The Johannesburg

Biennale

The ADEA Biennial Meetings are the high point of the activities and life of the Association. Through these meetings, ADEA focuses its activities, sharpens its messages, and develops and maintains its momentum. From its inception, ADEA’s raison d’être has always been to develop improved understandings and partnerships amongst its members. This is the thread running through all our activities.

This claim is demonstrated by the themes of the past three Biennial Meetings. The 1995 Biennale (held in Tours, France) focused on the processes of formulating educational policies. The importance of the open and thoroughly informed participation of all concerned—national and external—in policy formulation and implementation was stressed by the background papers done for that meeting, as well as the discussions during the meeting. The importance of national ownership of the knowledge base for policy formulation was stressed. In his concluding remarks at that meeting, Ingemar Gustafsson, then Chair of the ADEA Steering Committee, noted that the words partnerships and capacity stood out clearly in the discussions and that the challenge of ADEA was to spell out their meanings.

The 1997 Biennale (held in Dakar) took up that challenge. The theme of that meeting was Partnerships for Capacity Building and Quality Improvements in Education. The background documentation and the discussions of that meeting explored the theory and practice of the partnerships that characterize the work of all the ADEA constituents—education ministers, development agencies and education professionals. Again, the role of relevant knowledge—how it is defined, developed, used and controlled—appeared to be central to the practice of effective partnerships.

With its theme of “What Works and What’s New in Education: Africa Speaks!”, the 1999 Biennale (held in Johannesburg) took the next logical step. It focused on the knowledge bases for viable policies and partnerships. The starting point was an understanding that effective and enduring partnerships are based on clear understandings of each partner’s assets—not on one partner’s assets and the other’s deficits. That is why the ADEA Steering Committee commissioned the “Prospective, Stocktaking Review of Education in Africa”. Through this exercise, 25 countries volunteered to present case studies on what works and has paid dividends in tackling issues of access, quality and capacity-building. A basic premise of this exercise was that the knowledge needed for education policy formulation

CONTENTS

The ADEA Biennale 1-8
Lessons of a Biennial Meeting 9-16
Fringe Meetings 18-23
Calendar 24
must, first and foremost, emerge from the experience of those most directly concerned. To prepare for the 1999 Biennale, ADEA took up this challenge and, in turn, challenged all African education ministries to identify and analyze interventions that have paid such dividends.

Mamadou Ndoye’s article in this issue discusses the outcomes and importance of this exercise, and of the Johannesburg Biennale at which it was presented and discussed, for the future of ADEA partnerships. His article points to the parallels between successful policymaking and pedagogy. Both work best when anchored in positive experience. The article demonstrates how and why this approach of learning-by-doing together has every chance of setting all parts of the ADEA partnership firmly on the road to the African Renaissance.

In addition to capturing the meaning and spirit of the Johannesburg Biennale, Mamadou Ndoye’s article (in Section 4: “The Process Matures”) maps out the forthcoming challenges for all of ADEA. The paper points out that as these challenges are met, priority must be given to issues related to the HIV/AIDS epidemic. In order to meet these challenges, the paper refers to the “praxis” approach (learning by doing) as the operational basis for the “new culture” which is needed, according to many present in Johannesburg, for the ADEA partners to successfully address the challenges of access, quality, capacity building, and HIV/AIDS. This praxis approach was put into motion by the Prospective, stocktaking exercise and the Johannesburg Biennale.

This issue of the Newsletter has taken the unusual step of publishing this very rich article in its entirety. The article paints an eloquent picture of the crossroads at which we find ourselves—those of us concerned with the development of education in Africa and with development cooperation for this end. Furthermore, it outlines the paths open to us in order to consolidate and sustain the progress achieved.

Richard Sack
Executive Secretary, ADEA
President Thabo Mbeki, president of South Africa, opens the Biennale

The ADEA Biennial Meeting was honored by the presence of Thabo Mbeki, president of South Africa. In his opening speech, Mr. Mbeki urged leaders to reform their education systems to reflect the needs of the region and to liberate the mind of the learners by building “mental universes of their own, for Africa’s progress and prosperity”. He hoped for an integrated approach to development and for the consolidation of a class of intellectuals that must not “reside in academic cocoons” but be active contributors to the building of African societies.

On development...

“...I think all of us recognize the fact that the development of our continent depends greatly on those among us who work in the area of education.

... I think all of us would recognize that nowhere in the world has sustained development been attained without a well functioning system of education, without universal and sound primary education, without an effective higher education and research sector, without equality of educational opportunity.

... I believe that our present phase of development requires a growth and consolidation of a class of intellectuals, whose fundamental task must be in the economic and social area. If we are to build entrepreneurs in Africa, we must at the same time build the intelligentsia.

...An integrated approach to development tells us that those who have technical skills and expertise must be complemented by those who are experts in economics and the arts and culture and the sciences, those who are directly involved in economic production.

...education...

...if we are in agreement that this is the road to take, we shall only realize these goals if we have common concerns. In our common concerns, I believe an African agenda for education should include the sharing of ideas and expertise so as to advance in practical ways the objective of African development.

...we must proceed with ongoing African studies and research, into our rich creative and cultural past and rekindle interest into African knowledge systems, so as to make younger generations aware of the achievements emanating from our continent and impress upon them their inherent creativity, that is setting the stage for new developments and discoveries.

...We must use, we must encourage the use of information technology in education, so as to link far-flung places and institutions of learning, to bridge the gap between the urban and rural areas, to enable African children to advance scientifically so as to compete on an equal footing with the rest of the world. The necessary modernisation of our economies depends on our improving the standards of science education and building our skills base in science, in technology and engineering. We must ensure that measures are put in place to ensure that women, especially those in rural areas, have access from which they may have been traditionally excluded.

