges and primary schools do not speak French very well, and pupils have a great deal of difficulty in following them, their linguistic baggage being minimal.
16. This rate is 67 percent for African countries as a whole. Source: Directorate of Educational Planning.
17. One school in each Basic Community, one junior secondary school in each District, 1 senior secondary school in each Region and one university centre in each Province.
18. See the list of DVV publications aimed at adults, for example.
19. At heart, it is the same belief as the one described in the previous paragraph.

The author

Louis Lai-Seng is a Primary School Inspector. He studied at the Institut Pédagogique d’Antananarivo (Madagascar), the University of Toamasina and the École Normale Supérieure de Saint-Cloud (France). He is the head of the Unité d’Étude et de Recherche Pédagogiques (UERP, Educational Study and Research Unit) in the Ministry of National Education of Madagascar, and was previously a secondary school teacher, head of an educational district and divisional head in the provincial education office in Toamasina.

He has published articles in the ecological magazine VINTSY and is the author of ‘La didactique du français, l’enseignement du vocabulaire à l’Education de Base à Madagascar’. He took part in preparing the Plan d’Action National pour l’Education des Filles (PANEF) and the Programme National d’Amélioration de l’Education à Madagascar – Phase 2 (PNAE2). He is publications editor of the UERP’s journal Reflet.
Introduction

Namibia is located in the south-western part of the African continent and shares borders with Angola, Zambia and Zimbabwe in the north, Botswana in the east, and South Africa in the south. Namibia has a surface area of 824,295 sq. km. and is the fifteenth largest country in Africa. It has an average annual rainfall of 270mm and is regarded as an extremely arid country.

On 21 March 1990, with the successful implementation of United Nations Resolution 435, Namibia attained its independence. After independence Namibia started to redesign the national infrastructure, administrative bodies and basic services. The government operates under a multi-party system. The executive branch comprises of the President and the Cabinet, the legislative branch of the National Assembly and the National Council. Namibia is divided into 13 regions, but the Ministry of Basic Education administers seven Education Regions (see Figure 4.1, page 58). All schools in a particular region report to one regional office.

In 1991, when the last comprehensive population census was conducted, Namibia had a population of 1,409,920. The projected population in 1995 was about 1,610,000. Despite the small size of its population Namibia has a rich diversity of ethnic groups, including Ovambo, Herero, Nama, Damara, Kavango, Caprivians, San, Tswana, whites (mostly Germans and Afrikaners), coloureds and Basters. The population of Namibia is concentrated in the northern part of the country (60 percent); the south is the least populated (7 percent) and the remaining population (33 percent) live in the central part of the country.

Namibia is regarded as one of the more wealthy and resource-rich countries on the African continent. Its economy has traditionally been based on the rich diamond deposits, and on uranium and other base metals. Other major economic activities are beef cattle
and karakul sheep farming, and the fishing industry. However Namibia’s economy has certain constraints, namely a shortage of skilled manpower, the external dependence of the economy, limited raw materials and financial resources. The country operates in the South African Customs Union, within the Rand Monetary Area and the Bank of Namibia System. The tourist industry has grown considerably since independence, but mining still accounts for about two-thirds of all export earnings. About 75 percent of all imports still come from South Africa. The per capita income of the country varies greatly between different regions and different social and ethnic groups. The World Bank estimate of GNP per capita in 1994 was US$1,970. But in 1990, when the World Bank estimate for GNP per capita for the country as a whole was about US$1,030, it was estimated to be only US$100 per year in rural areas, US$305 in the semi-urban areas, US$580 for blacks, and about US$14,650 for whites.

At independence the literacy rate in Namibia was estimated at about 60 percent, but this is regarded as an overestimate. The 1991 census (see Appendix Six) drew attention to the need for caution when interpreting available data on literate and illiterate people. The Namibian government views basic literacy as a prerequisite for the success of national programmes for improved health, educa-

---

**Figure 4.1** Education regions

![Map of Namibia showing education regions](image)
tion, economic efficiency and democratic participation. In 1993 it was estimated that more than 400,000 Namibians were functionally illiterate. The Ministry of Basic Education and Culture has a Directorate of Adult Basic Education, which has launched the National Literacy Programme (NLPN) in Namibia, with 15,000 participants in 1992. With the help of non-governmental organizations the goal is to substantially reduce the illiteracy rate by the year 2000.

The programme is aimed not only at developing literacy in English and in the local languages, but the ability to read, write and work with numbers. Many adult Namibians did not achieve literacy skills from formal schooling. The National Literacy Programme is divided into three stages. Adults are permitted to enrol at any of the three stages, depending on their levels of literacy. A fourth stage is envisaged and will be introduced in the future. Since 1992 there have been over 83,000 enrolments, of which 23 percent were male.

Figure 4.2 shows total enrolments, the number of participants who were tested, and the percentage who passed at the three stages. Altogether 70.5 percent of the total enrolment were tested, and 81.2 percent of these passed the examinations. About 22,000 adults have acquired basic mother tongue literacy skills from Stage 1. Literacy levels are estimated to have improved by 6 percent between 1991 and 1994. Learner-centred literacy classes are conducted all over the country by adult educators. Furthermore, it is equally important that the adult literacy programme is linked with opportunities for continuing education for its participants, and here the support and co-operation of the private sector is very essential. The training of their staff will enhance their skills in basic reading, writing and numeracy.

In 1995 a total of 472,870 people, representing 29.4 percent of

![Figure 4.2](image-url)
the population, were at school. Furthermore, in 1995 there were about 415,300 people aged between six and sixteen years, of whom 369,200 (88.9 percent) were at school. The schooling system in Namibia covers twelve grades. These grades are divided into four phases: Lower Primary (Grades 1 to 4), Upper Primary (Grades 5 to 7), Junior Secondary (Grades 8 to 10) and Senior Secondary (Grades 11 to 12).

The average size of schools differs substantially, as shown in Figure 4.3. This reflects different human settlement patterns and different ways of providing access to schooling.

Enrolments have grown substantially since independence, as shown in Figure 4.4. The rate of growth has exceeded the population growth rate. The percentage of the school-age population...
attending school has increased, and pupils spend longer at school than previously. Growth rates have been greatest at the senior secondary level. For the country as a whole, enrolment declines as the grades progress.

On a national level there is widespread female participation in schooling, rising to 57 percent in Grade 10, and declining slightly in senior secondary grades, as shown in Figure 4.4. However, the proportion of female learners varies between regions, as shown in Figure 4.5. Females make up 50.4 percent of all children of school-going age in Namibia. In some regions the proportions of females in secondary grades are well below 50 percent, as shown in Figure 4.6 (page 62).

Figure 4.7 (page 63) gives the enrolment of learners over the past five years in primary, secondary and other grades. Although total enrolments were lower in 1995 than in 1994, over the past five years they have grown substantially. As mentioned above, the greatest rates of growth have been in the senior secondary phase.

**Language policy**

Because of the ethnic diversity in Namibia a wide range of different languages and dialects are spoken. The 1991 Population and Housing Census recorded almost 50 languages and dialects, of which about 31 were various African languages and dialects. Of these 31 languages, 9 have been chosen to be national languages which are used for educational purposes, namely Oshindonga, Oshikwanyama, Khoekhoegowab, Rugkwangali, Otjiherero, Silozi, Rugciriku, Thimbukusu and Setswana. Of the San languages only
## Figure 4.6  Numbers of learners in Grades 1 to 12, 1995

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Caprivi</td>
<td></td>
<td>4207</td>
<td>3467</td>
<td>3651</td>
<td>3561</td>
<td>3182</td>
<td>2755</td>
<td>2694</td>
<td>2480</td>
<td>2319</td>
<td>2990</td>
<td>1396</td>
<td>1234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>49.3</td>
<td>49.7</td>
<td>50.5</td>
<td>47.7</td>
<td>48.0</td>
<td>47.6</td>
<td>46.8</td>
<td>50.1</td>
<td>47.9</td>
<td>49.9</td>
<td>46.5</td>
<td>42.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Okavango</td>
<td></td>
<td>9307</td>
<td>6943</td>
<td>6039</td>
<td>5224</td>
<td>3823</td>
<td>2900</td>
<td>2502</td>
<td>2253</td>
<td>1813</td>
<td>1166</td>
<td>469</td>
<td>416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>50.3</td>
<td>49.5</td>
<td>50.5</td>
<td>51.9</td>
<td>49.8</td>
<td>47.6</td>
<td>48.9</td>
<td>46.2</td>
<td>43.2</td>
<td>38.7</td>
<td>30.1</td>
<td>29.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohangwena</td>
<td></td>
<td>13455</td>
<td>12756</td>
<td>10504</td>
<td>9965</td>
<td>6645</td>
<td>4817</td>
<td>4040</td>
<td>3130</td>
<td>2701</td>
<td>3014</td>
<td>489</td>
<td>756</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>47.8</td>
<td>49.1</td>
<td>51.6</td>
<td>53.7</td>
<td>55.0</td>
<td>55.9</td>
<td>55.7</td>
<td>56.2</td>
<td>58.2</td>
<td>63.3</td>
<td>63.0</td>
<td>57.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oshikoto</td>
<td></td>
<td>6109</td>
<td>6974</td>
<td>6593</td>
<td>6071</td>
<td>4396</td>
<td>3465</td>
<td>2816</td>
<td>2648</td>
<td>2233</td>
<td>2828</td>
<td>609</td>
<td>514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>47.3</td>
<td>46.4</td>
<td>47.9</td>
<td>50.6</td>
<td>51.4</td>
<td>52.0</td>
<td>54.5</td>
<td>56.2</td>
<td>57.9</td>
<td>52.6</td>
<td>55.5</td>
<td>51.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omusati</td>
<td></td>
<td>10628</td>
<td>12350</td>
<td>11023</td>
<td>11306</td>
<td>8552</td>
<td>6614</td>
<td>5881</td>
<td>5599</td>
<td>4150</td>
<td>4838</td>
<td>1816</td>
<td>1464</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>46.1</td>
<td>45.8</td>
<td>47.4</td>
<td>49.6</td>
<td>52.3</td>
<td>53.0</td>
<td>55.4</td>
<td>57.4</td>
<td>58.5</td>
<td>62.6</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>57.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oshana</td>
<td></td>
<td>5605</td>
<td>6579</td>
<td>6319</td>
<td>6445</td>
<td>5252</td>
<td>3930</td>
<td>3456</td>
<td>3188</td>
<td>2927</td>
<td>2623</td>
<td>1987</td>
<td>1133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>46.9</td>
<td>46.9</td>
<td>48.5</td>
<td>48.8</td>
<td>50.4</td>
<td>53.9</td>
<td>53.2</td>
<td>55.9</td>
<td>56.6</td>
<td>61.2</td>
<td>54.0</td>
<td>48.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kunene</td>
<td></td>
<td>1902</td>
<td>1788</td>
<td>1799</td>
<td>1931</td>
<td>1680</td>
<td>1288</td>
<td>1096</td>
<td>988</td>
<td>915</td>
<td>817</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>641</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>50.8</td>
<td>48.0</td>
<td>50.5</td>
<td>49.1</td>
<td>51.4</td>
<td>52.5</td>
<td>47.8</td>
<td>50.9</td>
<td>49.5</td>
<td>48.1</td>
<td>44.2</td>
<td>37.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erongo</td>
<td></td>
<td>1783</td>
<td>1886</td>
<td>1786</td>
<td>2067</td>
<td>1951</td>
<td>1774</td>
<td>1799</td>
<td>1596</td>
<td>1442</td>
<td>1182</td>
<td>774</td>
<td>817</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>48.2</td>
<td>50.3</td>
<td>51.5</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>50.4</td>
<td>53.9</td>
<td>53.9</td>
<td>52.4</td>
<td>57.4</td>
<td>56.3</td>
<td>57.4</td>
<td>58.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Otjozondjupa</td>
<td>2883</td>
<td>3148</td>
<td>2893</td>
<td>3168</td>
<td>2666</td>
<td>2358</td>
<td>2099</td>
<td>1641</td>
<td>1009</td>
<td>718</td>
<td>475</td>
<td>473</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>47.9</td>
<td>47.5</td>
<td>49.7</td>
<td>48.4</td>
<td>50.2</td>
<td>51.6</td>
<td>52.5</td>
<td>56.6</td>
<td>53.7</td>
<td>53.3</td>
<td>46.7</td>
<td>49.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omaheke</td>
<td></td>
<td>1614</td>
<td>1635</td>
<td>1560</td>
<td>1637</td>
<td>1460</td>
<td>1295</td>
<td>1153</td>
<td>867</td>
<td>822</td>
<td>499</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>49.3</td>
<td>49.1</td>
<td>48.2</td>
<td>48.1</td>
<td>50.8</td>
<td>52.4</td>
<td>50.6</td>
<td>52.2</td>
<td>55.5</td>
<td>52.3</td>
<td>45.9</td>
<td>43.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khomas</td>
<td></td>
<td>4132</td>
<td>4019</td>
<td>3991</td>
<td>4042</td>
<td>4046</td>
<td>3367</td>
<td>2804</td>
<td>2887</td>
<td>2769</td>
<td>2562</td>
<td>2209</td>
<td>2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>49.4</td>
<td>49.3</td>
<td>50.2</td>
<td>48.3</td>
<td>52.0</td>
<td>52.4</td>
<td>54.1</td>
<td>51.7</td>
<td>50.7</td>
<td>53.1</td>
<td>49.9</td>
<td>47.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hardap</td>
<td></td>
<td>2055</td>
<td>2115</td>
<td>2071</td>
<td>2222</td>
<td>1897</td>
<td>1747</td>
<td>1590</td>
<td>1499</td>
<td>1164</td>
<td>949</td>
<td>601</td>
<td>581</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>47.8</td>
<td>49.7</td>
<td>49.2</td>
<td>49.3</td>
<td>47.9</td>
<td>52.2</td>
<td>52.6</td>
<td>49.6</td>
<td>55.3</td>
<td>55.0</td>
<td>51.9</td>
<td>48.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karas</td>
<td></td>
<td>1544</td>
<td>1551</td>
<td>1625</td>
<td>1564</td>
<td>1378</td>
<td>1205</td>
<td>1142</td>
<td>957</td>
<td>789</td>
<td>652</td>
<td>482</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>46.7</td>
<td>48.1</td>
<td>48.2</td>
<td>48.1</td>
<td>48.4</td>
<td>52.9</td>
<td>53.2</td>
<td>52.8</td>
<td>57.2</td>
<td>52.5</td>
<td>49.8</td>
<td>47.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special schools</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>36.0</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>34.3</td>
<td>31.1</td>
<td>26.3</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>28.0</td>
<td>33.7</td>
<td>57.8</td>
<td>58.2</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Namibia total</td>
<td>65258</td>
<td>65250</td>
<td>59889</td>
<td>59248</td>
<td>49966</td>
<td>37541</td>
<td>33097</td>
<td>29760</td>
<td>25098</td>
<td>25432</td>
<td>11988</td>
<td>10871</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% female</td>
<td></td>
<td>48.1</td>
<td>48.0</td>
<td>49.4</td>
<td>50.1</td>
<td>51.3</td>
<td>52.4</td>
<td>52.9</td>
<td>53.8</td>
<td>54.4</td>
<td>57.3</td>
<td>51.5</td>
<td>48.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: *A Profile of Education in Namibia*, 1996: 4
Ju’Hoan has an officially recognized orthography but it is not taught at government schools. In Namibia the dominant language in a region is still characterized by the apartheid division of the country into ethnic homelands. However, all languages are spoken in all the 13 regions, though in some cases by very few people. In Oshangwena, Omusati, Oshana and Oshikoto regions the Oshiwambo languages are predominant, as almost 90 percent of

