MOZAMBIQUE EMIS PEER REVIEW REPORT ON IMPLEMENTING THE SADC EMIS NORMS AND STANDARDS

Validation Workshop, Maputo
23rd October 2014

Compiled and presented by:
Dr. Charles Ndakala (Ministry Of Education, Zambia)
Mr. Mbala Zananga (Ministry Of Education, Angola)
Mr. Shem Bodo & Ms. Chemwi Mutiwayuka (ADEA)
OUTLINE

• Mission purpose
• Peer review process
• Findings and recommendations
• Section rankings and overall score
• Conclusion
MISSION PURPOSE

• Evaluate the standard of EMIS in Mozambique against the norms and standards developed in the SADC Assessment Framework.

• Using peer review, validate results of the national EMIS assessment, provide recommendations for improvement and support the development of an implementation roadmap for the attainment of the “quality statistics” benchmark.
EMIS PEER REVIEW PROCESS

• A five-day peer review process:
  – Briefed Permanent Secretary, MoE, about the review.
  – Held introductory discussions with the national assessment team.
  – Met local education group (LEG) – partners and civil society reps.
  – Reviewed national assessment report, agreed on score levels.
  – Visited and discussed with Ministry of Women and Social Affairs,
    National Institute of Statistics, Matola provincial and district education
    offices and a secondary school.
  – Presented highlights of initial findings at an exit meeting.

• Follow up and validation:
  – Sent draft report to Ministry, received feedback and revised report
    accordingly.
  – Report validated at a one-day workshop presided over by the
    Permanent Secretary, MoE, and involving 25 participants comprising
    MoE directors and staff, cooperating partners (NIS, GIZ, USAID,
    Canada, Italy), embassy representatives (Finland, Canada).
Sections:

A. Policy and LegalFrameworks
B. Resource Availability and Utilisation
C. Statistical Processes
D. Education Information Reporting
A. Policy and Legal Frameworks

• **Norm 1: Mandate for Data Collection for the Education Sector**
  - Ministry has a delegated mandate for data collection, processing & dissemination, from the National Statistics System (NSS) Law: which established NIS.
  - Directorate of Planning and Cooperation, DIPLAC (EMIS Unit) and Directorate of Coordination of Higher Education, collect and produce education statistics based on NSS Law.
  - EMIS strategy ensures very high response rate (above 98%).
  - Human Resources (ECAF) data not linked to EMIS data.
  - Information sharing is not very formalised across Ministries.
A.  Policy and Legal Frameworks

Recommendations – Norm 1

• Strengthen collaboration with the MWSA; build their capacity to provide quality Pre-Primary Education data.
• Formalise information sharing with other stakeholders.
• Lobby NIS to disseminate widely, including to all Ministries, the existing documentation on how to execute the delegated law on statistics.
Norm 2: Quality Commitment

• Policy frameworks, processes and procedures to ensure quality data in place but need to fully take into account international quality standards.

• Data is collected in three shifts – morning, afternoon and evening – which is critical in teacher deployment and construction of classrooms.

• Data on Children with Special Education Needs (CSEN) not collected making it difficult to know exactly how many they are in schools.
A. Policy and Legal Frameworks

Recommendations – Norm 2:

• Institute measures to align policy frameworks, processes and procedures with international quality standards.

• Data on CSEN should be collected for easy intervention.
A. Policy and Legal Frameworks

Norm 3: Statistical Confidentiality

- Individual data confidentiality is well stated but seldom implemented. Use or access to individualized data is only authorized for statistical purposes.
- Checks are in place to ensure only aggregated data is publicly available. But aggregated data e.g. on absenteeism and HIV & AIDS can be confidential.
- Necessary protocols apply all the time to external users accessing statistical data. User awareness of the protocols not widespread.
A. Policy and Legal Frameworks

Recommendations – Norm 3:

• Implement the existing policy on data retention and disposal, with respect to the annual school census questionnaires.

• Improve users’ awareness of the protocols on external user access to statistical data.
A. Policy and Legal Frameworks

Norm 4: Reporting Accountability

• As an obligation by the law, statistics are produced and disseminated within the year (four months after data collection)

• Reports to international organizations such as SADC, AU and other international agencies include most of the required information.

• However, there are gaps in financial and ICT data.