...I think that all of us agree also that our intellectuals must not become intellectual elites who build academic cocoons in which they reside in relative comfort and complacency, relatively safe from the problems of the outside world, but they must actively build a human society, based on values of caring and cooperation.

...The HIV/AIDS epidemic is one area of concern that requires the urgent attention of our intellectuals. Therefore I am very pleased indeed that both the Education for All and the ADEA meetings will be tackling this issue head on for only in this way can solutions be identified.

...liberation and cooperation...

...I am pleased that ADEA has the sharing of African expertise as one of its central concerns through its programs and intra-African exchanges.

...In this way, the basis on which we operate together becomes that of true cooperation rather than competition between various countries and institutions to attract the greatest number of students.

... By focussing on successful African experiences in handling issues of access, of quality and capacity building in our education systems, the work of ADEA represents a necessary contribution to African development. Clearly the African child must no longer be subjected to any mental domination while we are liberating ourselves, and should now reside in mental universes of our own making, for our own progress and prosperity.

... Since our common concern is to complete the process of liberation by building a caring and humane African society, by bringing about sustained economic development, a sustained improvement in the life of our people, your contribution in ensuring our self development is crucial if we are to succeed...”

Excerpts from the opening speech delivered by THABO MBEKI, President of the Republic of South Africa
Every day, 11,000 people contract HIV/AIDS in Africa. According to UNAIDS, 70% or over 16 million cases are in Sub-Saharan Africa. The disease is having dramatic consequences for the education sector, undermining progress made in the last decade in many countries. In Johannesburg, a special breakaway session was devoted to this topic, focused on priority actions that need to be taken to address the disease and to limit the damage done in the education sector.

In Africa, the HIV/AIDS epidemic has reached crisis proportions that constitute an emergency situation calling for urgent responses. The consequences for the education sector are devastating, affecting not only children and teachers, but the whole system. The impact is felt on: (i) the demand for education (fewer births as people die young; children infected and dying; orphans and child heads of families unable to attend school); (ii) the supply of education (teachers dying at a rate greater than they can be replaced; increasing structural weaknesses and declining national wealth; competition from other sectors, such as health, thereby reducing resources for education); (iii) the quality and management of education (teacher absenteeism, loss of inspectors, administrators, planners and managers impacts on the social and community environments in which education is supported).

In Johannesburg, a special breakaway session was devoted to AIDS. Issues discussed included: strategies to stem the spread of AIDS among students and teachers; ways of dealing with the shrinking number of teachers and its impact on education provision; and, alternative approaches to education provision to offset the situation created by HIV/AIDS.

Four main priority areas were identified calling for immediate action:

1. There should be immediate, vigorous and wide-scale action in all schools and education institutions to cause changes in behavior.

   Saving the lives of those not yet infected with HIV—especially the 6-14 age group—is the highest priority. However, changing behavior is not an easy task. Indeed, experience has shown that simply providing information or advocating changes in attitude isn’t enough.

---

**What Education Can Do to HIV/AIDS**

**In the short and medium term:**

While as yet there is no infection, education has the potential to:
- provide knowledge that will inform self-protection
- foster the development of a personally held, constructive value system
- inculcate skills that will facilitate self-protection
- promote behavior that will lower infection risks
- enhance capacity to help others to protect themselves against risk

When infection has occurred, education has the potential to:
- strengthen the ability to cope with personal infection
- strengthen capacity to cope with family infection
- promote caring for those who are infected
- help young people stand up for the human rights that are threatened by their personal or family HIV/AIDS condition
- reduce stigma, silence, shame, discrimination

When AIDS has brought death, education has the potential to:
- Assist in coping with grief and loss
- Help in the reorganization of life after the death of family members
- Support the assertion of personal rights

**In the long term,** education has the potential to:
- Alleviate conditions, such as poverty, ignorance, gender discrimination that facilitate the spread of HIV/AIDS
- Reduce vulnerability to the risk situations of prostitution, streetism, dependence of women on men.

Source:
in Africa: the Agenda of ADEA

Based on experience, suggestions made in Johannesburg include:

- The introduction of regular and well-designed life skills programs into schools for children of all ages. Selected and properly trained teachers should deliver the programs. Programs must include practical approaches, e.g. use of drama and other participatory techniques that allow children to experience and practice examples of behavior change.

- The use of peers as role models for young people—these might include local youth, sports, stars, music stars and pop groups.

- The media (radio in particular) have a vital role to play in changing behavior. Radio is the most adapted medium as it is accessible to people everywhere and can deliver messages that are tailored to different groups in society in their own languages and idioms.

2. Efforts should be mobilized urgently to cope with the educational impacts of HIV/AIDS

Radical changes in strategy in the education sector will be needed to cope with decreases in demand, supply and resources:

- All available human resources will need to be mobilized to fill the growing gaps in people and in skills. Strategies may include: re-activating retired teachers; bringing in less skilled teaching assistants and then training them on the job; training more planners and managers and giving them better skills in forward planning to meet the projected problems.

- Planners must have a clearer picture of what is happening, which will require better information gathering.

- Innovative approaches that countries have been developing since Jomtien to meet shortages of schools and teachers and to reach out-of-school children in communities hold valuable lessons. Approaches include the use of volunteer teachers, and multi-grade teaching, based around community schooling and nonformal education. They can be adapted and built upon in the fight against HIV/AIDS. Overall, greater flexibility is required in the whole approach to education—emphasizing learning rather than schooling, and bringing in practical skills and entrepreneurship that young people will need for their survival.

3. The greater vulnerability of girls and women should be addressed

Females are more vulnerable than males to infection with HIV/AIDS:

- Females, and especially younger women, are more susceptible to infection with each act of unprotected intercourse. Even more importantly, women are more vulnerable socially, because of their relative lack of social and economic empowerment.

- Current efforts to empower girls and women through education must be continued and intensified. Furthermore, men must be sensitized and educated so that they break away from violent or domineering attitudes and behaviors.