### Figure 4.7 Summary of Enrolment 1991 to 1995, by level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total learners</td>
<td>420 980</td>
<td>439 325</td>
<td>450 639</td>
<td>474 343</td>
<td>471 653</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>males</td>
<td>203 992</td>
<td>213 775</td>
<td>220 177</td>
<td>232 683</td>
<td>232 275</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>females</td>
<td>216 988</td>
<td>225 550</td>
<td>230 462</td>
<td>241 660</td>
<td>239 378</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>total learners</td>
<td>340 984</td>
<td>348 411</td>
<td>352 100</td>
<td>366 666</td>
<td>367 249</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>males</td>
<td>167 644</td>
<td>172 539</td>
<td>175 312</td>
<td>183 343</td>
<td>184 022</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>females</td>
<td>173 340</td>
<td>175 872</td>
<td>176 788</td>
<td>183 323</td>
<td>183 227</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower learners</td>
<td>236 060</td>
<td>241 778</td>
<td>245 546</td>
<td>254 821</td>
<td>249 645</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>males</td>
<td>119 748</td>
<td>122 732</td>
<td>124 817</td>
<td>130 071</td>
<td>127 672</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>females</td>
<td>116 312</td>
<td>119 046</td>
<td>120 729</td>
<td>124 750</td>
<td>121 973</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper learners</td>
<td>104 924</td>
<td>106 633</td>
<td>106 554</td>
<td>111 845</td>
<td>117 604</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>males</td>
<td>47 896</td>
<td>49 807</td>
<td>50 495</td>
<td>53 272</td>
<td>56 350</td>
<td>4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>females</td>
<td>57 028</td>
<td>56 826</td>
<td>56 059</td>
<td>58 573</td>
<td>61 254</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>total learners</td>
<td>72 494</td>
<td>83 819</td>
<td>92 102</td>
<td>101 772</td>
<td>103 149</td>
<td>9.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>males</td>
<td>32 181</td>
<td>37 361</td>
<td>41 401</td>
<td>46 264</td>
<td>47 508</td>
<td>10.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>females</td>
<td>40 313</td>
<td>46 458</td>
<td>50 701</td>
<td>55 508</td>
<td>55 641</td>
<td>8.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junior learners</td>
<td>62 198</td>
<td>71 134</td>
<td>72 882</td>
<td>77 842</td>
<td>80 290</td>
<td>6.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>males</td>
<td>26 881</td>
<td>31 098</td>
<td>32 284</td>
<td>34 557</td>
<td>36 072</td>
<td>7.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>females</td>
<td>35 317</td>
<td>40 036</td>
<td>40 598</td>
<td>43 285</td>
<td>44 218</td>
<td>5.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior learners</td>
<td>10 296</td>
<td>12 685</td>
<td>19 220</td>
<td>23 930</td>
<td>22 859</td>
<td>22.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>males</td>
<td>5 300</td>
<td>6 263</td>
<td>9 117</td>
<td>11 707</td>
<td>11 436</td>
<td>21.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>females</td>
<td>4 996</td>
<td>6 422</td>
<td>10 103</td>
<td>12 223</td>
<td>11 423</td>
<td>23.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other grades</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>total learners</td>
<td>7 502</td>
<td>7 095</td>
<td>6 437</td>
<td>5 905</td>
<td>1 255</td>
<td>-36.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>males</td>
<td>4 167</td>
<td>3 875</td>
<td>3 464</td>
<td>3 076</td>
<td>745</td>
<td>-35.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>females</td>
<td>3 335</td>
<td>3 220</td>
<td>2 973</td>
<td>2 829</td>
<td>510</td>
<td>-37.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: EMIS Statistical Yearbook 1995, p. 41
### Figure 4.8  Population by language spoken at home, as a percentage of total population, by region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Oshiwambo</th>
<th>Nama/</th>
<th>Rukavango</th>
<th>Afrikaans</th>
<th>Otjiherero</th>
<th>Caprivi</th>
<th>San</th>
<th>Total popn</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Caprivi</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>90422</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erongo</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>55470</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hardap</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>66495</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karas</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>61162</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khomas</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>167071</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kunene</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>64017</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oshangwena 99</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>179634</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Okavango</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>116830</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omaheke</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>52735</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omusati</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>189919</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oshana</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>134884</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oshikoto</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>128745</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Otjozondjupa 18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>102536</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total popn 713919 175554 136649 133324 112916 6008 27229 1409920

% 51 13 10 9 8 5 2 100

Source: 1991 Population and Housing Census

### Figure 4.9  Population
the Oshiwambo speakers are living there. Figure 4.8 shows people in a given language group and region as a percentage of all people in that region. The numbers in bold represents the majority language in a region. Figure 4.9 shows population by region.

Figure 4.10, below, also taken from the 1991 Population and Housing Census, indicates the numbers in the various language groups. The Constitution of the Republic of Namibia, Article 3 states as follows:

1. The official language of Namibia shall be English.
2. Nothing contained in this Constitution shall prohibit the use of any other language as a medium of instruction in private schools, or in schools financed or subsidized by the State, subject to compliance with such requirements as may be imposed by law, to ensure proficiency in the official language, or for pedagogic reasons.
3. Nothing contained in Sub-Article (1) hereof shall preclude legislation by Parliament which permits the use of a language other than English for legislative, administrative and judicial purposes in regions or areas where such other language or languages are spoken by a substantial component of the population.

### Figure 4.10  Number of speakers of different languages, 1991

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language Group</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Other European languages</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tswana</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other African languages</td>
<td>0.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>0.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caprivi</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Otjiherero</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rukavango</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nama/Damara</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oshiwambo</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NB Appendix 4 gives further details about the various language groups

Source: 1991 Population and Housing Census
The basis for the Namibian Language Policy was formulated before the independence of the country, during the liberation struggle. The pre-independence language and educational scene is reflected in the document: *Toward a Language Policy for Namibia. English as the Official Language: Perspectives and strategies* (UNIN, 1981). The criteria employed to choose English as the national language were:

- promotion of national unity
- acceptability
- familiarity
- feasibility
- use in science and technology
- promotion of Pan-Africanism
- wider communication
- use by the United Nations.

Shortly after independence the then Ministry of Education and Culture issued two documents on language policy, namely: *Education in Transition* (July 1990) and *Change with Continuity* (November 1990). These documents give broad directives for the choice of languages as the medium of instruction, and the role schools should play in establishing the use of English. In July 1991 a document called *Provisional Language Policy for Schools – A draft for discussion* was issued. This document confirmed that English would be phased in as the medium of instruction in schools during the period 1992 to 1995. This would result in English becoming the medium of instruction in Grades 4 to 12 by

---

Figure 4.11  Implementation of English medium teaching in Grades 1–7

![Diagram showing implementation of English medium teaching in Grades 1–7](CostEff/Ch4/Figure4.11.png)

Source: *The Language Policy for Schools, 1993*
1995. It also stated that non-compulsory subjects in Grades 4 to 7 may be taught in a national language other than English, and that the policy would apply to all schools, including private schools. The new language policy was officially announced in November 1991. To sensitize the Namibian public and those concerned with education, the Namibia National Conference on the Implementation of the Language Policy was held during June 1992. The Namibian Language Policy is intended to be flexible and progressive, and as such policy development is a continuing process. The Language Policy proposed the phasing in of English as the main medium of instruction in Grades 4–7 in primary schools between 1993 and 1996, as shown in Figure 4.11 opposite.

In the secondary grades the phasing-in of English started with Grade 8 in January 1991, and was completed in 1995, with all grades now taught through the medium of English, as shown in Figure 4.12 above.

The following criteria and factors were taken into consideration in the formulation of language policy (Language Policy for Schools, 1993: 3):

- the equality of all national languages, regardless of the number of speakers or the level of development of a particular language
- the cost of implementing the policy
- the fact that language is a means of transmitting culture, and cultural identity
- the fact that for pedagogical reasons it is ideal for learners to study through their own language particularly in the early years of schooling when basic skills of reading, writing, and concept formulation are acquired
- the need for learners to be proficient enough in English, the official language, at the end of the 7 year primary cycle,
either to gain access to further education or to be effective participants in society

- the expectation that a language policy should enhance the development of unity in society.

It is against the background of these broad goals that the following specific goals for the language policy in schools were identified (Language Policy for Schools 1993: 4):

- The 7 year primary education cycle should enable learners to acquire reasonable competence in English, the official language, and be prepared for English medium instruction throughout the secondary cycle.
- Education should promote the language and cultural identity of learners through the use of Home Language medium, at least in Grades 1 to 3, and the teaching of Home Language throughout formal education, provided the necessary resources are available.
- Ideally, schools should offer at least two languages as subjects.
- Beyond the primary cycle (Grades 1 to 7), the medium of instruction for all schools shall be English, the official language.

English is a compulsory subject from Grade 1 to Grade 12. Two languages can be taught from Grade 1, but one must be English and all languages will have equal weighting for promotional purposes. In the first three years of schooling (Grades 1 to 3) the medium of instruction is the Home Language, a local language, or English. In Grades 4 to 7 the medium of instruction is English. In the secondary phase (Grades 8 to 12) the medium of instruction is English. For basic literacy both the mother tongue and English are used as the medium of instruction, as literacy in the official language (English) needs to be promoted. As the use of English as a medium of instruction is still in transition, the use of a local language is permitted temporarily, to help with the understanding of difficult concepts during the primary cycle.

The goal of the language policy is the fostering of the language identity of children, through the use of their mother tongue as the medium of instruction in the first three grades. This is to allow them to develop the basic skills of reading, writing and concept formation. Each school community decides on the medium of instruction. Figure 4.13 on the next page shows the proportion of children who receive instruction in their home language varying widely: e.g. 7 percent for Otjiherero, 35 percent for Khoekhoegowab, 93 percent for Rukwangali, 92 percent for Oshindonga and 89 percent for Silozi speakers. In Namibia as a
whole, 55.1 percent of all learners in the first three years of schooling are taught in their home language.

English is the medium of instruction for teacher training, and in addition six of the national languages, (Oshindonga, Oshikwanyama, Otjiherero, Rukwangali, Silozi and Khoekhoegowab) are taught as subjects in teacher training colleges.

Policy on publishing in national languages

A short history of publishing in Namibia (Reiner, Hillebrecht and Katjavivi, 1994) records that in the early days publishing in Namibia was entirely done by missionaries. The first book published in a Namibian language was a catechism in Nama, published in South Africa. The first book printed in Namibia was published in 1855, a mission translation into Khoekhoegowab of Luther’s catechism. The first publishing company in Namibia was established by Finnish missionaries in 1901, and for many years all publishing in African languages in Namibia was mainly of a religious nature. A commercial publishing company was established in 1911, so commercial publishing is well established in Namibia, but there was very little educational publishing in local languages. For the education of the indigenous population the mission societies provided all teaching and learning materials.

Figure 4.13 Percentages of pupils in Grades 1 to 3 taught in their home language, 1995

Source: A Profile of Education in Namibia, 1996: 26
With the implementation of Bantu education the control over native education was shifted to the South African Department of Bantu Education in January 1969. This restricted the mission presses to the publishing of religious materials, mainly in indigenous languages, which brought about an end to educational publishing in Namibia, as materials were mostly imported from South Africa.

The Inboorlingtaalburo of the Department of Bantu Education began publishing in indigenous languages in 1968. Reiner et al. (1994) note that:

Rooted in the apartheid system... its publishing activities were of necessity strongly linked to the shift in the official education policy for Blacks towards ethnic education, i.e. in the mother tongue, but despite the fact that this policy was based on ethnic divisions, the effect in publishing terms was that it significantly contributed to expanding skills in local language publishing.


Gamsberg Macmillan Publishers, today the leading publishers in Namibian national languages, was established in 1977. Gamsberg took over educational publishing from the Inboorlingtaalburo and formed the basis for a formal, organized and strong publishing capability for Namibian books and Namibian authors. After independence, Gamsberg Macmillan Publishers and Longman Namibia [formerly Maskew Miller Longman] were joined in the field of publishing by New Namibia Books, Out of Africa Publishers and most recently Africagraphix.

Of the 904 Namibian books in print in September 1994, 503 titles were in Namibian languages. However, despite a relatively long history of publishing in these languages there are a number of problems facing publishers of such materials. For example, the pool of language experts is very small so that the same people act as writers, editors, translators, subject advisory teachers and curriculum panel members. This can result in an unhealthy situation. A further major problem is the number or size of language groups. About 55 percent of learners in Namibian schools speak an Oshiwambo language; in addition about 10 percent are Khoekhoegowab speakers, but the numbers speaking some of the other main national languages are very small, as shown in the previous section. This contributes to high costs, since publishing for low numbers is very expensive.

Owing to budget constraints the Ministry of Basic Education and Culture [MBEC] had to cut back budget allocation for textbooks. This in itself had a serious effect on the publishing of books in Namibian languages. Under the apartheid education system the development of African languages was encouraged, even though for the wrong reasons, and books were purchased. After independence,
with English becoming the official language, much more is being spent on English language books.

Any author, publisher or individual is more than welcome to write, develop and print textbooks and supplementary material in the national languages. The only condition is that it should be based on the syllabus and must suit the development level of the target learner. Many commercial publishers develop materials for schools in the Namibian languages, for example *Penduka* published by Gamsberg Macmillan for Grade 1.

At present, many concerns have been raised about some of the materials published for schools, as some books are translations from English or Afrikaans and date from the pre-independence era, and are therefore not related to the background of the learners. Some books are word-for-word translations, in which the actual meaning of the text gets lost. Some words which are monosyllables in the original language (e.g. English) may be long in the African language. One of the objections raised is that materials and text-books are not culturally sensitive.

Government policy is one of openness and decentralization of development of materials to encourage the successful development of effective educational materials in Namibia. In order to improve the effectiveness of education, textbooks and learning materials should be more relevant to the needs of the pupils, especially as far as the mother tongues are concerned. It is a matter of great concern for the Ministry of Basic Education and Culture that sufficient quantities of suitable quality textbooks and learning materials should be developed and provided for schools. To ensure the suitability of textbooks and learning materials teachers are involved increasingly in the development of new materials.

It is the policy of the government to involve the private sector in the development, publishing and distribution of educational materials. Publishing is expensive, and to ensure the sustainability of educational publishing the government encourages and welcomes the involvement of commercial publishers. The government calls for public tenders and the commercial publishers have to bid for the provision and distribution of textbooks and educational materials by submitting competitive tenders.

It will not be possible for the government alone to establish full capacity for the production of instructional materials, because of financial constraints. The purchase of equipment would require capital expenditure, while the printing and binding of materials involve substantial recurrent costs. Therefore, the materials production unit at the National Institute for Educational Development (NIED) works in cooperation with commercial publishers and printers. It is within NIED’s capacity to produce materials such as reports, syllabi, questionnaires, etc. and
experimental or pilot materials. The printing capacity is limited at present to two Risograph printers and one or two high-speed photocopiers. Even so, this production capacity should be sufficient for the printing of short-runs (500–2,000 copies) of readers, and other materials.