• **Recommendation:** Incorporate data on pre-primary education, finance and ICTs in the annual statistical reports
A. Policy and Legal Frameworks

Norm 5: Impartiality and Objectivity

- Education statistics are compiled using statistical and scientific methodologies. Public data release is objective and impartial.
- However, more capacity needs to be built for other staff to be able to make modifications to EduStat, whose use should extend to the district level.
- Errors identified during consistency analysing on time series data are not published. Similarly, when data is updated to ensure consistency, in most cases this is not disclosed.
- Published reports include information on methods and procedures used, though the information is not in detail.
- New employees are given guidelines but not adequately inducted on the professional and ethical conduct with regards to work and handling of data.
- Preliminary data not provided due to the quick turnaround time in publication production.
Recommendations – Norm 5:

• Publicise adjustments made to existing published report, arising from identified errors.

• Fully disclose information on data that is updated to ensure consistency.

• Put in place a clear strategy for inducting new EMIS staff on the professional and ethical conduct with regards to work and handling of data. This is in addition to the guidelines they are already being given.
A. Policy and Legal Frameworks

Norm 6: Registration of institutions

• Institutions of education and training (public and private) are registered in the Ministry of Education excluding pre-primary.

• A master list exists and is updated annually with public and private institutions registered being published in the Government Gazette.

• Recommendation: As a pre-condition for incorporating quality data on pre-primary education in the statistical report, support the Ministry of Women and Social Affairs with the registration of public and private institutions offering pre-primary education.
Norm 7: Registration of learners

- Ministry collects data by age using birth certificates, verbal confirmations from guardians and school enrolment records.

- However, it was not very clear as to how birth confirmations are done as this could result into age specific indicators being distorted.

- **Recommendation:** Closely collaborate with chiefs/village elders to put in place appropriate mechanisms for verifying the birth dates for learners with no birth certificates.
A. Policy and Legal Frameworks

• Summary scores:

Figure 1: Policy and Legal Framework
B. Resource Availability and Utilization

**Norm 8: Adequate resources**

- Ministry under DIPLAC has a budget for EMIS at all levels. However, absorption capacity is limited.
- Ministry has sufficiently qualified EMIS personnel only at the central level and in a few provinces and districts.
- Ministry has a plan and strategy in place for staff capacity building, but no mechanisms for retention.
- EMIS staff participate in international fora where best-practices, standards and experiences are shared.
- Ministry has invested heavily in ICT use for information management at all levels – but more required in equipment and office space, especially at the lower levels.
B. Resource Availability and Utilization

Recommendations – Norm 8:

• Capacity building should be on-going and for all levels. Consider deliberately absorbing graduates, as part of the EMIS staff recruitment process, and put in place appropriate policies for retention.

• Integrate new ICT initiatives and processes in the EMIS cycle coupled with the development and/or upgrading of staff skills and competences.

• Progressively invest in equipment and office space for EMIS, especially at the lower levels.
B. Resource Availability and Utilization

Norm 9: Cost effectiveness

• Ministry has mechanisms in place for monitoring financial, technological and human resource utilisation.
• Directorate of Finance within the Ministry has a financial management information system that is able to detect and monitor usage of funds.
• EMIS staff are mainly used to perform core EMIS functions – but sometimes on IT support, troubleshooting and examinations.
• ICTs are used in most essential operations in the statistical value chain and the usage has enhanced productivity in the ministry.
B. Resource Availability and Utilization

- **Recommendations – Norm 9:** EMIS staff should be encouraged to also monitor usage of EMIS funds to avoid possible misapplication to other equally needy areas.
B. Resource Availability and Utilization

• Summary scores:

Figure 2: Resources Availability and Utilization

- Mozambique
- International Norm
C. Statistical Processes

- Norm 10: Sound Methodology & Appropriateness of Statistical Procedures
  - Ministry, in most cases, follows sound methodological processes according to international and national standards – e.g. pilots its questionnaires for validity and reliability.
  - Ministry participates in SACMEQ studies and results are incorporated into the mainstream data collection process.
  - Data verification processes are robust, with internal control included in the various sub-sector level questionnaires.
C. Statistical Processes

- Routines embedded in the statistical software control data consistency during data entry.
- But consistency checks do not embrace the entire statistical production process.
- Identifying and estimating missing data is not embraced, largely due to the high rate of response received (averaging 98%) over the years.
- Ministry does not undertake its own specialized surveys, but collaborates with NIS and other partners in the process to supplement data sourced from the Ministry’s annual school census.
- Procedures ensuring consistent use of standard concepts, classifications as well as definitions are mostly documented. A glossary of terms and their definitions is part of the annual school census report.
C. Statistical Processes

– Ministry’s has a questionnaire for each of the education levels under its mandate, including higher education.