Quotes from Johannesburg

- Educationists, researchers and Ministers of Education in various parts of Africa are all quite aware that all our work may actually be nullified if AIDS is allowed to run rampant, as it is threatening to do at the moment.

  Father Ssenganyo Mutebi, Deputy Minister of Education, South Africa

- The spreading of the HIV/AIDS epidemic on the continent is furthermore a matter of grave concern. More than 11 million Africans have already died and another 22 million are infected. In some countries the production of new teachers can hardly keep up with the number of colleagues who die every year. Accelerating education development should and must be a key element in efforts to alleviate poverty, fight the HIV/AIDS epidemic and provide the children of Africa with a better future.

  Sisel Yol, President of ADEA

- The strategy of articulating policy and raising consciousness should involve dialogue rather than decree. There are many examples which show that simply announcing a statement has almost counterproductive effects, whereas engaging people who have different views such as stakeholders, religious leaders, or parts of the society that have real problems dealing with the issues, is a very important strategy for formulating policies and actions. Now that is, of course, tremendously true for HIV/AIDS, which is so culturally sensitive.

  Ash Hartwell, Education Policy advisor USAID

- HIV/AIDS is not simply a health problem, but a major developmental problem. HIV/AIDS is now the leading cause of death in Africa... Schools provide the natural setting for dialogue on AIDS between teachers and students, amongst students themselves and with their parents and with their communities.

  Eduardo Doryan, Vice-President Human Development Network World Bank
The consequences for the education sector are devastating, affecting not only children and teachers, but the whole system. The impact is felt on: the demand for education, the supply of education and the quality and management of education.

4. At the country level, all sectors should be sensitized to the problem of AIDS and mobilized to sustain a very long and difficult battle. The international community must also be mobilized to take part in the battle.

Education and all other sectors must work together with governments and agencies in the fight against AIDS. Some immediate steps can be taken for this to happen:

- A sustained fight against HIV/AIDS will require much greater effort by everyone. HIV/AIDS should be a permanent and central concern in organizations, ministries and agencies.
- ADEA and all of its Working Groups should integrate AIDS in their thinking and activities wherever possible. The Working Group on the Teaching Profession was given the immediate task of developing a strategy for the teaching profession.
- It was recommended that steps should be taken to make HIV/AIDS an important theme to be discussed during the World Education Forum in Dakar in April 2000.

**Professor Stephen Matlin**
Commonwealth Secretariat

The “Prospective, Stock-Taking Review of Education in Africa” which was the basis of discussions in Johannesburg draws on the lessons learned from case studies produced by twenty-five countries and five ADEA Working Groups. The case studies report on national experiences which have addressed three major challenges facing education in Africa: access, quality and capacity development. They touch on a number of subjects, including: access to basic education for nomadic communities in Nigeria; cost-effective science teaching in secondary schools in Zimbabwe; addressing the shortage of trained teachers in Botswana; improving access through greater involvement of communities in the running and management of schools in Madagascar; the professional and career management of newly-recruited “auxiliary” teachers in Senegal; educational management information systems in Namibia and Côte d’Ivoire; and community schools in Mali, Burkina Faso, Burundi, Madagascar, Senegal, and other countries.

A list of themes covered by the case studies (by country and by Working Group) is provided in the following table. In Johannesburg, the country teams that produced the case studies were asked to improve them based on the comments made during the meeting. Indeed, few case studies provided sufficient empirical evidence of improvement of education outcomes as a result of the interventions. Many case studies lacked information on the costs and financing of the interventions. As the studies are finalized, ADEA is making them available on its Web Site at the following address:

http://www.adeanet.org

### What Works in ADEA’s “Prospective, Stock-Taking Review of Education in Africa”

#### Themes and topics by

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Access</th>
<th>Community/school partnerships</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Double-shift &amp; multi-grade classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Early childhood education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Education for disadvantaged groups (nomads, the handicapped)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Education during or after conflict situations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Higher education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Non-formal education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>School infrastructure and facilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>School meals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quality, Relevance and Curriculum and Instruction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Curriculum reform and assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Improving teacher quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Innovative teaching techniques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Instructional materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mother tongue education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>New modes of delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Upgrading substitute and untrained teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Vocational/technical education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Capacity Development and Management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Education planning, management, information systems and school mapping</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Higher education reform</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Human resource development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Institutional capacity building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Partnerships between ministries and agencies for sustained, ministry-led coordination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Regional partnerships</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Education in Africa

Africa” yields a rich stock of successful experiences in Africa

Participating Countries and Working Groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Countries</th>
<th>Working Groups</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Benin, Burkina Faso, Burundi, Côte d'Ivoire, Gambia, Madagascar, Mali, Nigeria, Senegal, Tanzania, Chad, Uganda, Zanzibar, Zimbabwe</td>
<td>Higher Education (East and Southern Africa)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cameroon, Côte d'Ivoire, Gambia, Guinea</td>
<td>Higher Education (Mozambique), Teaching Profession</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equatorial Guinea, Seychelles, Zanzibar</td>
<td>Higher Education (Cameroon)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Côte d'Ivoire, Mali, Nigeria</td>
<td>Teaching Profession (Anglophone &amp; Francophone)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberia, Benin, Côte d'Ivoire, Tanzania, Chad, Zambia, Zanzibar</td>
<td>Sector Analysis (in Burkina Faso, Ghana, Mozambique)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Africa, Benin, Namibia, Angola, Botswana, Lesotho, Seychelles</td>
<td>Female Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cameroon, Niger, Uganda, Zambia</td>
<td>Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zimbabwe, Mali, Niger</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria, Tanzania, South Africa</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesotho, Chad</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Quotes from Johannesburg

“"We must say, collectively, the barbarians will not pass, the barbarians of the mind, the barbarians who cause so much damage directly. It is a very important element for education. We have said all this for education for the new millennium, education for training, for development and for industrial development. What we must never lose sight of is education for citizenship, education for respect for the democratic, constitutional order.”