The distribution of educational materials is also included in the tender. The government’s policy is to provide one book per learner, unless otherwise stated, as in the case of reference material, for example school dictionaries. Textbooks and educational materials are provided by the government free of charge to schools. Schools can utilize their development funds to acquire supplementary materials, and where books are lost or damaged, pupils have to replace the copy.

The government welcomes and encourages, by all possible means, the involvement of the private sector. The relationship is one of working together in a complementary manner, with the commercial publishers and printers providing expertise which is not necessarily available in government. Private-sector publishers have links with world-wide expertise in developing, publishing and marketing materials, and can render valuable service to the government.

Desk top publishing has become the universal technique in publishing. This reduces errors normally involved in typesetting, as camera ready copy is controlled in-house. Costs of external typesetting are also curtailed, and these savings can in turn be reflected in the retail price of books, and so passed on to customers. Specialist books, such as those for mathematics or science, which still need to be typeset by specialist printers, are expected to be more expensive, both to produce and in terms of their retail price.

**Strategies for minimizing costs**

Publishers are trying by all means possible to minimize costs. Low print runs are managed by using new technology such as Risograph machines, which can print high-quality materials in smaller numbers. These materials or books are still bound in normal fashion by printers.

The number of books needed in some languages is very low, and these books have to be subsidized in some way. To illustrate this, a Workbook in Oshindonga may be sold at about N$10, but of this price about N$2 is used by the publisher to subsidize books in languages with fewer speakers. This results in a price structure under which the price of a book is the same in all the main Namibian languages, regardless of the number of speakers of each language. (See Appendix 5 for a typical price-list of a publisher in Namibia). This policy of ‘cross-subsidization’ between languages
has been important in minimizing the price of materials in languages for which the market is very small.

In addition, the Ministry has introduced measures at school in an effort to expand the lifespan of books to at least five years. Schools are encouraged to use each book for five years before reordering that specific title. The book budget allocation dropped to a low of N$11.5m (US$2.6m) in 1994, but it has now started to show a steady increase; it was N$15.5m (US$3.5m) in 1995, and N$20m (US$4.5m.) in the 1996 financial year. Schools can no longer order books at will, as the budget is strictly limited. For example in the Windhoek Region the allocation is approximately N$22 (US$5) per primary learner, and N$40.87 (US$9.29) per secondary learner. This ensures that book orders stay within the budget allocation, as each region determines the amount per learner according to its circumstances.

The lack of cross-border cooperation using a common orthography where a common language is spoken in different countries contributes to the low number of learners speaking some languages in Namibia. If such cooperation with neighbouring countries were to be encouraged, it could boost publishing in these languages.

A recent report on publishing in Namibia (Coates, September 1995) made a number of suggestions of ways to strengthen publishing in national languages. The report concluded:

We have a current situation where publishers cannot commercially publish a great deal in the Namibian languages because of the low numbers of people, limited sales to the MBEC and virtually no sales to the general public. All of the publishers are enthusiastic but have difficulty in making most African Language publishing work commercially. On the other hand, the MBEC needs materials in the schools but they are frustrated in the development of teaching in African languages because not enough is being published.

The impasse described above will not be overcome simply by publishers asking the MBEC to commit more of their limited funds to the purchase of African language materials, or by the MBEC/NIED asking publishers to invest in publishing projects that will make a loss. Both partners have to be realistic.

Coates, 1995

Suggestions by the Association of Namibian Publishers include:

- The Ministry of Basic Education and Culture and the publishers together identify which languages are too small for commercial publishing. The publishers can then concentrate on the larger languages and make a concerted effort to build up an adequate body of teaching materials, literature, textbooks, etc. The Ministry should seek funding for developing and publishing materials in the smaller languages.
The Ministry could actively encourage teachers to make better use of existing materials in African languages other than textbooks, i.e. radio broadcast materials – news, current affairs, cultural accounts, songs, music – and newspaper articles.

**Costs of publishing and providing educational materials**

Information on the cost of printing, binding and supply of books is available from printers when a quotation is requested. The costs of publishers are higher than their quoted printing costs as their total costs include:

- development costs (payments for time of authors and artists, transport, accommodation, origination of materials, using either desktop publishing or other techniques)
- storage costs (for storage on premises or in warehouses, including the costs of insurance)
- distribution costs (transport and handling costs, plus insurance to place of delivery)
- capital investment on fixed property and overheads (only Gamsberg Macmillan Publishers have their own premises and employ a staff of 28).

Royalty payments to authors differ from author to author, as well as from language to language, and such information is regarded as confidential by publishers. However, one publisher estimated it as 10–12.5 percent on average. For editing, design and illustrations, publishers have their own market-related rates and professionals demand a higher rate than non-professional freelances. Market-related fees are paid for translations, while professionals have their own payment schedules. The pre-press costs, such as typesetting and production of camera ready copy, vary according to the rates which are negotiated per project, as in some cases the preparation is carried out in-house, and in other cases by freelances at market-related rates. Usually printing and binding is carried out on the basis of a printer’s quotation. Distribution and administrative overheads have been discussed above.

Print runs definitely affect costs. Anything below 500 books per print run becomes totally uneconomical. A print run of 500–1,000 is only just viable, but the publisher has to subsidize it substantially. To print at a reasonable price a print run of 2,000 and more is generally necessary. The estimated average unit cost per book varies with print run, size or format of book, quality of paper and cover, and the number of colours in text and cover. In publishing in
African languages the price range in Namibia is between N$30 and N$90 (US$6.82-20.45). Books in English are also within this price range.

No exact figures could be provided on the relationship between costs and market price. The percentage of costs covered by the price is calculated separately for each project, according to the circumstances, in order that as many titles as possible can be published. If publishing were to be confined to those titles likely to be profitable in the market, at an affordable price, it would be detrimental to minority national languages.

Coates [1995] illustrates this with a real example:

At Gamsberg Macmillan we are presently developing a new School Readiness course, which will be published in 12 languages and will consist of Work-books, Wall-charts and a Teacher’s Guide. The pre-production costs of the Teacher’s Guides are approximately N$8,000 for each language. For Oshindonga we may need 850 copies, which will cost around N$14,000 to print, producing a total cost for each book of N$26.17. For Setswana we only need 5 copies, but pre-production costs are still the same, the printing costs will be only a few hundred dollars, but this produces a unit cost of over N$1,600. This is a real example.

_Coates, 1995_

**Perceived benefits and effectiveness**

Many benefits can be expected from publishing materials in national languages in Namibia.

- The availability of materials in the mother tongues of the majority of the population will make communication easier for the speakers of those languages. Learners will feel more comfortable, as they will use a language known to them, and this can enhance participation in class and in discussions.
- To see their language in print will make mother-tongue speakers realize the importance of their culture.
- More people will be literate in their own language, which will enable the training of more teachers who can speak that language, and some of these teachers will also be available as Advisory Teachers.
- Printing in the national languages will contribute to an increase in the number of writers in a given language, and such an increase in writers will enable more materials to be produced.
- Having enough literate people in the various languages will mean enough manpower to develop the languages for use at different stages of education, for example the different
phases of school, college, technikons (polytechnic) and university. National languages can be developed, to have an up-to-date lexicon and special glossaries, as well as comprehensive dictionaries for higher level usage. Sustained development of the national languages in various subjects or courses can result in the languages becoming means of communication in science and technology, and every individual will have access to mother-tongue instruction at all levels.

- Different languages will be seen as equals, and people will be exposed to a variety of languages from which they can choose to study. Knowing the language of other individuals will help people to understand the culture and background of those individuals, and this can help to reduce tribal and ethnic conflicts, and as a result unity will be promoted in Namibia. Greater unity will in turn mean that greater tolerance and stability will prevail in the country, which will make it possible for the development of the country in all spheres of life, including in economic and political terms.

- Publishing in national languages will also make the publication of more books feasible, and this will make it possible for more people to have access to reading materials. Very often materials translated from other languages, such as English, may not be relevant to the cultural background of the target language.

- The readership basis can be broadened. The languages will no longer be restricted to the classrooms and churches, but will be read by the public at large.

- People closer to the grassroots will get opportunities to become involved in the development of written materials in the language.

- Publication in the national and local languages can also have material benefits. People can get employment in the production of materials. This will give them an income, and the availability of reading materials, together with the fact that the language is contributing to the welfare of some of its members is likely to enhance its status.

Conclusions

It is true that publishing in general, and more specifically in national and local languages, is expensive. If the publishing enterprise is based on sound business principles it must depend on supply and demand. The present situation of allocating a fixed sum
of money per learner, per grade, for the purchase of books and educational materials, is complicating the production of materials in African languages. The amount per learner is far below the price of most of the books available on the market, and as a result schools order books only to top up their existing stock. It is virtually impossible to order supplementary reading for an African language as schools can no longer afford it.

However, the government should be complimented on the measures taken when a new syllabus is implemented. All the funding for that endeavour is centrally budgeted for the whole country, and that does not affect the budgets of the regions. The question is how will schools purchase materials in African languages after the completion of the Basic Education Reform. The answer might lie in obtaining specific funding for the development and publishing of educational materials in national languages, such as national book development schemes, and here donor agencies and non-governmental organizations have a role to play.

The correct implementation of the language policy formulated by government, namely that each child will be taught through the mother tongue, at least in the first three years of schooling, and that the local language should be offered as a subject throughout all phases of schooling where there is demand for the language, should result in a broadened readership basis. A broadened readership basis will lead to an increase in demand, and should therefore result in increases in production and sales for those who have invested in the publishing industry. It is equally true that learners learn best in the language which they understand. At present there is no basis of support for learners at home, to help them to master English. Shortage of suitably qualified teachers and appropriate teaching materials remain the main problems which limit the use of national languages in education in Namibia. A primary objection to this is that due to the multilingual nature of Namibian society, it will require considerable resources to develop all the languages.

The publishing market is driven by demand from the government, and in particular the Ministry of Basic Education and Culture. This can be illustrated with an example quoted by Coates [1995]:

In the financial year ending 1992, 53% of Gamsberg Macmillan Publishers’ turnover was from Namibian language publishing. Two years later this was down to 30%. Last year [1994] things improved slightly to 38% but the signs are that this year [1995] will see another fall. In this period sales of Oshindonga books dropped from more than N$3 million (US$ 0.6m) in 1992, to less than N$1 million (US$ 0.23 m) in 1993, and only just passed the N$1 million mark last year [1994].
The absence of a reading culture and the lack of spare cash are also factors that contribute to the difficulties experienced in publishing in African languages. General books, literature and children’s books do not sell well or at all. There is also no market for the books outside Namibia, and this has worsened the situation.

Education is an expensive undertaking and in a developing country like Namibia, which is in the process of educational reform, there is an urgent need to explore ways of cost-reduction and cost-recovery. Measures to increase cost-effectiveness, like cost-saving, progressive cost-recovery measures, effective budgeting and sound financial management and control should be developed within the Ministry. This will result in more efficient development and utilization of educational materials.

References


Ministry Of Basic Education and Culture (1996), A Profile of Education in Namibia.


Ministry of Education and Culture [June 1993], The Language Policy for Schools: 1992 to 1996 and beyond.

Ministry of Education and Culture (1993), Toward Education for All: A development brief for education, culture, and training.


Acknowledgements

The author gives special thanks to Dr D.S.McCuny (BES Project) and Gamsberg Macmillan Publishers for their valuable contributions; also to Out of Africa Publishers, as well as officials of the Ministry of Basic Education and Culture.
Introduction and acknowledgements

This study has been achieved in the context of collaboration between the Association for the Development of Education in Africa (ADEA) and the Minister of Elementary Education and National Languages of Senegal.

Methods used in gathering information were based on:
- documentary research
- questionnaires
- informal discussion.

It must however be pointed out that the failure rate of the questionnaires was 95 percent. Nevertheless, we have been able to produce this work using the data collected.

The study does not pretend to master all the ins and outs of the costs and effectiveness of producing teaching material in national languages. However it describes and analyses some of the many facts used in the field of publication and distribution of this material.

The author would like to take this opportunity to offer most sincere thanks to Madame Sonja Diallo, Director of the Association of Research and Education for Development (ARED), who has spared no effort in giving us information concerning its structure, and indispensable support for the completion of this study. Thanks also go to all those who, near or far, have contributed significantly to the realization of this project.

Thus we hope that it may serve as a basis for other studies, or that in the context of everyday work it may help resolve the innumerable difficulties encountered in the field of publishing and distributing didactic material in national languages.
The social, economic and educational context

Senegal covers an area of 197,000 sq. km. in West African. It is bordered to the north by the Islamic Republic of Mauritania, to the east by the Republic of Mali, to the west by the Atlantic Ocean and to the south by the Republics of Guinea-Bissau and Guinea-Conakry. Most of the country forms a basin, low-lying in the west and slightly higher in the east. The climate is marked by two quite distinct seasons: a rainy season lasting three to four months and a dry season lasting eight to nine months. In the south the vegetation is patchy high forest which gradually gives way to sparsely wooded grassland in the central region and thorn bush-covered steppe in the north. There are four major rivers: the Senegal, the Saloum, the Gambia and the Casamance. In addition to these permanent waterways there are others that are dry in the dry season but soon fill up during the rainy season.

On 27 May 1988 Senegal had a population of 6,896,808; and in mid-1993 the estimated population was 7,948,000. The predominant features of this population are its extreme youth, rapid growth and uneven distribution over the country. The population grew at a rate of 2.8 percent per annum between 1980 and 1992. The main linguistic and ethnic groups are the Wolof, Serer, Pulaar, Mandinka and Soninke.

More than 70 percent of the population is engaged in agriculture. The principal crops are groundnuts, millet, rice, cotton, cassava and sugar cane. Animal husbandry is improving since the rainfall has increased. Despite a number of difficulties, the fishing sector is on the way to becoming the country’s leading source of wealth. The industrial sector (oil refining and phosphates) plays a major role in the country’s balance of payments. The World Bank estimate of GDP per capita in 1994 was US$600. The contribution of agriculture and industry to GDP is estimated at 23 percent and 18 percent respectively.

The literacy rate among adults is about 32 percent, 45 percent for men and 19 percent for women. The school enrolment ratio at the primary and elementary level is 58.5 percent, 68 percent for boys and 49 percent for girls. In secondary education, the gross school enrolment ratio is 19 percent for males and 10 percent for females.

Language policy

Senegal has 28 languages, all belonging to two groups from the Niger-Congo family: the West Atlantic group and the Mandingo group. Two of these languages, Mandinka and Pulaar, are widely
spoken in West Africa and Pulaar is spoken also in Central Africa. It should be noted that these two languages, plus Wolof, are on the provisional list of inter-African languages drawn up by the meeting of experts in Niamey for the transcription and harmonization of African languages (UNESCO 1981). They also have, along with Soninke, the status of national languages in the neighbouring states of The Gambia (Mandinka, Pulaar, Wolof), Guinea-Bissau (Mandinka, Pulaar), Mali (Mandinka, Pulaar, Soninke) and Mauritania (Pulaar, Soninke, Wolof).