– Data available for the management of educational institutions are compatible with the requirements of the education census instruments.

– Data correction is done at the school level. The school head and district offices must verify, stamp and sign the filled questionnaire.

– Mozambique uses population data from NIS only. These are obtained from censuses and projections.
Recommendations – Norm 10:

• Continue building EMIS staff capacity in using modern methodological processes aligned to national and international standards for data collection, processing, publication and dissemination. Also, build staff capacity on data imputation and statistical modelling e.g. survey designs and data estimation techniques.

• Continue the ongoing collaboration with stakeholders on statistical processes to enhance data quality.
C. Statistical Processes

**Norm 11: Non-Excessive Burden on Respondents**

- Data collection is done twice a year and covers core education aspects except ICT, finance and pre-primary education.
- Outside of these data collection processes, only the auditing survey is undertaken.
- Ministry collaborates with partners on other sampling surveys to supplement the school census.
- Law governing the national system of statistics recommends the use of administrative documents to buttress data collection.
C. Statistical Processes

Recommendations – Norm 11:

• Put in place advocacy strategies that encourage the use of the education statistics produced by different sectors in the Ministry in their work.

• Undertake regular market surveys on the needs of other sectors and actors to develop a culture of using education statistics that the Directorate of Planning and Cooperation (DIPLAC) generates.
C. Statistical Processes

• Summary scores:

Figure 3: Statistical Processes

Sound Methodology and Appropriateness of Statistical Procedures

Focus average

Non-Excessive Burden on Respondents

Mozambique

International Norm

23rd October 2014 EMIS Peer Review Report Validation, Maputo
D. Education Information Reporting

Norm 12: Relevance

- Ministry has a “Sector Master Plan for Statistics (2013-2017)” which includes ECD. It also produces education statistical reports in line with the needs of identified users.
- “Superior Council of Statistics” is the highest consultation group on statistics. It integrates different ministries and is chaired by the Prime Minister. It meets twice a year.
- Ministry has a record of core users, but does not undertake user satisfaction surveys, although it participates in those initiated by NIS.
- School census feedback reports are sent to the provinces– but Ministry is not fully certain if copies go down to the school level.
- Pivot table reports are available online but not all schools have access to the internet, and hence to the tables.
- Training has only been conducted once and internally.
D. Education Information Reporting

Recommendations – Norm 12:

• Develop and implement an effective user consultation mechanism (borrowing from the Zambia experience).
• Conduct own user satisfaction surveys on education data and widely consult users on their needs.
• Eliminate bulk feedback reports by selecting a set of key indicators and producing provincial and district profile sheets, and sharing with the lower levels up to the schools – consider having this process inbuilt into the EduStat software.
• Conduct regular, scheduled internal training of EMIS staff.
Norm 13: Accuracy and Reliability

• Ministry has accurate and reliable education statistics arising from an average response rate of 98%. These statistics are consistent and comparable with data from other surveys.

• Ministry has a complete and annually updated master list of its registered public and private higher education institutions.

• Data consistency checks are inbuilt in the EduStat software and, in addition, consistency is checked at the data source and triangulation takes place.
 Recommendations – Norm 13:

• Ensure specialised surveys undertaken document and share information with regard to the degree of sampling and non-sampling errors.

• Build skills to calculate sampling and non-sampling errors, in the event that the current high survey response rates are to drop in future.
D. Education Information Reporting

**Norm 14: Timeliness and Punctuality**

- Annual school census report is released regularly, within 12 months and across sectors. Data publication is normally between June and August, as per the set calendar.
- Even though actual publishing dates are sometimes missed, it is not often and not out of disregard.
- Since the decentralisation of services in the sector, the head office no longer works with preliminary data as it is processed at the district level.
- If data requests are made, data from the previous year is given. If the request requires data from that year, it can be projected.
Recommendation – Norm 14:

• Publicise, in advance, any deviations from the set guidelines and schedule for data release.
D. Education Information Reporting

• Norm 15: Coherence, Consistency, comparability, and Integration
  – Ministry compiles statistics that are consistent over time, as evidenced by the time series data in the reports, and which conform to international standards.
  – Ministry uses unique national codes in its education statistical compilation, and the statistics have some comparability across SADC, AU and at the global level.
  – Data is easy to interpret.
Norm 16: Accessibility and Clarity

- Statistics in ASC reports are presented in a clear manner in the form of tables.
- Ministry holds national training workshops for some EMIS staff on data analysis but further analyses are minimal. Some analytical reports are given to lower structures, but this does not occur regularly.
- Hard copy publications are available and pivot tables and time series data are available online. There is, however, no formal dissemination strategy in place.
- Metadata is compiled and is available, but its existence not widely publicised for easy access.
D. Education Information Reporting

Recommendations – Norm 16:

• Consider producing education statistics that are analysed for easy stakeholder understanding and use.