Professor Kader Asmal
Minister of Education, South Africa

“"The main responsibility for education must, be anchored at the national level, with the Ministers of Education as front players. But the Ministers need partners at the national and international levels. ADEA’s mandate is to promote partnerships. The building and the sustaining of partnerships between funding agencies and African ministers of education, between African professionals and professionals from the North and between individuals of all these categories are at the core of ADEA’s work.”

Sisvel Volan
President of ADEA

“The focus on challenges has underdeveloped the indigenous capacity to project an image of success within the African region. It has also oriented the search for solutions to problems facing education in Africa outward. The trend has been: “If you are looking for solutions to problems in education in Africa, look outward. If you are looking for problems, they are right here.” This image of lack of resourcefulness has sustained dependency on external knowledge systems to chart the direction for the development of education in the region. The Prospective, Stock-Taking Study has tried to reorient that trend. So there was also a political agenda to the Study: to reorient agencies and governments to look to the ground for potential solutions.”

P.L.M. Marope
Leader of the technical team for the Prospective, Stock-Taking Study

“My advice to my African brothers is that it is not good manners to have your friend and the donors do your work; nor is it good manners to always want to do the work of your friend. It is not good manners to listen to other people’s music. Let’s get our trumpets, dust them off and blow them.”

Mr. Amany Mushenga
Minister of Public Affairs, Uganda
former Minister of Education
The Ministers’ Forum in Johannesburg (8 December 1999)

ADEA supports and facilitates regular meetings of the Caucus of Ministers of Education from sub-Saharan Africa. In Johannesburg, the Caucus of Ministers approved the composition of the new Bureau of Ministers, which is made up of ten Ministers nominated to serve on ADEA’s Steering Committee. Discussions also focused on the follow-up to the “Prospective, Stock-Taking Review of Education in Africa”.

The Forum of Ministers of Education from sub-Saharan Africa met during the ADEA Biennale. Some 28 Ministers attended the meeting which was presided by Hon. Mr Bireme Abderahim Hamid, Minister of Education of Chad. The main points discussed were: election of the president and vice president of the Bureau of Ministers and nomination of other new members on the Bureau; evaluation of the ADEA Working Groups; and future activities for ADEA’s “Prospective, Stock-Taking Review of Education in Africa”.

New Bureau members

The Ministers’ Bureau is made up of ten Ministers of Education representing the five sub-regions of sub-Saharan Africa (Southern Africa, West Africa, East Africa, Central Africa, and Indian Ocean). They are nominated for four years and sit on the ADEA the Steering Committee.

In Johannesburg, the Ministers unanimously elected the Hon. Mr Hamid from Chad as their president, and the Hon. Mr Lehohla of Lesotho as vice president. They also agreed on the following new composition of the Bureau: South Africa and Lesotho will represent southern Africa; Guinea Bissau, Liberia and Senegal—West Africa; Eritrea and Tanzania—East Africa; Burundi and Chad—Central Africa; and Madagascar—the Indian Ocean.

Evaluation of the Working groups

Ms Diane Prouty (USAID) and Mr Aimé Damiba (Burkina Faso), the two consultants leading the ADEA working group evaluation, presented a brief overview of the work done so far. Following a decision of the ADEA steering committee in October 1998, the evaluation expects to define the role of the working groups, their usefulness for the ministers of education, and their impact on countries.

The evaluation results will be discussed at the Steering Committee of ADEA at the end of April.

Prospective Stock-taking of education in Africa: some recommendations

The Ministers were invited to give their assessment of the Prospective Stock-taking exercise and the Biennale in Johannesburg. They thought the work undertaken for the Stocktaking was useful and hoped it would be extended to other countries.

Nevertheless, the ministers made several recommendations: the need to institutionalize a culture of research, critical analysis and the documentation of experiments in their countries; and the need to install systematic mechanisms for following up and evaluating existing programs—especially where costs are concerned. They also wanted the question of quality, the “poor relative” of case studies, to be more fully explored.

[1] The choice of the Bureau’s member countries is determined by a system of rotation by alphabetical order within the five sub-regions.
Towards an African Renaissance and Renewed Partnerships: Lessons from a Biennial Meeting

by Mamadou Ndoye*

In the following article, Mamadou Ndoye presents the theme of the meeting, assesses the results of the “Prospective, Stock-Taking Exercise” and draws lessons from the exercise. In the final part of the article, he lists what needs to be done in the next few years in order for the XXIst century to be Africa’s.

Introduction

With its structured informality, the Biennial Meeting is the mirror image of ADEA. It produces no official conclusion because the discussions are informal and centered around issues or themes, targets and processes. This year, the focus for discussion was the Prospective Stock-Taking Study of Education in Africa, entitled “What Works and What’s New in Education: Africa Speaks!” Under this banner participants examined and debated the major reforms at stake in addressing key development objectives in education.

What has happened in Africa since the World Bank policy study, “Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: policies for adjustment, revitalization and expansion,” was published in 1988?[1] Or rather, what has “worked” in African education? What were the benchmarks for measuring success? And what are the different factors involved? How can the various actors—Ministries and education professionals, partner agencies—learn from the experience so as to give new impetus to their efforts at success and thus meet the major challenges which remain for education in Africa: access/equity, quality/relevance, management/monitoring.

The Prospective Stock-Taking Study

In April 1998, the ADEA Steering Committee considered these challenges and asked Ministries of Education and ADEA Working Groups to identify promising responses that had already been tested in the African context, to establish the benchmarks for success and to analyze the processes, conditions and factors leading to it. The exercise was to be broadly participatory, in order to involve the actual stakeholders on the ground in an ongoing process of improvement, linking introspective critical thinking, learning-from-success, and improved performance.