Among all the languages of Senegal, six (Wolof, Pulaar, Serer, Diola, Mandinka and Soninke) have the status of national languages. It took a considerable time to reach agreement on the script of these languages, which were the subject of various legal texts on linguistic segmentation. Government decrees in 1971 and 1972 established the national languages in Senegal as follows:

- **Wolof**: the Wolof ethnic group comprises 43.7 percent of the population, but the Wolof language is spoken by 70.9 percent of Senegalese.
- **Pulaar**: the Fula represent 23 percent of the population, but Pulaar is spoken by 24.1 percent of the population.
- **Serer and Soninke**: these ethnic groups represent 14.8 percent and 3 percent respectively of the total population. The percentages speaking the two languages are about the same.
- **Diola**: the Diola comprise 5.5 percent of the population, and the language is spoken by 6.2 percent.
- **Mandinka**: Mandinka is actually spoken by 13.7 percent of the population, although the Mandingo ethnic group represents only 4.6 percent of the population.

This variety of languages makes Senegal a multilingual country. But colonial and post-colonial traditions have failed to exploit this linguistic diversity. French was, and still is, the language of education, government and administration, despite political rhetoric encouraging the promotion of cultural values.

The year 1971 is a landmark in the definition and implementation of government language policy with the promulgation of Decree No 71-566 of 21 May 1971 on the transcription of national languages. This states that the government intends to make the six national languages listed above instruments of education:

The government intends to introduce national languages in Senegalese education from the primary school to the university... In each district the language of the majority must be taught and every pupil must be taught to write in his mother tongue.

Much was done to provide a framework for effectively implementing this policy but it was only in 1979 that the first
experimental classes were opened. The remainder of this section describes the current status in each level of education.

**Pre-school education**

Pre-school education was established in the regional capitals in October 1971. The medium of instruction was intended to be either Wolof or the dominant language in the area. Pre-school classes were set up in both the public and the private sectors. Recent assessment of pre-school educational revealed the existence of a whole range of educational, technical and social problems.

- There is a lack of adequate teacher training.
- Different media of instruction are used in the two sectors (French in the private sector and national languages in the public sector). It was only in 1984 that national languages were extended to the private sector.
- Since the language of social mobility is French, some parents still hesitate to send their children to classes where national languages are used.

**Elementary education**

There have been two experiments in elementary education using national languages in teaching. One of these involved the use of television in schools. In 1979 three Wolof classes were opened in Dakar. In 1982 two Pulaar classes, one Serer class and one Diola class were opened in Matam, Podor, Diarere and Bignona respectively. None of these used television. Ten classes using television were opened around the country in October 1978. For technical reasons it has not been possible to conduct experiments using the other two national languages (Mandinka and Soninke) at this level of teaching.

In general, experimentation with national languages in elementary education has experienced similar difficulties to pre-schooling. These include:

- lack of adequate teaching material
- use of the same pedagogical tools as French for the teaching of national languages.

**Secondary education**

There has been no such experimentation in secondary education. Nevertheless some initiatives are being taken by the Department of Basic Education and National Languages. A key feature of these initiatives is training secondary school pupils in the transcription of national languages which has made it possible to open national language clubs in a number of secondary schools in Dakar.
University education

In the Department of Linguistics in the Faculty of Letters and Humanities, individual national-language courses are given to students who speak those languages. These students are enrolled in other departments (English, Spanish, Arabic, Philosophy etc.) but opt for these national languages as a second language. Only four of the six national languages are taught in the Department of Linguistics: Wolof, Diola, Serer and Pulaar. The teaching lays particular stress on orthography and grammar since the students already speak the languages.

Non-formal education

The promotion of national languages is inseparable from literacy. This sector has gone through three main stages:

1960–1970

The first stage was marked above all by the use of French in literacy programmes.

1970–1990

The second stage saw the creation of the Department for the Promotion of Literacy and the development of educational and institutional structures, notably with the organization of Regional Literacy Offices and Divisions. During this period stress was also laid on designing and developing introductory programmes for reading and writing national languages, aimed at both the population at large and state employees. Two methods were used in the various literacy programmes: a) functional selective literacy, and b) mass literacy. Alongside government efforts, various companies involved in rural activities also made a major contribution in the area of promoting literacy. These included: the Société d’aménagement et d’exploitation du delta (SAED), the Société de développement des fibres textiles (SODEFITEXT), the Société de mise en oeuvre de la Casamance (SOMIVAC), the Projet de développement de l’élevage au Sénégal Oriental (PDESO) etc.

Post-1990

Following the World Conference on Education for All, which was held in March 1990 at Jomtien in Thailand, a new wind blew through the educational policy of Senegal and indeed other African countries. In April 1991, a year after Jomtien, the President of the Republic of Senegal set up a Ministry responsible for Literacy and the Promotion of National Languages, which four years later became the Ministry of Basic Education and National Languages.
In October 1993 the Ministry of Basic Education and National Languages drew up an action plan comprising five major objectives:

- to reduce the illiteracy rate by 5 percent by the year 2000
- to increase the number of literates in Senegal by simultaneously reducing disparities (above all between men and women)
- to consolidate, inform and undertake campaigns to mobilize human resources
- to train literacy trainers
- to sustain literacy, by developing an environment in which literacy in national languages is widespread.

The priority in this action plan is to reduce the illiteracy rate each year, and to achieve a 5 percent reduction by 2004. In 1996, a so-called ‘faire-faire’ (enabling) policy was initiated by the Department. This means that from now on it is up to those responsible for delivery on the ground to design and implement a literacy programme. This freedom of action will be exercised in accordance with guidelines set out in a manual of procedure prepared by the technical services of the ministerial department.

The role of the Department in the ‘enabling’ policy will be limited essentially to following up, monitoring, coordinating and assessing the performance contracts signed with the practitioners on the ground. In August 1995, with the aim of better coordinating the country’s educational policy, the Department organized a colloquium on basic education at the University of Saint-Louis. This was attended by 235 experts from the formal and non-formal education sectors from all over the country. By making concrete proposals this meeting gave an impetus to the country’s educational policy, especially in the areas of pre-school and elementary education, and the promotion of literacy. This impetus should be reflected in the enrolment of girls in school and the full-scale introduction of national languages in the educational system, since they have not yet been fully introduced.

**Policy on publishing in national languages**

Knowing how to read and write adequately in national languages is all very well. But the taste for reading has to be sustained, so as to allow the development of creativity. If such an environment is not created new literates will relapse back to where they started.

Albert Faye, trainer at the Dakar Teacher Training College expressed it well in his report on the use of national languages in the educational system (1992). Speaking of the experience of the missionaries at Fadiouth he said: ‘But they would soon become
discouraged, because there is no book in Serer that would enable them to develop their knowledge.

The situation thus described underlines the importance of publishing and the creation of a literate environment for the newly literate. It is not possible to identify a government policy in the area of publishing educational materials in national languages. In fact in Senegal production of such material has so far been the work of local agencies. This situation results from the context in which the various literacy programmes have been launched, with over a hundred agencies operating with very different status and widely varying facilities. Literacy teaching continues to be characterized by individual and autonomous approaches. The result is that there are quite a considerable number of titles, including language textbooks, arithmetic books, post-literacy readers and magazines. The educational and physical qualities of these vary markedly. In addition, there are other disparities, in terms of the level of topics covered and the capacity to meet the various or specific teaching needs of given groups.

The predominance of Wolof-speakers, who represent 70 percent of the population, may explain why almost 80 percent of the output of most agencies which produce materials in national languages is in Wolof. It should be noted that the lowest output is of works in the Diola, Soninke and Mandinka languages. The precise figures may vary from one producing agency to another. Thus the output of ARED (Associates in Research and Education for Development) is dominated by works in Pulaar. The same situation is to be found at Aide et Action, a French non-governmental organization. The explanation for this dominance is the fact that the target populations of these agencies are overwhelmingly Pulaar speaking. Since the majority of the books produced are intended for specific markets, the profit margins are not always important.

Some organizations produce small quantities of materials (150 in the case of the Autopromotion des Femmes de la Grande Côte project), others much larger ones (90,000 for the former ‘1000 classes’ project). Big producers such as ARED, TOSTAN, SIL (Société Internationale de Linguistique), DAEB (Direction de l’Alphabétisation et de l’Education de Base) etc. have accumulated large stocks.

However this output often remains limited and unknown to those who are intended to benefit from it. It is not backed up by a distribution network, and so is often difficult to obtain. This is one of the great gaps in the area of the production of educational materials. The fact is that there is no large-scale organization that keeps a list of the various publications in this area. Moreover, none of the textbooks is sold in any of the country’s large book-shops. Thus, in the absence of information on what has already been
published, there is a proliferation of producers of language textbooks, with the result that the wheel is endlessly being reinvented. The same agencies are often responsible both for production and for selling their products, with their only promotional weapons being bulletins published by a few programmes with very limited circulation and distribution, for example (ARED, SIL, TOSTAN) etc.

There are very few fully fledged publishing houses. Agencies such as ARED, SIL and the Cheikh Anta Diop IFAN Publishing House specialize in production of materials, but virtually all these agencies use local printers for their publishing needs, which increases their costs, which are then reflected in their selling prices. Their publications, mostly textbooks, are sold to the target populations at subsidized prices. Realistic pricing is not practised in this area, since in most cases the selling price only takes into account printing costs. The other components of costs – royalties, typesetting, page layout, illustration and distribution – are usually disregarded.

The fact that sales are subsidized makes it possible for some educational providers, especially those that are state-owned, to replenish their stocks of educational materials. This has been the experience of PAIS, (Programme d’Alphabétisation Intensive au Sénégal). Despite this, however, according to a study by the Caravane de l’Alphabétisation au Sénégal, entitled Les Publications en Langues Nationales au Sénégal, (1995) some target audiences find the textbooks very expensive and thus beyond their means.

So far, the publishing equipment used by producing agencies is very basic. It amounts to no more than a computer with an ordinary or laser printer, software for national languages, photocopying machines, binding equipment etc. Only the Cheikh Anta Diop IFAN Publishing House has complete printing facilities.

**Strategies for minimizing costs**

The previous section observed that the state has not yet introduced a real policy in the area of publishing educational materials in national languages. This section therefore makes some proposals for strategies in the light of information collected in a survey of publishers and other agencies, conducted for this study.

Despite the fact that prices are subsidized by some agencies, some target audiences still see the products as too expensive. Many factors need to be taken into account, in order to develop strategies for reducing the costs of publishing literacy and post-literacy textbooks. These factors include:

- lack of material and financial resources in most of the organizations that design and publish such books
• lack of personnel with publishing skills
• high cost of raw materials (inputs) which raise publishing costs, which in turn impacts on sale prices;
• lack of publishing houses specialized in producing in national languages.

This general situation calls for further action by the state. What is needed is action to:
• extend state subsidies to all sectors of production through partnership agreements
• gradually provide operators in the sector with adequate equipment
• make available to producers a wide range of state-of-the-art information on publishing.

**Subsidies**

A policy of providing subsidies might involve:
• state support in the area of the training of production and publishing personnel
• facilitating access to such inputs as ink and paper
• minimizing taxes on materials used in production, such as computers, printers etc.
• support for publishing (e.g. the Projet d’Appui au Plan d’Action du Ministère de l’Education de Base).

**Equipment**

To develop book publishing and promote the establishment of a literate environment, it will be necessary to improve production equipment. This will above all involve equipping educational resource centres all over the country with computers, software for national languages, photocopiers and binding materials. Before making this equipment available to organizations, it would be sensible to train people in the use and maintenance of such equipment. That is essential if the equipment is to be used to the best effect.

**Establishment of publishing houses to produce materials in national languages**

The lack of organizations specializing solely in the publication of educational materials poses many difficulties in promoting the provision of books in national languages. Despite the efforts made by such organizations as ARED, the Lutheran Mission, the Société Internationale de Linguistique (SIL), the Institut National d’Etude et d’Action pour le Développement de l’Education (INEADE,
National Institute for the Study and Development of Education) and the Institut Fondamental d’Afrique Noire (IFAN), much remains to be done to make educational materials in national languages available in sufficient quantity and quality, and at prices that the people for whom they are intended can afford.

This new structure should be established at both national and sub-regional level.

**AT THE NATIONAL LEVEL**

As stated previously, there is a need to strengthen the educational resources centres so that they can absorb all that is produced. Furthermore, attempts should be made to convince publishers and printers of the usefulness, even the absolute necessity, of publishing educational materials in national languages.

One possible strategy would be to invite operators, printers and publishers to take part together in raising the capital required to set up a future publishing house specializing in national languages.

**AT THE SUB-REGIONAL LEVEL**

The fact that Senegal shares some national languages with neighbouring countries, such as The Gambia, Mauritania, Mali and Guinea, could facilitate the future development of cooperation in the area of publishing in national languages. The main requirement would be to discuss with interested parties in those countries the practicalities of setting up a sub-regional printing press to produce educational materials in national languages. The volume of production that such a press might generate for all the member countries would help reduce production costs and sales prices. In the last analysis, the development of South-South cooperation is an urgent necessity.

**Costs of publishing and supplying**

The real cost of an educational textbook in national languages involves both design and publication. This section discusses the costs incurred both in the development and design stage and at the production stage. It draws on information collected in a survey of agencies involved in publishing in national languages. This shows that, whatever their selling price, most textbooks are generally sold at below their real cost.

*Design and development*

The components that are involved in the design of an educational textbook can be summarized under three headings:
1. **Analysis of Local Needs and Conditions**

This may require an interdisciplinary team, with the task of designing and administering questionnaires intended to collect information needed for designing a textbook suitable for local conditions. This has a cost in terms of the time of the team conducting such research.

2. **Editing and Illustration**

The design team also includes the authors, editors and illustrators, who have the task of translating the needs identified on the ground into training objectives and producing materials to meet these needs. All these activities involve costs that have to be met.

3. **Typesetting, Pilot Tests and Correction**

After writing and illustration, the document must be typed or typeset. The first draft should be tested on the ground, where the study was conducted, in order to validate it. Once validated, the texts and illustrations must be corrected and the document made ready for publication.

This section has summarized the operations to be carried out before publication in order to show that there are a number of costs that are sometimes neglected. The list could be expanded. ARED, for example, carries out the development of materials in several stages:

a) identification of local conditions and needs;
b) establishment of a team responsible for research, writing, translating, and development of any specialized vocabulary;
c) typesetting and first proof-reading;
d) pilot testing;
e) design of page layout;
f) second proof-reading;
g) illustrations;
h) reading aloud for evaluation;
i) third proof-reading; and
j) final preparation: it is this last stage that leads directly to printing.

The survey conducted for this study suggested that the total design and development costs may range from 500,000 to 1,200,000 CFA francs. Depending on the manner of operation of each organization, the total development costs could well be much higher. That is certainly the case for ARED, which pays monthly salaries to its operatives for typesetting, page layout, proofreading, translation and pilot testing. In contrast, illustrators and linguists are paid as consultants; the author receives a direct payment instead of royalties.
In many agencies all the design work is done by staff employed by the organization, without any individual copyright. Ultimately the document belongs to the organization, and the authors and designers receive only their monthly salaries. Such is the case with the DAEB, ADEF/Afrique, INEADE and ARED. But if personnel outside the organization are involved, they have to be paid, on the basis of a contract that specifies fees. Authors and other individuals who have textbooks to be published often sign such a contract with the publisher.

**Publishing**

Generally speaking, the cost of publishing educational materials in national languages includes three elements:

- composition
- printing
- binding.