• Avail electronic versions of the annual school census report online, as a PDF either on the Ministry’s website or distributed using email.

• Put in place a formal dissemination strategy, including holding a stakeholders dissemination workshop.

• Provide easy access to metadata for stakeholders who request for it.
D. Education Information Reporting

Norm 17: Comprehensiveness

• Education statistics are comprehensive covering all the sub-sectors under the Ministry’s mandate. Data from other ministries providing education and training are, however, not covered.

• ASC report contains some quality indicators, and the National Institute for the Development of Education (INDE) conducts some sample surveys on data quality.

• Statistics are disaggregated by gender, but not by rural and urban – Ministry is yet to incorporate the updated rural/urban geographical codification by NIS.
Recommenda&ons – Norm 17:

• Continue to conduct sample surveys on data quality, as being done by INDE.

• Incorporate revised geographical codification by NIS, for rural and urban areas, in data disaggregation.

• Increase data coverage to other ministries providing education and training. Also incorporate data on learners with special needs, ICTs and Finance.

• Assist the Ministry of Women and Social Affairs with the data collection process, including questionnaire design, for pre-primary education.
D. Education Information Reporting

- Summary scores:

![Figure 4: Education Information Reporting](image)

- Focus Average: 2.7
- Relevance: 4
- Accuracy and Reliability: 3.1
- Timeliness and Punctuality: 2.4
- Coherence, Consistency, Comparability, and Integration: 3.5
- Accessibility and Clarity: 2.6
- Comprehensiveness: 4
- Mozambique
- International Norm
## RANKING & OVERALL SCORE

### Overall Average Score

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Focus Area A: Policy and Legal Framework</th>
<th>Average Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Norm 1: Mandate for Data Collection</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norm 2: Quality Commitment</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norm 3: Statistical Confidentiality</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norm 4: Reporting Accountability</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norm 5: Impartiality and Objectivity</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norm 6: Registration of Institutions</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norm 7: Registration of Learners</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Focus Area Average</strong></td>
<td><strong>3.1</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Norm 1: Mandate for Data Collection      | 3.4           |
| Norm 2: Quality Commitment              | 3.5           |
| Norm 3: Statistical Confidentiality     | 3.0           |
| Norm 4: Reporting Accountability        | 3.7           |
| Norm 5: Impartiality and Objectivity    | 2.9           |
| Norm 6: Registration of Institutions    | 3.0           |
| Norm 7: Registration of Learners        | 2.5           |
| **Focus Area Average**                  | **3.1**       |
### RANKING & OVERALL SCORE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Focus Area B: Resources Availability and Utilization</th>
<th>Average Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Norm 8: Adequate Resources</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norm 9: Cost Effectiveness</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Focus Area Average</strong></td>
<td><strong>3.0</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Focus Area C: Statistical Processes</th>
<th>Average Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Norm 10: Sound Methodology and Appropriateness of Statistical Procedures</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norm 11: Non-Excessive Burden on Respondents</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Focus Area Average</strong></td>
<td><strong>3.2</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## RANKING & OVERALL SCORE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Focus Area D: Education Information Reporting</th>
<th>Average Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Norm 12: Relevance</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norm 13: Accuracy and Reliability</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norm 14: Timeliness and Punctuality</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norm 15: Coherence, Consistency, Comparability and Integration</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norm 16: Accessibility and Clarity</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norm 17: Comprehensiveness</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Focus Area Average</strong></td>
<td><strong>2.7</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONCLUSION

• Mozambique’s EMIS complies with SADC ENS
• Score of 3.0 = “Acceptable Education Statistics” – it is in the range of 2.6 – 3.3.
• Improvements required in key challenge areas:
  – Education information reporting
  – Policy and legal frameworks e.g. learner registration.
  – Resources (human and equipment)
• Incorporate recommendations into a 3-year Action Plan, supported by SADC Secretariat, ADEA and partners.