Twenty-five national teams and seven working groups volunteered to participate. The studies covered a broad sample of innovations, ranging from early childhood to higher education, and including technical education and vocational training, secondary and primary education and non-formal education. In all these areas, a variety of subjects was covered, the principal ones being how to accelerate access to education, with particular reference to policies of equity and female enrollment; community involvement; employment of teachers; curriculum reform; teaching materials and textbooks; language of instruction; school infrastructure; evaluation; data management and planning.

It is essential to have political will and committed leadership at the highest national level if educational development policies are to succeed.

---

* Mamadou Ndoye has degrees in philosophy, general and comparative psychology and education research. He started his career as a teacher, teaching at all levels, from primary to tertiary. He then worked as an inspector and researcher in education. During the same period, he was Secretary General of a Teachers’ Union in Senegal and Vice-President of the International Federation of Teacher Unions. He was Minister of Basic Education and National Languages in Senegal between 1993 and 1998. He is currently Coordinator for the United Nations Special Initiative for Africa (UNSIA) at the World Bank.

[1]: “Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: Policies for Adjustment, Revitalization and Expansion”, World Bank, 1988. This publication was the basis for setting up ADEA and defining its mission.
After subregional consultations to exchange findings and improve on the initial drafts, the small technical team—that, from the beginning, provided continuous professional support to the work at country level—produced a synthesis of the country case studies and those conducted by the Working Groups to highlight the principal discoveries and lessons learned. These are summarized here:

- A context of democratization and consequent concern for equality are significant factors for expanding access to education and improving quality.
- It is essential to have political will and committed leadership at the highest national level if educational development policies are to succeed.
- The onset of implementation should not be held hostage to the completion of all planning processes. The success of innovations depends upon a judicious balancing between the urgency to act and the necessity to plan. Not everything has to be in place before you can start.
- Inclusive consultation and consensus building with all stakeholders and development partners are crucial for the development of effective and pertinent educational policy that enjoys wide support.
- Creating space for initiative and innovation from alternative (non-governmental) providers is a vibrant source of resources and ideas for improving education.
- Enabling communities to provide, themselves, for access to relevant education services—rather than leaving provision entirely to national governments—can create conditions for sustainable and effective educational development.
- Efforts to decentralize the provision, management and control of education systems are progressing, but need to build on the realities and needs of local context, and on processes that are familiar, acceptable and capable of achieving results.
- There needs to be more intensive use of research and analysis in planning for change because successful development and implementation depends upon it.
- Developing education systems is a complex matter: a holistic and multifaceted approach can deliver the desired impact. No single measure can address all challenges.
- In certain contexts, innovative teacher recruitment strategies, accompanied by extensive consultation and communication, can create the conditions for considerably expanding access to education.
- Financial analysis is still very weak and not integrated into the culture of education ministries. Effort needs to be made to build their capacity for financial analysis to evaluate the advantages of all proposed interventions.
- Investing in the development of networks of education professionals who are working on similar issues gives high returns in cost-effective sharing and development of knowledge across the continent.
- External financing and technical partners play an important role in educational development.
- The analytical capacity of education ministries is improving, but there is still room for improvement.
- Attention must be paid to the systematic linking of education inputs to processes, and to the linking of inputs and processes to outcomes, to gain the cumulative wisdom of what resources and processes are best at leveraging the development of education.

**Discussions at the Biennial Meeting**

Discussions took place in ten panels that met in plenary session, and in six breakaway sessions.

It is not easy to make a selection from these productive debates in which widely differing views were expressed and so many far-reaching ideas were advanced. However, an attempt must be made to adopt a perspective that allows an overview. What are the main ideas which emerged from the discussions at the Biennial Meeting in the context of African renaissance and renewal of partnerships?

1. The Prospective Stock-Taking Study is resolutely forward-looking

Stock-taking often involves looking back to measure the road already traveled and to compare results obtained with the initial goals. By making the stock taking “prospective”, the ADEA Steering Committee deliberately tried to affirm the basic originality of this study. The idea was to learn about “what works” from the past as well as the present, and to use this knowledge to build the future by identifying successful policy directions, experimental hypotheses, strategies for action and action research. Accordingly, although firmly anchored in experience, the Study does not cap a process but, rather, initiates one. It is therefore only a starting-point. This is precisely what the Biennial Meeting is intended to promote among the ADEA partners: African Ministers of Education, bilateral and multilateral partner agencies and education professionals, including university researchers. The discussions in Johannesburg were expected to look ahead and to discover if not the destina-
tion, at least the horizon to be reached as we advance in the process. The meeting provided the forum for conceptual elucidation through discussion. There was a sharing of principles and philosophical directions, of methods and instruments enabling us to embark on the process and develop it further.

Where should this process lead in a future which is being built only gradually with a medium and long-term view in mind?

2. The exercise commits Africa and its partners to developing a new institutional culture

The originality of the exercise lies in the type of change it sets in motion. Its main feature and main goal are to transform attitudes, ways of operating, and approaches of the institutions and individuals concerned as they meet the challenges facing education in Africa. There are roughly three fundamental elements in this “new culture” which must be perpetuated by the process, and these are described below.

- The “endogenous” approach to problem-solving

Answers to Africa’s education problems have all too often been sought elsewhere. Now a new approach is being adopted. Answers to Africa’s education challenges exist in and must, therefore, be sought first of all in the African context. When we remember how exogenous the approaches to education in Africa were, and how strong the underlying historical emphasis, we realize that a Copernican revolution is now being proposed as we search for solutions to Africa’s education problems. In other words, in preparing for reforms as well as for their implementation by ministries, Africa is where the relevant knowledge and the responses will be found, and no longer just the place where solutions from elsewhere are applied. The agencies will no longer gear their assistance to the “search for (African) problems to the solutions” which they possess by contracting assistance projects to be delivered without reference to any real internal request, instead of projects desired and described by the recipient countries. Rather, the agencies would look first to Africa, where they would identify solutions tested in the African context to help in solving African problems.