It should be noted at the outset, that most of the organizations producing educational materials in national languages commonly use printing services for their printing and binding. Some agencies have adequate equipment for production and consequently carry out some of the operations in-house. A few, such as ARED, that have computer-assisted production (CAP) facilities, perform all the tasks associated with composition. Other organizations on the other hand sub-contract work to a printer, and thus incur a great deal of expense.

**Composition**

Typesetting, inserting illustrations into the text and page layout are the main operations involved in composition. A survey by D.C. Smith Jr. (Smith, 1977) showed that the ‘composition’ element generally declines as a proportion of total costs as the print run is increased, because the type is set only once. A study by D. Claren carried out for an international seminar on appropriate technology in education [held in Nairobi, Kenya, in 1983] suggested that these costs represent between 41 and 55 percent of total production costs. Such a ratio is found in many publishing houses.

Since printers often lack staff skilled in typesetting and proof-reading documents in national languages they are often forced to sub-contract or take on experts to do the job. Furthermore, the use of a scanner for illustrations constitutes a not insignificant cost. This reality is well demonstrated in a study by the Caravane de l’Alphabétisation au Sénégal [1995] which shows that typesetting and page layout account for 81.25 percent of the total costs of production. This situation observed in publishing establishments...
clearly shows that organizations that lack production facilities, and have to sub-contract work have to face substantial costs.

**Printing**

The time when books or other materials are actually printed is when the production and printing materials come into operation, in other words, when inputs of ink, paper etc. and energy (electricity for operating the machinery) are required. The organizations approached in the survey generally observed that printing is the most expensive operation in publishing. The study carried out by the Caravane de l’Alphabétisation shows that printing costs amount to close to 93.75 percent of total production costs, and of these, the cost of raw materials (inputs) account for about 75 percent. The study also showed that the amount of paper and ink used increases in proportion to the size of the print run.

Figures obtained from one publisher (see Figure 5.1) show that the unit cost of publishing 1,000 copies of a 32-page textbook in national languages is 576 CFA francs. Printing 2,000 copies of the same textbook would result in a unit cost of 512 CFA francs.

Figures from another publisher showed that the unit cost of a 68-page textbook amounts to 2,630 CFA francs, if the print run is only 300 copies, 1,804 CFA francs for a run of 500 copies and 1,185 CFA francs for a run of 1,000 copies, while a 100-page textbooks costs 3,629 CFA francs for a run of 300 copies, 2,542 CFA francs for a run of 500 copies and 1,656 CFA francs for a run of 1,000 copies.

This demonstrates that the size of the print run has a strong impact on the unit cost of a textbook. The explanation for this relationship is the substantial time required for typesetting and preparation for printing, including the time taken in setting up the

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure 5.1 Costs for printing books in national languages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1000 copies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000 copies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64 pages</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
machinery for printing. Experience in printing suggests that this preparation or ‘set-up’ time is the same for any print run, which means that the cost of preparation time does not vary with the size of the print run. Extremely small print runs cannot fully cover these set-up costs, unless the printer raises the selling price in order to cover all the costs of production. On the other hand, long print runs make it possible not only to cover production costs, including costs of preparation, but also to make substantial profits.

It is difficult for the layman to understand such a system. That is why, apart from inputs, preparation time has a great impact on the unit costs of printing educational textbooks in national languages, because of the small numbers involved. Consequently, the total cost of printing will naturally have an effect on the selling price of such books. Sale prices also vary according to the production techniques used by different publishers.

The intensive literacy programme in Senegal (PAIS) sells its textbooks for 500 CFA francs each, which is a subsidized price. The sale price of books produced by ARED ranges between 300 and 2,400 CFA francs. These sale prices set by these various organizations are below the real costs of development, design and publication, for the simple reason that these books are produced with the help of subsidies from funding agencies.

**BINDING**

The whole process of finishing or binding involves four elements: folding, gathering, stitching and trimming: The proportion of the total production costs accounted for by the finishing costs does not vary greatly with the numbers produced, as the following figures, taken from Smith’s (1977) study, show:

- 8.2 percent for 1,000 copies
- 13.6 percent for 5,000 copies
- 13.6 percent for 10,000 copies.

The conclusion of this section, on the basis of the examples given in this study, is that the average cost of textbooks depends on several factors, including:

- the number of pages
- the size of the print run
- the number of colours.

The survey suggests that on the basis of these factors the unit costs of textbooks in national languages vary between 512 CFA francs and 3,629 CFA francs.

However, the determination of the actual selling price is a different matter. This is governed by the aims of each organization. In general the market price of educational materials in national
languages range from 300 CFA francs per copy, to 2,400 CFA francs. According to the study by the Caravane de l’Alphabétisation (1995) prices vary as follows:

- for novels and other specific titles, between 500 and 6,000 francs
- for literacy materials, between 300 and 3,000 francs.

As can be seen, costs and market prices vary on the basis of many factors mentioned above. It should also be noted that the majority of publications are in the six national languages laid down by the state. However, there has recently been a flowering of a number of other languages, known as local languages. This output is still at the manuscript stage.

As regards books published in French, which are widely used in classes in the formal educational system, it must be observed that prices also vary according to the number of pages, colours etc. Observed prices range from 500 CFA francs per copy to 1,500 CFA francs.

Another question is whether publishing locally is better than publishing abroad. The first point is that no costs are incurred for importing books if they are published locally. However, when it comes to a matter of the latest technology, it may be that some publishers are prepared to risk these costs for the sake of obtaining top quality products. But if the content is well adapted to national realities, it is much more economic to publish these books locally.

**Benefits and effectiveness**

Making educational materials in national languages available to newly literate populations promotes the participation of such people in the socio-economic and cultural development of their country, and also encourages new initiatives designed to transform the environment and enable new literates to take their fate into their own hands. The development of the publication of books in national languages will contribute effectively to making those languages part of the written tradition.

**Educational benefits**

Being able to read and write one’s own language is already a benefit in itself. But consolidating and developing achievements in writing, reading and arithmetic provide a further benefit for newly literate people. This benefit enables them to enter and communicate in the privileged world of the written word, and helps them to spend less time in class, thereby enabling them very rapidly to become independent learners. Publishers and other agencies
responsible for producing these materials also derive considerable benefit from the activity. It enables them to experiment and popularize educational approaches in priority sectors.

**Socio-economic benefits**

The production of educational textbooks in national languages in areas of socio-economic activity provides technical support for newly literate people. These materials enable them to invest and develop productive sectors such as agriculture, fishing, crafts etc. The technical and practical information contained in these textbooks supports them in improving, raising and marketing what they produce. Better knowledge of productive sectors could increase monetary incomes, and enhance satisfaction of basic needs such as health, food, clothing etc. Socially, it will help people to keep themselves, their clothes and their environment clean. Thus it could help to guarantee health which is the key to making people more productive.

**Cultural and political advantages**

A great African thinker, Hamadou Hampâté Ba, used to say ‘in Africa, when an old man dies, it is a library that burns.’ That is why preserving oral traditions and customs, the names of medicinal plants etc. in writing constitutes an inexhaustible treasury for future generations.

Furthermore, since national languages are shared with a number of neighbouring states, encouraging their use is also a way of fighting against exclusion and facilitating sub-regional integration. The development of writing promotes communication among peoples and consolidates social cohesion which is a prerequisite for strengthening democracy.

The question we must ask is whether these benefits are measurable on the ground. Although they are not yet measurable, they can be perceived, and evidence of their existence is becoming stronger all the time. With the various programmes that are currently being developed at the local level, and the various initiatives that have been taken, there are grounds for believing that by the dawn of the third millennium the benefits will be not only perceived but recognized even more strongly.

Today, newly literate people are already managing income-generating activities and writing about them in national languages. Programmes to raise awareness of various scourges such as AIDS and sexually transmitted diseases are having an impact on people.
Conclusion

The publication and supply of educational materials in national languages is very expensive, given all the development and production costs. Furthermore, the need for translation often increases the difference between the cost of producing books in national languages and in French. Production in national languages is also often limited because of the lack of well-structured distribution networks.

It is true that investments in education do not produce demonstrable results immediately. Might this hinder the growth of the production and supply of educational materials for learners? We think that on the contrary it is demonstrated that the book is, and still remains, a supreme educational support for both teachers and learners. It is now vital to seek ways and means of minimizing production costs, and thus guaranteeing a constant supply of educational materials that can underpin learning and increase its effectiveness.

For educational policy it is also desirable to minimize the cost of education per learner. The current average cost per learner in Senegal is around 10–15,000 CFA francs in the non-formal public education sector. The range may be even wider in some private sector establishments. At present, the effectiveness of educational materials could be measured by the following results:

- faster learning (with the help of the teacher)
- education that does not require a very high academic level for the facilitators. Today, the level is between the primary school leaving certificate and the secondary school leaving examination, the baccalaureate.

In order to be able to analyse cost-effectiveness it would be relevant to assess the social, economic and financial gains generated by newly-literate individuals who have completed a literacy course and entered productive life. A framework is needed to enable the government to analyse the cost-effectiveness of its educational and language policy. Such a framework would provide indicators of the costs of investing in the training of a learner and the expected results of that training. Such an exercise would enable the government to make a proper assessment of the benefits of the investments in terms of a comparison between costs and results obtained.

In future, strategies for developing policy on publishing in national languages could focus on three areas:

**Developing the Profession of Author**

Encouraging authors and writers in national languages, (perhaps
under the auspices of the Union of Senegalese Writers in National Languages, USLAN) could involve the awarding of prizes, awards and scholarships. The development of training programmes with lectures, courses and round-tables devoted to literary creation and the preparation of educational textbooks could also make a significant contribution. Protecting author’s work by means of copyright could also encourage production and local publishing.

**STRENGTHENING EDUCATIONAL RESOURCE CENTRES**

The existence, throughout the country, of educational resources centres, which are the fruit of a partnership between the state, UNESCO and the Martin Luther King Unesco Club, is already an achievement. But they need to be sustained in the diversification of materials on such key sectors as agriculture, public health, home economics, vocational training etc.

**ESTABLISHING INDUSTRIAL BOOK PRODUCTION UNITS**

This strategy could take the form of providing modest amounts of capital, at reasonable rates, for the creation or upgrading of publishing and distribution houses. The production of educational and literary works faces the burden of extra costs because of the need to import paper. A feasibility study for the development of a local paper industry would therefore be sensible, since availability of locally produced paper would reduce publishing costs. Another way of reducing publishing costs could be to provide special assistance to local printers. This could take the form of reducing customs tariffs on the import of inputs (spare parts, paper, ink, adhesives, offset film etc.).

The book industry is unique. All industries have wide-ranging economic relations with other sectors, but that part of the book industry devoted to publishing in national languages has numerous social, educational, cultural and even psychological links with the community, because of its relations with national wellbeing and community spirit.

**References**


Smith, D. Jr. [1977], *The Economics of Book Publishing in Developing Countries*. Paris, UNESCO.


The social, economic and educational context

Zambia is a country in the central South African region. It is surrounded by eight countries: Zimbabwe, Namibia, Botswana, Angola, Tanzania, Malawi, Mozambique and the Democratic Republic of the Congo, formerly Zaire. Zambia gained her independence from Britain in 1964. The country is divided into nine provinces: Southern, Western, North Western, Copperbelt, Luapula, Northern, Eastern and Lusaka. The provinces are further subdivided into 62 districts which are used for administrative purposes.

Zambia has many languages which are spoken across the country. There are 72 dialects which can be grouped into the 21 most commonly used language/dialects. The latest statistical information shows that the proportions of the population speaking the 21 most commonly used languages/dialects are as follows:

- Bemba 29.7%
- Tonga 11.0%
- Nyanja 7.8%
- Lozi 6.4%
- Chewa 5.7%
- Nsenga 4.3%
- Tumbuka 2.9%
- Lala 2.4%
- Kaonde 2.3%
- Lamba 2.2%
- Lunda 2.0%
- Luvale 1.8%
- Ngoni 1.7%
- Lenje 1.6%
- Namwanga 1.4%
- Bisa 1.2%
- Mambwe 1.2%
- English 1.1%
- Ila 0.9%
- Lungu 0.7%
- Senga 0.7%
- others 11.0%

These 21 language/dialects are grouped into seven major languages, which are used as the main means of communication, for example on the radio, and in schools, where they are used as the medium of instruction or taught as subjects. The seven major languages are: Bemba, Nyanja, Tonga, Lozi, Lunda, Luvale and Kaonde.
In 1995 the population of Zambia was estimated at about 9.5 million people. Of this figure, 4.8 million are males while 4.7 million are females. The average population growth rate is 3.2 percent. The latest World Bank estimates show that in 1995 Zambia had a GNP per capita of $350.

The total primary school enrolment in 1995 was 1,506,702, of which 47.8 percent were boys and 52.2 percent were girls. The total number of schools in 1995 was 3,610 Primary schools, 415 Basic and 186 Secondary schools. The national literacy rate was 56.4 percent; the rate for males was 62.7 percent, while for females the rate was only 50.1 percent.

**Language policy**

Zambia has an official language policy, which was laid down at the time of independence, but in practice the country’s language policy has evolved in response to changing conditions. When the country became independent in 1964 it was realized that it would not be feasible for the country to adopt any one of the 72 dialects or local languages as a national language, and none of the seven major languages was spoken by sufficient people to be adopted as the national language for the country as a whole. Because of the complexities of the situation, the government decided that English should be adopted as the official language of communication on all official matters, and should be the official medium of instruction in schools. However for practical purposes one of the seven major languages is used for most forms of communication in each region, although in some regions there may be two or three local languages adopted as a medium of communication, while at local levels, many different dialects may be spoken and used.

The seven major languages are used, for example, during public rallies where interpretation is needed for a speaker who is not able to speak the local language of the area. They are also used in schools by teachers, when trying to explain a concept that children cannot understand in the English language. In most cases where interpretation is needed, it is provided in the main dialect spoken in the area, rather than the language that has been officially adopted in the region. For example, the official language adopted in Southern Province is Tonga, but a teacher in Nainwala District of Southern Province may speak to children in class in Ila, which is one of the dialects of the Tonga language, while an interpreter at a public rally in Gwembe district of Southern Province will interpret in We, which is the Tonga dialect spoken in that district.

The official language policy of the Ministry of Education, at the time of independence, stated that the medium of instruction in all
levels of education should be English, and the local Zambian language of each province would be taught in schools in that province as a subject. This policy meant that all children entering school should be taught in English from their first day in school up to the time when they leave school.

The history of this policy is that at independence, when it became clear that it was not possible to adopt any of the seven major languages as the national language and as the medium of instruction for the whole country, English was thought to be the only neutral language that could be used for all official purposes, and as the medium of instruction in all schools, without causing problems. The choice of any of the seven major languages would have created problems of implementation, since all the languages were at the same level of development. There were significant differences between the major languages in terms of the number of people able to speak each language, but no one language had sufficient support to be universally adopted in all regions.

For educational purposes however, the official policy did create problems. Although teachers were expected to use English in their lessons, they could not manage to do this in practice, as most if not all pupils entering Grade 1 could hardly speak English, let alone read or write in English. Teachers ended up teaching pupils in both English and the local language. This meant that the teacher would switch between the two languages during the lesson as he/she saw fit. This was done in order to ensure that pupils were able to understand what was being taught, when explained in the local language of the area.