This new Afro-centric approach does not mean that Africa would no longer learn from others. On the contrary: by building a solid, endogenous cognitive foundation of good practice and effective knowledge, Africa can acquire the capacity to receive and adapt lessons learned from different contexts in order to spearhead the cumulative process of its own development.

The value of this approach has been definitely confirmed by the stock-taking exercise. Despite the short time available for the research, the harvest was impressive and promising. Already, it has strongly encouraged the African Ministers to trust and adopt the endogenous approach. It has encouraged the partner agencies to give their support to these internal efforts and processes. In so doing, it also resolves the nagging question of ownership which always arises in development cooperation projects.

- Nothing succeeds like success

Afro-pessimism feeds on what is wrong in Africa. In contrast, the Study conveys the message and the reality of a new and positive vision of Africa. This viewpoint derives from the second hypothesis. African education systems are not, as is often claimed, made up only of failures and crises. They embody an appreciable number of good practices and successful policies which have proven their effectiveness in dealing with the challenges posed. These deserve to be publicized, since one learns not only from one’s errors and mistakes but also from one’s successes.

The exemplary value of success is that it generates further success. In order to obtain a chain reaction, experience has shown that we must first document successful experiences. This enables us to teach the relevant lessons which they contain and to disseminate them so they exert their attraction and are replicated.
The emotional stakes involved in changing attitudes and ideas are high when we consider the new mind-set which Africa needs so much today: the wish to succeed now and, above all, a belief in the possibility of success. In the long run, the analysis of success by the stakeholders in education creates a cognitive process of understanding and capitalizing upon identified factors and conditions, which opens up new roads to success by revealing the access routes, the itinerary and the dynamics of getting there.

Each country can thus learn from its own national successes how to do something different, something more and something better. The successes must be evaluated and the hows and whys analyzed and understood so that, on the basis of the knowledge acquired, it will be possible to assess the conditions, the factors and, therefore, a country’s policy assets in order to replicate the success at other levels and on a broader scale. Of course, we know that nothing will be simple, but everything becomes possible if we invest in the needed effort and time.

If successful experiences can be utilized, emulated, and transferred, then the successes and lessons of the other African countries with similar contexts need to be communicated. Why has a particular country, experiencing constraints similar to those of my country (limited finances, population size, rapid population growth), nevertheless succeeded in providing universal education? Cannot my country follow the same route? Would they not learn to listen better, to dialogue better and to cooperate better, in order to succeed better?

By focusing on the application of action-derived theory to achieve progress in action, the praxis approach permits a fruitful synthesis of the results of interpretive and positivist research. It allows such research to be translated into practice. Through comprehension and transformation of the behavior of the actors and through knowledge and manipulation of the phenomena underlying the action, the praxis approach represents the ideal crossroads of a thought process which mobilizes and guides everything towards practical applications for development purposes.

In other words, the advantage of this approach is that it uncovers the long-concealed face of the continent—successful Africa. This promotes even more success. The pathways are opened up and made accessible when we reveal their potential and clear the way ahead. What wonderful prospects and incentives to remove the apparent roadblocks and win the battles of development!

- The “praxis” approach: learning by doing

Although optimistic, this “new culture” does not feed on myth and even less on Utopias. Nor is it based on abstract speculations. It is in action, reflection on action and improved performance that we find successful responses to challenges. This is why praxis characterizes the distinctive type and methodological basis of the approach advocated here.

The analysis of successful experiences is a process of critical evaluation of political, strategic and technical practices relating to education in Africa. Through such analysis, the Ministries generate knowledge derived from the field of social practice in the African context.

They can reinvest this knowledge in symbiosis with the special characteristics of the environment, to develop innovative policies and strategies for educational development.

Consequently, this is an action-research-action process in which there is an effort to give theoretical meaning to observed practice in order to build up knowledge and know-how that are highly relevant to the search for solutions to the problems of educational development. At the same time, an individual and social process of training and capacity-building occurs in the participatory aspect of research. The actors distance themselves from their own actions and engage in interactive reflection as a team. They then return refreshed and enriched to a collective project of improvement and/or extension of the successful action. The strength and effectiveness of this learning process derives from the fact that it is both entrenched and active. It pushes the country teams into building up their own knowledge and autonomy in the production and utilization of the knowledge produced. The learning process is also highly motivating because it becomes fully meaningful when it is useful and/
or usable in daily problem-solving. As a result, the actors participating in the exercise gain confidence in their ability to meet challenges facing education in Africa.

By focusing on the application of action-derived theory to achieve progress in action, the praxis approach permits a fruitful synthesis of the results of interpretive and positivist research. It allows such research to be translated into practice. Through comprehension and transformation of the behavior of the actors and through knowledge and manipulation of the phenomena underlying the action, the praxis approach represents the ideal crossroads of a thought process which mobilizes and guides everything towards practical applications for development purposes. This convergence is another reason for the education professionals involved to forge partnerships with academic researchers.

3. Critical questions asked at the Biennial Meeting

The fact that the participants were very interested in the Study and its results did not signify blind acceptance. The case studies were subjected to rigorous critical examination during the discussions at the Biennial Meeting, where the main questions raised were epistemological and methodological.

• First of all, were the experiments presented really successes?

Certain experiments analyzed were considered too recent and therefore too short-lived to be presented as success stories. In general, the transformation into theory of a practice as a source of knowledge requires a certain completion or a definite completion of the action. (Minerva’s bird does not fly away until nightfall.) Therefore, in order to reach sound conclusions about their success, or lack thereof, it is necessary to allow a certain lapse of time before evaluating the experiences. In addition, doubt was cast on the credibility of some claims of success for lack of sufficient proof. Evaluation is essential before there can be any validation of these claims.