The problem that arose in most cases was that if the teacher was not able to speak the local language, as was often the case, the pupils suffered as they could not follow what the teacher was trying to teach them. The teacher, because of his/her inability to speak the local language/dialect, would be required to learn it quickly, in order to assist the pupils.

Another practical problem was that in some cases the local Zambian language taught in the school was not the local language of the area where the school was situated. The teacher posted to a school might not even speak the language officially adopted in that province, and certainly could not speak the local dialect used in that area. In such cases, although the officially adopted language should be the language taught in the school, he/she would not be able to do this effectively, being unable to speak the local language used by the people in the area. When such situations arose it was clearly very difficult for the teacher and the learners, in that there was a complete breakdown of communication. The teacher ended up teaching in English and pupils merely listened without understanding.
Teachers at teacher training colleges were taught the principles of how to teach languages at school in English. This course was intended to prepare the trainee teachers to teach Zambian languages, and during their training they were expected to learn the local Zambian language spoken in the province where the teacher training college was situated, as well as any other Zambian languages that they might choose. The trainee teacher was given the opportunity to learn different languages, during his/her training, but then expected to repeat the experience if she/he was posted to a school where the local language was neither the teacher's own mother tongue, nor the language learned at training college.

The Ministry of Education has now adapted the official language policy, and articulated it in such a way that teaching in the local languages is permitted, in the belief that this will improve standards of comprehension and learning. The current policy document observes that:

Zambia has had almost thirty years experience of using English as the medium of instruction, from Grade 1 onwards. Children who have very little contact with English outside the school have been required to learn how to read and write through and in this language, which is quite alien to them. They have also been required to learn the content of other subjects through this medium. The experience has not been altogether satisfactory. The fact that initial reading skills are taught in and through a language that is unfamiliar to the majority of children is believed to be a major contributory factor to the backwardness in learning, since from the outset the child has difficulty in associating the printed forms of words with their real, underlying meaning. On the other hand, there is ample evidence that children learn literacy skills more easily and successfully through their mother tongue, and that they are subsequently able to transfer these skills quickly and easily to English or another language. Successful first language learning is, in fact, believed to be essential for the successful acquisition of literacy in a second language, and for learning the content of other subjects through the second language. In the light of these considerations, all pupils will be given an opportunity to learn initial basic skills of reading and writing in a local language; whereas English will remain as the official medium of instruction.

Arising from these observations, the policy of the Ministry of Education on language now states that:

**The language of instruction:** 1. The medium of instruction in schools will continue to be English. However, all children will be given an early opportunity to learn to read and write in a local language. 2. Every pupil shall be required to take a local language from Grade 1 to 4, and may continue to learn a local language as an optional subject thereafter.
This new policy means that the teacher should be able to teach children in their local language or dialect from Grade 1, when they enter school, up to the fourth grade or up to the stage when he/she is satisfied that the children are able to follow instruction in English. Children will be expected to take any of the seven official languages as an optional subject.

This language policy applies across the board, which means that the policy will apply, irrespective of whether the learner is in formal or non-formal education. It is the duty of the teacher to assess the situation and decide the appropriate language to be used for instruction or communication purposes, in order to transmit knowledge to the learners. In other words the teacher in a classroom situation must not be concerned simply with teaching the subject, but should try to ensure that pupils learn the subject effectively. During the time when English was the only medium of instruction, it was common to find situations when teachers would be talking to themselves. Especially when an inspector of schools was present in the classroom, the teacher would teach in English throughout the period the inspector was in the class, and pupils would listen attentively, without actually understanding anything.

In practice, even when the official policy was that of using English as the medium of instruction, it was common to find situations when a teacher would switch from English to a local language when he/she realized that children were not understanding what was being taught. It was therefore very important that the Ministry formalized what was happening in practice in schools, as it was clear that it was not realistic to expect a Grade 1 pupil to be able to follow instruction in English from the first day in school.

**Policy on publishing educational materials**

The introduction of European education in Africa, particularly in Zambia, started after the arrival of European missionaries in the eighteenth century. In Zambia this form of education was based on the introduction of the Bible. The idea was to teach the Africans how to read and write so that they would read the Bible for themselves and understand the word of God, and in some cases be able to teach others the word of God.

At the time, the Europeans did not recognize that there was any formal education among the Africans, as there was no written material. As a result, the Europeans felt that their own intervention represented the introduction of education, for the first time. It was later realized, however, that the Africans had their own form
of education, which was not based on books, or on writing, but was based on an oral tradition, passed for many years from generation to generation through story telling and acting. African education was practical, in the sense that children were taught whatever needed to be learnt through practice. As such one could say that African education was functional.

African education was undertaken separately for boys and girls, in that it prepared them for their future roles. Each community offered an education that was appropriate to the life of that community. For example, the Southern and Western communities taught their boys agricultural skills, in particular how to tend cattle. Agriculture was the main source of livelihood for these people, whose lives centred around keeping cows and growing crops. Girls were initiated into adulthood and taught principles of hygiene and skills needed for married life. Education for the Northern and Luapula communities centred around fishing, as this was the main activity in the region. Such a form of education is a life-long process. There was no time when one could say that a child or adult had now completed their education. People were expected to continue to learn all their life, through formal or informal discussions, or by experience, rather than through written materials.

Written materials in the African languages were introduced by missionaries who translated the Bible into the major languages. Education was centred around the ‘three Rs’, and not much was taught beyond this. The new graduates were expected to assist in teaching literacy and contributing to the development of written African languages. A few other written materials, including some cultural information, were developed, in addition to the Bible and religious material, but such written materials were very limited, as very few people could read and write.

The development of formal education started prior to independence. A number of Africans who had received European-style education recognized the need to develop materials in African languages. However, it was not easy to promote African forms of education, and particularly to encourage use of local languages. The earliest books in African languages were written by missionaries, who became interested and learned to speak an African language, but who used European orthography, rather than developing African scripts. Indeed, at that time many Africans were preoccupied with learning foreign languages, which were regarded as fashionable and more advanced than local languages, since those who were knowledgeable in the language of the Bible were seen as educated.

Since Zambia gained her independence, it has been government policy that educational materials should be developed and
published in the seven major languages which have been widely adopted. The development and publishing of materials in these languages has been the responsibility of the Curriculum Development Centre (CDC), which is a department in the Ministry of Education. The centre developed educational materials in both English and Zambian languages, as it was charged with the responsibility of ensuring that educational materials were developed which would reflect the cultural aspect of the country. The Curriculum Development Centre therefore aimed to eliminate the need to use materials which were produced in England for teaching in Zambia. Foreign produced materials were not easy to use for teaching and learning in Zambian schools, as the pupils could not easily understand concepts which were presented in unfamiliar situations.

During the period when the Curriculum Development Centre was the sole provider of educational materials, the whole process of preparing and publishing educational materials was financed and controlled by government. All textbooks and supplementary materials were prepared at the Centre, which developed materials for formal and non-formal education, using Government staff and resources, and adopting whatever methods of organization and authorship were judged suitable, including commissioning individuals or groups of individuals through workshop situations.

When the materials were written, the manuscripts were typed and sent to the Zambia Educational Publishing House (then the Kenneth Kaunda Foundation), a parastatal body under the Ministry of Education, which was responsible for the whole publishing process. The publisher processed the materials up to the printing stage. The processing did not use modern technology and the latest equipment, as these were not available at the time. Initially there were problems in printing educational materials, as there were no domestic printers that could handle large print runs. Materials were therefore sent out of the country for printing. No private publishers or printers were involved, as the government wanted to control the publishing of all educational materials.

Once the materials were published they were distributed to schools by the parastatal organization free of charge. At that time the government of Zambia was implementing a policy of free education, and could afford to finance the whole process of preparing and publishing educational materials, and to provide one book for every child in each class. All education was free, and the end user was not expected to contribute anything towards the cost of educational materials.

During the early 1970s and throughout the 1980s, the government of Zambia and the Ministry of Education experienced increasing financial problems. The government budget was
severely constrained, which meant that resources for education and other services declined. The situation deteriorated during the 1980s until it became clear that the policy of free education, with no private contributions, was no longer sustainable.

The Ministry now realizes that the development of books for school use should be the responsibility of publishers, rather than the Ministry itself. The Ministry’s preferred option would be for publishers to develop a book, preferably at their own risk, in response to a perceived market need, and to sell it through normal marketing mechanisms. Change has begun to take place as a result of this new attitude, but it is happening slowly, and not many titles of educational books have yet been published. An alternative approach would be for the Ministry, through the Curriculum Development Centre, to develop a book in collaboration with a publisher. The Ministry of Education wants to control the development of educational materials to ensure that they are in accordance with the requirement of the syllabus, and the advantage of such collaboration would be that the Ministry is satisfied from an early stage that the book will be suitable for school use, while the publisher is assured of a market. The disadvantage of this approach is that it would bestow privileged status to a particular book, which could inhibit other publishers.

As a result of this realization, Zambia is developing a free open market economy, and the Ministry wishes to see the establishment of a fully liberalized schoolbook industry, where publishers assume the responsibility for initiation, development, production and marketing of educational books. However, where publishers fail to provide, or where special needs arise, the Ministry will initiate and develop course books.

Under this approach preparation of textbooks and supplementary materials in local languages is the responsibility of publishers. This aspect of the new policy started taking root during the early 1990s, when the government announced the policy of liberalizing the provision of educational materials.

The government’s policy for distributing textbooks aims to provide one textbook between two pupils, and for supplementary materials one book between five pupils. The government will continue to finance the provision of educational materials, but cost sharing should be introduced slowly in order to increase the participation of beneficiaries in the financing of their education.

This move has encouraged the involvement of private publishers, to the point where some have started participating in the publication of educational materials in national and local languages. Private publishers have concentrated their participation on the development of educational materials, as this is the area where there is a market. As can be seen from the population
distribution, the readership in some languages is very low, which limits the size of the market, but with the advent of new technology desk top publishing systems are now being introduced in the development of materials.

**Present strategies for minimizing costs**

It was emphasized earlier that publishing is a risky business. Publishing in local languages is particularly risky, in that the print runs are very low, resulting in very high unit costs. One way in which the Ministry has helped to reduce the costs of publishing such materials is by financing the development of educational materials. The writing of textbooks or other materials has been done by government officials, who undertake this during their normal working time, and are paid salaries. This means that the development costs of the materials are not taken into account when costing a book that has been developed by the Curriculum Development Centre prior to inviting tenders from publishers. The publisher accepts the manuscript and the price of the book takes into account only the editorial and production costs up to the distribution of the book to the end user in the classroom.

Other mechanisms that have been adopted by the Ministry to reduce the costs of providing materials in local languages include the commissioning of authors to write materials. The author will then be paid a lump sum as commission, rather than being paid royalties.

**Cost of publishing or providing educational materials**

The main impetus to curriculum development in local languages started in the mid 1980s, when donors and funding agencies decided to support the publication of educational materials in Zambia. The main agency that took the lead in providing support for the development of curriculum materials was FINNIDA. In 1984 the Zambian and the Finnish governments entered into an agreement intended to assist the provision of educational materials by supporting the whole process of book preparation and provision. The component that supported the development of educational materials initially started with the development of materials in English, mathematics and science. It was quickly realized, however, that most of the interventions by international donors to support educational materials provision were concentrating on English, Mathematics and Science. The Ministry therefore decided to use some of the assistance under the FINNIDA programme to
develop educational materials in Zambian languages for Grade 1 to Grade 9 in primary schools. A project was set up under which teams of authors were organized by Curriculum Development Centre to develop materials in all the main languages. By the time the project came to an end, various materials had been developed, published and distributed to schools, and some materials for Grades 8 and 9 were at various stages of development, and have since been published.

At Grade 1 level, there were no pupils’ textbooks developed, because pupils were thought not to be able to read and handle a book. Only teachers’ materials were developed, which teachers could use to plan and improve their teaching. This situation is changing with the advent of the development of the book industry. A number of publishers have now developed books for Grade 1 in English, Mathematics, Science and Social Studies.

Information on costs of publishing educational materials in local languages is not readily available. This is because most of the materials that have already been published have been prepared under the Ministry and therefore development costs cannot be itemized. There is only one publisher in Zambia that has been involved in the process of publishing educational materials in local languages, and all these materials in local languages have been developed using donor assistance.

Information on curriculum development is also not readily available, because this has been the responsibility of a government agency (the Curriculum Development Centre), and therefore the time which officials have devoted to the development of the curriculum, and particularly materials in local languages, has not been costed. Some limited information may be extracted on the costs of the workshops organized by the Centre in developing the curriculum, but the data are not detailed.

Some estimates relating to the costs of authorship of materials in local languages could be obtained from information on the workshops held to develop the materials, but again, this information is limited. No royalties have been paid, as materials are developed under the auspices of the Ministry. Commission fees may have been paid in cases where materials have been developed with donor assistance, but these have not been taken into consideration when costing materials.

When materials have left the author, some information is held by publishers on the processing costs for materials up to the time the book is bound. Publishers are secretive about this information, however, and reluctant to disclose it to outsiders. There are many reasons for this secrecy, including the fact that publishers fear that disclosure of cost information may reveal the magnitude of their overheads or may suggest inefficiency on the part of the publisher.
Some basic factors must be taken into account when costing any book, including the distinction between fixed and variable costs. Fixed costs include the costs of editorial work, typesetting and preparation of camera ready copy or proofs. The costs associated with the production of camera ready copy include the input of the editor, designer, artist and paste-up artist. Each of these inputs can be costed, on the basis of the time of the individuals and their hourly rates. These costs do not depend on the number of books that are printed, and are therefore fixed. A publisher may incur a fixed cost of, say, US$1,000, which covers the editorial costs for a book of 160 pages, while any additional pages are costed as a fraction of the 160 pages.

Variable costs include the direct and indirect production costs of printing the books, including hourly labour costs, calculated on the basis of the time put in by the printing workers, and the costs of the actual materials used in the processing. Once the publisher has worked out the fixed and variable costs, decisions are taken on what mark-up should be included in the price of the book, to cover the publisher’s administrative costs and profit. The size of the mark-up will be determined by several factors, including the administration of the organization and its efficiency.

In cases where a book has to be translated, each publisher would negotiate with the translator the fee offered for the work. Information on these costs is not readily available however, as publishers usually regard it as confidential.

Once the book has gone through the publishing and printing stages, it moves to the marketing stage, where other costs are incurred. The final selling price of the book must take into consideration these marketing costs, and also many other factors, including the administration costs of the bookseller and their overheads. There are also fixed and variable elements to be taken into account in estimating the costs of marketing and distribution. This will depend on the way the book market is organized. There are hardly any fully fledged booksellers in Zambia at the moment, and publishers usually sell their publications directly to purchasers. As stated earlier, publication of materials in local languages is mainly concentrated on educational materials, and publishers therefore focus their sales on the Ministry of Education. Very little information is available on the costs of marketing and distribution.

In addition to the direct and indirect costs of publishing, printing and distribution of books there are hidden costs associated with their development and production. These are usually treated as administration costs or overheads. In the case of books financed with donor assistance, the costs met by the funding agency are not usually taken into consideration when costing the book, as these are not met by the publisher. Most of the development and
production of local language materials in Zambia has been done through the Curriculum Development Centre and the costs met during the development process have not been included in the final price of the book.

The factors that determine the fixed and variable costs of book production include the size and format of the book and the size of the print run. Information should be available on the effect of print runs on the unit cost of a book, but this is difficult to obtain from publishers, on the grounds that it is commercially sensitive. Publishers will often report only that the higher the print run, the lower the unit cost or price of the book, without providing detailed information.

The unit costs of books in local languages normally varies from language to language, depending on many factors, including the size of the population speaking the language. However when such factors are taken into consideration, it becomes politically sensitive, in that the costs of books in languages with a small population will be high and therefore not affordable. On average the unit cost of a book in local languages in Zambia would vary from US$3 to US$5, which is high compared to the cost of English books.

Locally produced books are more expensive than imported books. The government has allowed books to be imported duty free, and therefore this puts imported books at a considerable advantage. As a result of this, publishers prefer to print books outside the country. The cost of the imported book depends on whether it has been brought in by the publisher or by a bookseller. Publishers offer lower prices than booksellers, although as stated above there are very few fully fledged booksellers in Zambia.

Publishers are at the moment trying to organize the book industry in Zambia. Although it is still in the early stages, publishers have agreed to offer booksellers a 25 percent discount in order to keep the price of the books low. Booksellers would not necessarily pass this saving on to the consumer, as it would depend on the costs of the bookseller, including his overheads.

**Perceived benefits and effectiveness**

There are social and cultural as well as educational benefits to be gained from developing materials in national and local languages. In Zambia it is believed that availability of written material in local languages may help to sustain literacy, to improve standards of health and agricultural production, and promote civic awareness, understanding and cultural identity in local communities, as well as improving learning in schools.
It has been argued by some parents and teachers in Zambia that adopting English as the medium of instruction has led to situations where children are not able to read and write their mother tongue. This is because initial reading skills are taught through the medium of a language that is unfamiliar to the majority of children. This is believed to be a major contributory factor explaining backwardness in learning, as from the outset the child has difficulty in associating the printed forms of words with their real, underlying meaning. It has been further argued that children learn literacy skills more easily and successfully through their mother tongue, and subsequently they are able to transfer these skills quickly and easily to English or another language. It is believed that successful first language learning is in fact essential for the successful acquisition of literacy in a second language, and for learning the content of other subjects through the second language.

Arising from these assumptions, it can be argued that there are educational benefits to be gained from developing materials in national or local languages, because these can help the child learn more effectively in school. If for example educational statistics show that on average 2.6 percent of children repeat grades in primary school, and if this repetition can be reduced by the use of local languages, it would represent a significant improvement in performance. Another benefit sometimes claimed for the use of local languages is that the drop-out rate could be reduced, in the sense that pupils would be more successful, and therefore more likely to proceed with their education. It should however be noted that failing an examination is not the only reason for children in Zambia to drop out of school. One of the major factors is the lack of school places.

It is also suggested that the literacy rate, which at the moment stands at 56.4 percent, might be improved if people could learn to read in local languages. If more written materials were available in local languages, many people would be able to sustain their reading more easily, and reading could become a regular pastime activity. It has been argued that many people failed to develop reading skills while at school, because they were taught in English, while others quickly degenerate into illiteracy after they leave school, because of lack of reading materials in local languages.

There are various social benefits to be gained from providing people with the opportunity to learn in their local language. These are closely related to the educational benefits discussed above. From the social point of view in Zambia at the moment, the issue of HIV/AIDS is extremely important. Various materials are available to warn people against the dangers of HIV/AIDS, but most of these are in English. Efforts have been made to translate these materials into the local languages, and the health status of citizens...
is expected to benefit from the availability of such materials. Other social benefits might include the dissemination of information to farmers on food pests or agricultural techniques, but this also depends on whether the materials are produced in English or local languages, and on the level of literacy.

There are also cultural and political dimensions to the issue of local languages. A number of dialects of the main Zambian languages are likely to disappear, unless efforts are made to sustain them. The publication of materials in local languages could contribute to this, by improving the orthography of local dialects. It might also bring political benefits, in the form of a greater understanding of political messages. Political rallies in Zambia are usually addressed in English, which means that only those who understand English can fully understand, unless there is effective interpretation. Provision of written materials in local languages could also contribute to the preservation and transmission of moral and cultural traditions that are in danger of being lost if no written materials are available.

In Zambia, local languages are offered to school pupils as optional subjects up to Grade 12 or GCE Ordinary level (the General Certificate of Education, or school-leaving certificate). The content of the GCE course is organized like the English literature course, where the pupil is expected to read a certain number of set books, in order to answer questions relating to content and comprehension. This requires that the child learns more than simply how to read in a local language, but is taught also about the culture and morals of the people of that language. The teacher of such a course should therefore be able to understand the culture of a language in order to teach that language effectively. A teacher who does not belong to that language group may find difficulties in teaching the moral and cultural aspects of the local language.

Lack of materials in local languages can intensify the problems of teaching in local languages, as can the current policies of teacher training and teacher allocation. Students at the teacher training colleges in Zambia are taught how to teach Zambian languages, in terms of linguistic and pedagogic principles. When they are posted to schools, they are expected to teach the local language of the area in which the school is situated. It has been government policy that a teacher in Zambia can be posted to any school in the country, where his/her services are required. This posting does not take into account which languages the teacher speaks or learned while at college, although in most cases the teacher is posted in the province where he/she received teacher training. The Zambian language courses at teacher training college concentrate on linguistics and the relations between the Bantu languages, and include a methodology component which is intended to instruct the teacher...
in methods of teaching languages. The course is not designed to teach the trainee teacher a second language, but simply to facilitate or assist the teacher in handling a language class. The result is that teachers may then be expected to teach a language that they do not fully understand themselves.

While at college, the teacher is also faced with the problem of lack of materials in the languages he/she is expected to teach. In most cases the teacher is encouraged to learn to speak the language, rather than to read or write it. Whereas it may be easy to achieve understanding of the spoken language, if the teacher is not able to write in the local language, he/she will find it difficult to teach the language, especially reading and writing in the language. The orthography of the language is one important aspect the teacher is expected to learn without formal instruction. Orthography varies from language to language and it may be argued that one cannot easily master the orthography of one language by learning another.

As the teacher moves from college to school, he/she may be posted to an urban school where not all pupils can speak the local language of that town. People in Zambia have moved across the country in such a way that all local languages are spoken all over the country. One may find a situation in an urban classroom where there is at least one child speaking each of the seven local languages. There may be more than one child who can speak two or more of the local languages. The teacher is expected to teach the local language of the area, even though this may be a foreign language to most children in the class. This represents a huge task for the teacher, and is compounded by the problem of lack of materials.

The conclusion therefore must be that there would be significant benefits from developing materials in local languages, as this would assist teachers to teach more effectively in the local language of the area where they are located. However, it is not possible to measure these benefits in quantitative terms. No attempt has been made to measure or estimate the magnitude of these benefits. Concepts such as ‘cost benefit’ or ‘cost effectiveness’ are new concepts in Zambia, and there needs to be more consideration of such concepts in order to guide decisions about the provision and procurement of materials for schools.

However, although no attempt has been made to measure these benefits, publishers take into account their own estimates of expected financial benefits and returns, in deciding whether or not to publish materials in local languages. At present publishers do not perceive financial benefits from publishing in local languages, because they do not believe there is a market for them, especially if there is no commitment from the Ministry of Education to buy the materials published. However this attitude may be changing.
Publishing is still undeveloped in Zambia, and there are indications that some publishers may now begin to recognize potential benefits from the publication of materials in local languages, especially now that a number of people are concerned about the development of these languages.

**Conclusions**

Apart from the author’s consultations with publishers and other people on the issue of the cost-effectiveness of publishing educational materials in local languages, there has been no research to back up the findings and hypotheses presented above. Nevertheless the conclusion of this study is that there are a number of potential benefits from developing and providing educational materials in local languages, especially now that people are very much concerned about the ability of children to read and write in their mother tongue. It has been strongly suggested that pupils’ performance is dependent on their ability to read and write, and if indeed this ability can be enhanced by teaching reading and writing initially in the child’s local language, during the early years of education, then the importance of educational materials in local languages can hardly be overemphasized.

As has already been said, publishing is a risky business. Therefore the government should adopt a deliberate policy of encouraging the development and publication of materials in the major local languages in Zambia. This process has already been started, with assistance from international donors, notably the Finnish and Swedish funding agencies, FINNIDA and Sida, which have provided funds to enable the publication of materials in local languages. FINNIDA is currently undertaking a research study to evaluate the impact of educational materials which have been provided over the 10-year period of this technical assistance project. The outcome of this study will be very useful in guiding future decisions on educational provision.

The concepts of cost-benefit and cost-effectiveness analysis are very relevant in Zambia, and it would be extremely useful if research could be carried out to obtain more detailed and accurate information. This could to a certain extent assist publishers to appreciate the need for materials in local languages and convince donors of the importance of such materials, in addition to materials in English. This research could be extended to throw light on the question of what type of educational materials should be published, to assist the development of necessary skills. Policy decisions based on information at the point of delivery are bound to be more locally acceptable, and more likely to be successfully
implemented, than policies developed centrally and based only on information available at national level. The concepts also have wider policy implications, with respect to judgements about relative priorities and about the types of education that are most relevant and will provide the greatest benefits to learners.

The government has already indicated its willingness to adapt its language policies in the light of actual needs and conditions in schools. Such research could provide necessary information to guide the development of future strategies. Ideally, educational and language policies should not be static, but should be reviewed from time to time, in order to identify ways of improving the educational performance. In order to carry out such a review it is important to have as much information as possible. Further research on the costs and benefits of providing materials in local languages would provide valuable information and evidence for the Ministry of Education and for funding agencies to develop future policies.
Appendix One

REPOBLIKA DEMOKRATIKA MALAGASY
Tanindrazana-Tolom-piavitana-Fahafahana

MINISTRY OF SECONDARY EDUCATION AND BASIC EDUCATION
Decision No 1.001-90/INESEB on the use of languages in educational establishments at levels I, II and III.

The Ministry of Secondary Education and Basic Education, Having regard to the Constitution,
- Having regard to Law no 78-040 of 17 July 1978 establishing a general framework for the system of education and training,
- Having regard to Decrees 89-101 of 20 April 1989 and 89-250 of 17 August 1989 appointing members of the government,
- Having regard to Decree 77-371 of 25 October 1977 as amended by Decree 89-357 of 17 October 1989 setting out the competencies of the Minister of Secondary Education and Basic Education, as well as the general organization of his ministry,

DECIDES:
Article 1. In the general framework of improving the quality of education, this decision specifies the use of languages in all educational establishments of Levels I, II and III throughout the Democratic Republic of Madagascar. It covers both the languages of instruction and the languages to be taught as a subject.

Chapter 1 – Languages of instruction

Article 2. From the beginning of the 1990–91 academic year, the languages of instruction to be used shall be:

For Level I: Malagasy, except for the teaching of French, which shall be done in that language.

For Levels II and III: Malagasy for the teaching of Malagasy, ethics and civics, and the history and geography of Madagascar.
- French for the teaching of French, sciences, the history and geography of other countries, and philosophy.
- The languages being studied for the teaching of foreign languages (English, German, Spanish, Russian).

Chapter 2 – Languages to be taught as a subject

Article 3. Malagasy: the teaching of Malagasy is compulsory at all levels, from the first year.
- French will be taught from the second year
- English from the sixth year
- And other foreign languages (German, Russian, Spanish) from the tenth year as the pupils choose, in Level III educational establishments that have teachers of those languages.

Article 4. All previous provisions contrary to this decision are and shall remain abrogated.

Article 5. The present decision shall be recorded, published and communicated where needed.

Antananarivo, 1 October 1990
THE MINISTER OF SECONDARY EDUCATION AND BASIC EDUCATION

Signed: Velmpanahy Aristide
Appendix Two

REPOBLIKA DEMOKRATIKA MALAGASY
Tanindrazana-Tolom-piavotana-Fahafahana

MINISTRY OF PUBLIC EDUCATION
Directorate of Primary Education Teaching Service

Circular

Origin: Ministry of Public Education
Number: 92/0015418/MIP/DEP.1
Date: 07-07-92
Subject: Reorganization of primary education

TO:
– the Secretary-General of the Ministry of Public Education
– all MIP Directors (09)
– all DPIP (06)
– all Heads of Central Services
– all CISCO Heads for wide dissemination to ZAP Heads
– all EPP Directors of their CISCO

IMPLEMENTATION:
Beginning of the 1992–93 school year

1 Primary cycle

From the 1992–93 school year primary education will be made up of two cycles;
First cycle: Year 1 and Year 2 also known as ‘single learning cycle’
(2 years)
Second cycle: Year 3 to Year 5 (3 years)

– Children of school age (age 6) shall be in Year 1.
– Pupils from Year 1 shall be admitted to Year 2.
– Movement into Year 2 shall be automatic for all pupils who have completed Year 1.
In order to enable the teacher of Year 1 to advance at the speed of his pupils in Year 2 he will take his own pupils in Year 2.

Automatic movement into Year 2 does not exclude the continuation of term examinations which are part of the training assessment, a link not to be neglected in a fruitful learning system.

Movement to a higher class for the years of the Second Cycle shall be on the basis of the usual examination and various grades obtained during the school year and promotion examinations.

2 The place of Malagasy and French in primary education

Malagasy shall remain a taught language and a language of instruction in the first cycle of primary education, while French shall be studied from the first year (Year 1).

A French curriculum for Year 1 will be available for the beginning of the 1992-93 school year.

In the second cycle, Malagasy shall continue to be taught as a subject and remain the language of instruction for subjects involving authentic Malagasy values, that is: ethics, civics, hygiene, the history of Madagascar, aesthetics and productive activities.

Scientific subjects such as arithmetic, general knowledge and geography shall be taught in French and this shall be done with a view to the later schooling of pupils for a better transition into secondary classes.

3 Time-table

There will be two types of time-table:
- Normal time-table
- Part-time time-table.

A. Normal time-table

Duration: 27 and a half hours a week spread over 5 days of 5 and a half hours each: 3 and a half hours in the morning and 2 hours in the afternoon.

B. Part-time time-table

Designed solely for urban areas where there is a problem of insufficient class-rooms: two sections for two teachers using one class-room.

Duration: 25 hours a week, spread over 5 days with five hours a day.

The break-down of these time-tables among the various subjects shall be included in the curriculum applicable from the beginning of the school year.

THE MINISTER OF PUBLIC EDUCATION
By delegation the Secretary-General
Signed: Horace Gatien
Appendix Three

REPOBLIKAN’I MADAGASKARA
Tanindrazana-Fahafahana-Fahamarinana

Antananarivo 24 June 1993

MINISTRY OF PUBLIC EDUCATION SECRETARIAT-GENERAL
No. 93/299/MIP/SG

THE SECRETARY-GENERAL OF THE MINISTRY OF PUBLIC EDUCATION
to:
– All provincial Directors of Public Education
– All CISCO heads

Subject: General distribution of GARABOLA textbooks.

The packaging of Year 1 GARABOLA reading and writing textbooks in Malagasy is now completed. We shall take advantage of the dry season to ensure that they are distributed to all EPP.

Guides for the use of teachers were distributed in October–November 1992 by the Cellule de Distribution des Auxiliaires Pédagogiques du Projet CRESED [CDAP] BP 331 Antananarivo – 101.