A number of case studies presented were criticized for being too descriptive and therefore insufficiently analytical to be suitable models. It was felt this made it difficult to learn from them, because the process, conditions and factors explaining the success were not sufficiently clear. Often, the conceptual and/or methodological framework of the research was not sufficiently defined to provide a clear link between the problem at issue, the approach adopted, and the results obtained. In general, methodological weaknesses which indicate—as conclusions were reached—the absence of rigorous scientific analysis were pointed out.

Lastly, complex questions were raised about whether experiences could be transferred and replicated. Given the objections raised in certain criticisms mentioned above, and that factors of success cited in certain studies were markedly contextual in nature, transferability was, at times, put into doubt.

Essentially, two general responses were provided to these questions.

Firstly, these critical comments were mostly justified. They were not so much doubts about the approach itself and its raison d’être, as they were signals about challenges which must be resolved as the process matures. At this initial stage, it is understandable that promising experiments should outnumber those whose success has been rigorously proved, and that more detailed and in-depth analysis should still be required.

Secondly, the process is only in its initial stages and it is too soon to evaluate results, especially as the main purpose of the Study was simply to encourage, through the Biennial Meeting, a trend which still needs to be consolidated in the long term.

For this reason, the really important question at this stage is whether the Biennial Meeting enabled the participants to embark on the process which the Study was explicitly designed to promote.

3. The experience of the Biennial Meeting and the process

The Biennial Meeting was definitely an important forum for in-depth and wide-ranging discussions on the Study. It was also supposed to be the ideal place for publicizing and sharing the lessons learned in order to initiate the process.

How did the participants experience what happened at the Biennial Meeting?

It was highly revealing to listen to what the participants had to say about how they experienced the process, as regards both the nature of the desired change and its immediate impact.

“This is extremely introspective,” one participant said. It is true that the participants felt very strongly motivated to look within themselves: Not simply the necessary Socratic “know thyself,” requiring critical examination (irony) and self-construction of knowledge (maieutics) permitting access to true knowledge. But also re-thinking as self-investigation of a collective ego in relation to a specific socio-historical experience in order to engage in a profound internal evaluation and intimate re-acquaintance with one’s best potential. This, then, can be used to engineer a renaissance, in a process similar to the one that enabled Europe to emerge from the long night of the Middle Ages.

“It is very much like psycho-therapy,” said another participant. Dependency creates a feeling of powerlessness and stifles initiative. This is because one is convinced that one can neither create nor invent solutions appropriate to one’s needs and therefore must live in the shadow of others. The goal is to restore autonomy to one’s way of being, thinking and acting, so as to become one’s own launching pad. In order to succeed in this reconstruction endeavor—merging personality and project—one must first regain self-confidence and confidence in one’s ability.
to succeed. This is a necessary prerequisite for taking the initiative again and constructing the tools (particularly knowledge and know-how) of self-promotion.

Clearly, the emotional impact of the Biennial Meeting permeates these reactions. It requires that the process be incorporated into attitudes and presentations, even into commitments. At the same time, however, the critical nature of the approach gives a preview of the cultural change required: in cognitive terms of refocusing research (turning inward, toward one’s actions) and achieving self-sufficiency (end of dependency) in Africa; and in the knowledge system, which must evolve relevant development strategies by utilizing endogenous potential to succeed.

- Did the Biennial Meeting really embody this change process?

Once again, a participant replies: “Yes, we are convinced.” The lessons conveyed by the Study and the discussions of it were shared at this stage of the process. In particular, the determination to learn from one’s own successes and to learn from the successful experiences of other countries was frequently mentioned during the discussions, particularly by Ministers of Education. This was one reason why the Biennial Meeting was unanimously thought to have been a success. So, what are the next steps?

4. The process matures

Now that belief, motivation and commitment have emerged from the Biennial Meeting through the study’s approach of learning by example, and that there is broad recognition of the direction in which a new institutional culture must be forged, the task is to encourage the process to mature by extending and systematizing the exercise.

- Each of the partners in ADEA has a role to play here.

In the forefront, the Ministers of Education responsible for developing the sector must institutionalize the process by committing to it (in the case of those who could not do so during the first stage) and developing it (in the case of those who are already engaged in the exercise). In their Ministries, they will systematize the follow-up, evaluation and monitoring of successful actions in order to instill at all levels a culture of analyzing success. They will periodically evaluate the actions taken and will produce and reinvest the lessons learned from such experiences. They will thus be able gradually to constitute a knowledge base about what really works in their distinctive contexts, to strengthen national expertise and to create a structured team of professionals who are capable of guiding strategic thinking to synthesize the lessons learned and give them concrete expression in policies, programs and actions. In this connection, as can be seen from the studies presented on the use of African languages as the medium of instruction, one of the challenges will be to elevate to the status of national policy the pilot experiments which have proven successful and which have not yet acquired that status—often because of the lack of follow-up and political decisiveness. More generally, the Ministers will explore ways and means of incorporating relevant discoveries and lessons gleaned from major research into reform policies.

At the appropriate subregional level, the Ministers will organize networks of exchange and cooperation to permit the creation of a culture of intra-African discourse, so as to become more aware of successful experiences, acquire broader and deeper knowledge of what works in the African context, learn from each other and share the benefits of success. Two supporting actions are indispensable to ensuring that these exchanges occur on a systematic basis. One

The “Family photo”: African Ministers of Education, the President and the Executive Secretary of ADEA at the Mövenpick Indaba Hotel and Conference Center, Johannesburg, South Africa.

Photo by: Stephen Keet
is to train and put in place the operational and management capacity to facilitate access to the ministries’ accumulated knowledge. The second action is to engage in large scale use of new information and communication technologies to disseminate knowledge to all interested parties and promote more frequent and intensive interchange.