The Ministry of Public Education has acquired 450,000 GARABOLA books. This number is lower than the total number of pupils in Year 1 in public and private primary schools, and therefore they will be distributed on the basis of one book for every two pupils.

In order to ensure that every pupil in the preparatory classes has this textbook at the right time the following measures must be scrupulously applied.

1 The GARABOLA books are not for sale but for hiring to pupils. The annual hiring fee, at a rate of 500 Fmg per pupil, must be paid at the beginning of the year and thus be included in the total of general expenses.

2 The amounts thus collected will be distributed in the following proportions:
- 85 percent will be made available to the school for its educational activities for which the head of the institution will have to account to his superiors.
- 10 percent will be paid to the ZAP Head and the remaining 5 percent to the CISCO as reimbursement of the costs of distributing and monitoring use of the textbooks.

3 School Heads shall be responsible for the preservation of the textbooks which remain the property of the establishment. Where educational needs so require, he may authorize pupils to take the textbooks home from time to time. But as a general rule the books must be collected up after each use and kept in the establishment's cupboard if the security is adequate or retained by the Head of the establishment (or the master in charge of the section) at his home.

4 A textbook is expected to last four years. In order to cover the costs of reprinting as the books become worn out, the Ministry of Public Education will levy 500 Fmg for every book distributed from the budget made available to the CISCOs under the head ‘Technical supplies’. This counterpart will be paid into the account of the CNAPMAD who shall make withdrawals as the need arises.

The CDAP will be responsible for getting packets of books to the CISCOs which will be the first breakdown point in their distribution. ZAP Heads will withdraw from their CISCO the boxes of books for the schools within their district.

The packets for each school must be withdrawn under the responsibility of the EPP Director from the ZAP Head by a delegation comprising the EPP Director and members of the FRAM.

In the event of a school being closed the share allocated to it will be retained at the CISCO which will prepare a report to be sent to the CDAP. For any further supplies, the CISCO Head will be required to make a request from the CDAP with a full explanation.

I should like to draw your attention to the need to carry out all these operations as soon as possible. Each EPP must have received its quota of textbooks at the latest by 15 September 1993. Officials of the Ministry will monitor the distribution.

I look forward to wholehearted co-operation by all for the success of this and succeeding distributions.

Signed: Gatien Horace

Copies to:
The Minister of Public Education ‘for report’
All Directors ‘for information’
Appendix Four

List of Namibian languages

San
Kung
Heikung
Other

Otjiherero
Otjiherero
Otjimbandero
Other

Rukavango
Rukwanga
Rushambyu
Rugciriku
Thimbukushu
Other

Nama/Damara
Nama
Damara

Oshiwambo
Oshikwamyama
Oshindonga
Oshimbantu
Oshikwambi
Oshingandjera
Oshikwaliuudhi
Oshikolonkhadhi
Other

Capriví languages
Lozi (Sikolo)
Sifwe
Sisubiya
Siyeyi (Yei)
Totela
Other

Tswana

Other African languages
Xhosa
Zulu
Sotho
Swahili
Other

Afrikaans

Main European languages
German
English

Other European languages
French
Italian
Dutch
Portuguese
Other

Other languages
Chinese
Arabic
Korean
Japanese
Malay
Other
### Out of Africa Publishers Price List (15 April 1996): Namibia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cat. no.</th>
<th>Excl</th>
<th>Incl</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Studies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37346</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Workbook (Afrikaans)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3763X</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Afrikaans)</td>
<td>20.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37397</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Workbook (English)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37486</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (English)</td>
<td>20.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37488</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Workbook (German)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37672</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (German)</td>
<td>20.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3746X</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Workbook (Khoekhoegawab)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37567</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Khoekhoegawab)</td>
<td>20.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37354</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Workbook (Oshikwanyama)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37664</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Oshikwanyama)</td>
<td>20.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37362</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Workbook (Oshindonga)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37656</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Oshindonga)</td>
<td>20.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37370</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Workbook (Otjiherero)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37915</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Otjiherero)</td>
<td>20.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37419</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Workbook (Rugciriku)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37516</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Rugciriku)</td>
<td>20.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37345</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Workbook (Rukwangali)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37508</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Rukwangali)</td>
<td>20.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37796</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Workbook (Setswana)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37818</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Setswana)</td>
<td>20.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37443</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Workbook (Silozi)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37591</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Silozi)</td>
<td>20.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37451</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Workbook (Thimbukushu)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37605</td>
<td>Environmental Studies Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Thimbukushu)</td>
<td>20.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Handwriting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37230</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Workbook (Afrikaans)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37680</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Afrikaans)</td>
<td>15.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37060</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Workbook (English)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37478</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (English)</td>
<td>15.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37303</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Workbook (Khoekhoegawab)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37583</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Khoekhoegawab)</td>
<td>15.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37311</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Workbook (Oshikwanyama)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37745</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Oshikwanyama)</td>
<td>15.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37249</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Workbook (Otjiherero)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37737</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Otjiherero)</td>
<td>15.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37257</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Workbook (Oshindonga)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37921</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Oshindonga)</td>
<td>15.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37265</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Workbook (Rugciriku)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37559</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Rugciriku)</td>
<td>15.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37273</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Workbook (Rukwangali)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37540</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Rukwangali)</td>
<td>15.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37877</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Workbook (Setswana)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37893</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Setswana)</td>
<td>15.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37281</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Workbook (Silozi)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3777X</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Silozi)</td>
<td>15.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3729X</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Workbook (Thimbukushu)</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37788</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Teacher’s Guide (Thimbukushu)</td>
<td>15.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37060A</td>
<td>Handwriting Gr 1 Wallchart and writing patterns</td>
<td>22.60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix Six

**Census indicators – Namibia (1991)**

**Population size:**
- Total: 1,409,920
- Males: 686,327
- Females: 723,593

**In urban/rural, percent:**
- Urban areas: 28
- Rural areas: 72

**Sex ratio:**
- Males per 100 females: 95

**Area:**
- In square kilometres: 823,144

**Population density:**
- Persons per sq.km: 1.7

**Age composition, percent:**
- Under 15 years: 42
- 15-64 years: 53
- 65+ years: 5

**Marital status, 15 years and above:**
- Never married: 50
- Married legally: 30
- Married consensually: 12
- Divorced/separated: 3
- Widowed: 4

**Nationality, percent:**
- Namibians: 96
- Foreign nationals: 4
- Of which:
  - Angolan: 49
  - South African: 25
  - Zambian: 9
  - European: 11

**Main language spoken at home, percent:**
- Oshiwambo: 51
- Nama/Damara: 13
- Rukavango: 10
- Afrikaans: 9
- Otjiherero: 8

**Private households:**
- Number: 254,389
- Average size: 5.2

**Head of household, percent:**
- Male: 61
- Female: 39

**Education, 15 years and above, percent:**
- Never been to school: 26
- Currently at school: 19
- Left school with some education from:
  - Primary school: 49
  - Secondary school: 45
  - Tertiary school: 6

**Children 6-16 years attending school, percent:**
- Boys: 81
- Girls: 85

**Labour force 15 years and above, percent:**
- In labour force: 58
- Of which:
  - employed: 81
  - unemployed: 19
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Housing conditions, per cent:</th>
<th>Infant mortality:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Household with:</td>
<td>Infant deaths per 1000 live births</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>no heating</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>safe water</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bush as toilet</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>electricity for lighting</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Own radio</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Under-five mortality:</th>
<th>Deaths for under-fives per 1000 live births</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Average number of children</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>per woman</td>
<td>59.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Females 62.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fertility:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life expectancy at birth, years:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Males</td>
<td>59.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Females</td>
<td>62.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GLOSSARY

Camera ready copy (CRC)
The final text and illustrations of a publication, pasted up ready to be put on film prior to printing.

Database
Set of records such as names/addresses and other information for use in a business, project or for administration.

Desktop publishing (DTP)
The use of computer programs to carry out design and page layout electronically.

Educational hardware
Permanent equipment and facilities.

Educational software
More perishable goods such as textbooks and writing materials.

Language of learning/language of instruction
The language in which pupils are instructed, whether in written or oral communications.

Non-formal education
Learning outside the classroom or school situation, including distance-learning.

Offset litho duplication
A simple form of printing using stencils and ink on a special duplicating machine.

Opportunity cost
Cost viewed as an economic loss sustained as a result of a choice, e.g. made by an individual student to remain in education rather than taking a job.

Pre-press costs
Costs such as typesetting, preparation of illustrations, production of CRC etc., which occur before the printing of a title.

Print run
The number of copies of a book printed at one time.

Social rate of return
Rate of return on an investment from the point of view of society as a whole.

Textbook
A book used in the course of study, especially as a main course book rather than as supplementary material.

Title
A work in book form, the name given to a work.

Typesetting
Process of converting text in a manuscript into styled text in a printed book, often using electronic methods such as sophisticated computer (DTP) programmes.
INDEX

Associates for Research and Education in Development (ARED) 4, 85–92
Association for the Development of Education in Africa (ADEA) 1–2, 118
Association of Namibian Publishers 15–16, 21, 73, 78
authorship 20–1, 37, 105

benefits
of publishing in local languages 1–5, 8, 9–13, 18–19, 38–40, 53, 76, 93–5, 111, 115
perceived (potential) 2, 9, 10–12, 18–20, 22, 40, 110–14
bilingual
  teaching 9–10, 22, 46
  newspapers 53
Brazil
  study on cost–effectiveness in 7–9, 12, 20, 23
booksellers 109–10
cost-benefit 1–6, 9
  analysis 3–6, 11, 22, 24, 41, 97, 114
cost-effectiveness 1–9, 11–12, 21–3, 78, 114
  analysis 1–4, 6–9, 22–3, 95, 114
costing 107, 108–9
costs
  administrative 109
  of authorship 38, 108
  and benefits 1, 6, 11, 23, 115
  of booksellers 110
  of damaged books 35
  data on 3, 6, 9, 11, 15–17, 22, 49
  of design 88–9, 92
  of development 22, 74, 77, 88–90, 92, 95, 107, 109
  difference 38
  of distribution 16, 48, 74, 86, 105, 107, 109
  editorial 109
  estimates of 11, 17–18, 21–2, 108–9
  fixed and variable 109
  free 18, 31, 33, 48, 51, 72, 105
  hidden 11, 15, 22, 38, 52, 109
  illustrations of 11, 16, 50
  of importing 93, 96
  increase 17
  of investing in training 6, 95
  low 33, 38
  marketing 109
  and market price 75, 93
  of materials 87, 91
  minimizing 2, 16, 20, 35, 38, 49, 72, 86, 95, 107
  overheads 38, 74, 108–10
  per hour 40, 109
  per learner 77, 95
  pre-press 37, 74, 116
  price 50
  of printing 74–5, 86, 91
  and binding 37, 71, 74, 90
  processing 108
  of production 16, 38, 75, 88, 90–92, 95, 107, 109
  of publishing 1–6, 10–11, 16, 36, 38, 49–50, 87, 90–1, 96, 107
  and supplying 88
  real 17, 88–9, 92
  recovery 78
  reducing 55, 87, 96
  see also minimizing costs

129
relationship with print run 16, 50, 72, 74, 90–2, 107, 110
saving 6, 9
sharing 16, 18, 106
storage 74
of textbooks 17, 35, 41, 49–52, 86–7, 89, 91–2
of typesetting 37, 72, 74, 86, 90, 91, 109, 116
unit 9, 16–17, 38, 49, 51, 52, 74, 75, 91–2, 107, 110
Crédit de Renforcement du Secteur Educatif (CRESED) 48, 50, 51, 52, 55
DANIDA v, 2
data 3, 4, 6, 8–9, 11–12, 15–18, 27, 39, 50,
collection of 3–4, 18, 22, 27, 79
on costs see costs illustative 49
interpreting 58
requirements 8
research 39
database 39, 116
drop-outs 6–9, 18–19, 22, 26, 27–8, 82, 54, 111
English
as alien culture 27
educational materials in 15, 18, 32, 35, 49, 75, 76, 105, 107–8, 110, 112, 114
as language of instruction
in schools 11, 13–14, 27, 28, 30, 38, 66–8, 100–3, 111
in teacher training colleges 69
literacy in 40, 58, 83, 101
methodology of teaching 100–2
as official/national language 13, 28, 30, 39, 65–8, 71, 100
as academic subject
in schools 30, 32, 52–3, 68, 77, 83, 112
spoken as mother-tongue
in Namibia 65, 67, 69, 130
financial
benefits 113
constraints
on case studies 3
on education 4, 18, 71
 gains 95
management 78
problems 105
resources 58, 87
returns 7
FINNIDA v, 2, 107, 114
French
educational materials 49, 81–2, 93, 95
as language of
administration 13, 45, 55, 81
instruction 12–14, 43, 45–6, 49, 53, 55
in colleges 46
in literacy programmes 83
as academic subject 30, 43, 45, 52, 54
Gambia, The vi, 2–3, 12–21, 25–42, 80–1, 88
IBRD see World Bank
illiteracy 26, 31, 38, 44, 58, 84, 111
literacy 1, 4, 22, 30–1, 39–40, 49, 58, 68, 83–5, 102, 104, 110–2
adult 2, 14, 19, 46, 49, 53
centres 40
mass 31, 83
materials 36, 40, 83, 87
mother–tongue 23, 58, 68
programmes 5, 18, 30, 46, 49, 53–4, 58, 83–5, 92
rate 25–6, 58, 80, 100, 111
training 46, 84
Malagasy 12, 14, 19–20, 44–56
Malagachization 47–52, 54
Mandinka 28–30, 32, 36–8, 80–2, 85
methodology
of the case studies 3, 43
of teacher training 39
 teaching 10, 112
Namibia vi, 2–3, 12–13, 15–17, 21, 57–78, 99, 123–6
languages 70–3, 78
Niger vii, 2, 3, 9, 80
Nigeria 9
Oshiwambo 63, 64, 65, 70, 131–2
Overseas Development Authority [ODA] v, 1–2

Index
primary education 7–8, 19, 26
drop-out/repetition rates from 9, 26, 44, 52, 111
educational materials for 32, 47–8, 50, 52, 108
enrolment in 25, 44, 80, 100
language of instruction in 13–14, 18–19, 29, 43, 45–6, 67
language teaching in 29, 43
quality of 7, 23
recruitment of teachers for 55–6
structure of 60–1, 68
Pulaar 29–33, 36–7, 80–3, 85
questionnaires 3, 43, 71, 79, 89
resources 4–6, 15, 28, 30, 38, 68, 77, 105–6
centres 88, 96
human 4, 84
indigenous 37
limited (lack of) 1, 4, 43, 58, 87
secondary education 5, 82–3
drop-out/repetition rates in 26, 44
educational materials for 32, 73
enrolment in 25–6, 61, 80
female participation in 61, 80
language of instruction in 19, 43, 45–6, 67–8
language teaching in 82–3
structure of 26, 60
vocational 5
teacher training 7, 14, 82, 112
investment in 6
institutions 6, 15, 46, 84, 102
languages in 28, 69, 102
government policies on 22, 112
UNESCO 24, 32, 41, 44, 48, 53, 81, 96–7
Union of Senegalese Writers in National Languages (USLAN) 21, 96
Wolof 28, 30, 32–3, 36–7, 80–3, 85
World Bank 7, 9, 12, 23, 25, 32, 44, 48, 50, 55, 58, 80, 97, 100