Continuing what was done by the countries and ADEA working groups, the partner agencies could usefully embark on identifying and analyzing success stories in development assistance, bearing in mind the countries’ needs and the criteria of relevance, efficiency and effectiveness. The agencies will cooperate more closely amongst themselves to develop a dialogue about what works in providing assistance to educational development in Africa. This would promote better coordination of their strategies and greater cohesion and effectiveness in their activities. It would also strengthen the process by concentrating more on what is happening in the reality of the African context, thus contributing to the necessary consensus about reforms and to renewing partnerships based on greater confidence in internal problem-solving potential. In so doing, they will utilize mainly local expertise in the studies, research and evaluations which they commission in Africa in order better to support the development of African capacities for analysis, design and planning. Through support of local institutions, the agencies will promote networking and knowledge sharing.

The education professionals working in the Ministries will be responsible for pursuing the process now initiated with the national studies, while meeting the scientific challenges posed by the critical comments made at the Biennial Meeting regarding the analysis. In performing this task, the education professionals will also consider the important aspects of costs and funding which were unfortunately omitted from the initial analysis of successful experiences — although these aspects are the decisive ones in a context of dwindling resources.

The creation of the new institutional culture will undoubtedly depend on the ability of the education professionals to incorporate continuous development into their own practices, based on critical evaluation and appropriate use of the lessons gleaned. They will also expand the horizons of the studies and of the culture of analysis by involving the other actors and partners in education and by learning from successful experiences in other African countries.

In their efforts to entrench and expand the process, they will work more closely with education professionals at universities and research institutes so as to benefit from their conceptual, methodological and instrumental inputs. This assumes, of course, that such institutions gear their research to development needs. The involvement of networks of university researchers studying education would undoubtedly help the process to mature because they would contribute scientific clarity and detail, and enrich the praxis approach by broadening perspectives on the issues and strategies at play.

For its part, ADEA will support the exercise in countries, the ADEA Working Groups and agencies, and will provide regional follow-up. In so doing, ADEA will have to consolidate the ties of confidence and collegiality created during the exercise between its small team, the national teams and the Working Groups, in order to ensure continuity in the process and strengthen the professional basis of the exchanges. As a forum for meetings and exchanges, ADEA will publicize the results achieved. In order to promote the dissemination of information and knowledge sharing, it will set up arrangements based on its Communication for Education and Development (COMED) and Intra-African Exchange Programs as well as the ADEA Web site (www.adeanet.org).

5. Education and the AIDS/HIV epidemic

The subject of HIV/AIDS was raised throughout the Biennial Meeting. Because of the extent of the epidemic and its devastating effects in African countries, AIDS is no longer simply a public health problem. It constitutes a major obstacle to development. Education is involved in various ways. Firstly, because those principally concerned with education—teachers, students and parents—are falling victim to AIDS in absolutely unacceptable numbers. In certain countries, it is said that the number of teachers who die of AIDS doubles each year. This means that schools are deprived of experienced staff to provide quality service. In other countries, AIDS kills more teachers than are trained each year. In addition, because of the lack of a vaccine and the prohibitive cost of care, education has a leading role to play in bringing about the behavioral changes needed to prevent the disease. For all these reasons, AIDS is a real challenge to education in Africa.

During the discussions, several suggestions were made on how to incorporate efforts to combat AIDS into educational policies, in particular through:

- Appropriate and forceful action to promote the social and economic empowerment of women in order to enhance their ability to resist male violence, which often forces inappropriate sexual relations on them;
- Campaigns urging men to respect women’s dignity and right to protect themselves;
- Using education in the efforts to combat AIDS, through curricula for both teacher and student training;
- Systematic information campaigns on AIDS, particularly through regular allocation of time for this purpose at all meetings.

Following up on points raised at the Biennial Meeting, several participants proposed that the problems caused by the epidemic should be included in the on-
going process. Countries and their partners should identify African success stories in the struggle against AIDS, analyze them and learn lessons from them to be shared while developing appropriate national strategies.

**Conclusion. African renaissance: a new century for Africa**

As the Biennial Meeting comes to an end, a new century is dawning. In the education sector, the path has just been mapped out for the rebirth of Africa—vividly described by the South African President, Thabo Mbeki, when he opened the Meeting. It has been shown that an Africa that wins does exist. By working to know it better and to make it better known, and by learning from it, Africans are capable of achieving an epistemological breakthrough in the system of knowledge regarding education in Africa. With such an approach underlying the search for African solutions to the major challenges, the movement is under way. This is the process of African renaissance. In other words, while politicians and researchers are working on the concept of the African renaissance in terms of inspiring visions, conceptualization/clarification and inventory/illustration, the process seeks to implement the concept by planting it in the soil of education through the practical implementation of a new institutional culture. If the leading actors are effectively engaged in the process, a new Africa will gradually emerge through the accumulation and improvement of promising responses. While it is true that all sectors contribute to the African renaissance, education remains the fundamental medium for developing human potential for invention, creation and social transformation. In other words, education is an essential prerequisite and a powerful stimulus for the new direction to be followed by African development, in the era of the planetary village and the economy of knowledge.

The endeavor also provides useful opportunities for the promotion of new partnerships. The extent of the change to be effected requires transforming relations between African Ministries of Education and their development partners, and also the roles and status assigned to each of them. Authentic political dialogue assumes equality and trust among partners. Authentic political dialogue assumes equality and trust among partners. A clear contractual relationship defines the interests at stake, an appropriate distribution of responsibilities on the basis of legitimate claims and all the prerequisites for the promotion of new partnerships. For this, the countries must be in the driver’s seat defining priorities, implementing policies and coordinating donors. If they are to do this effectively, they must be able independently to produce and use relevant information derived from their own experience in the African context.

For this reason, the new partnerships for capacity building and the implications stemming from their incorporation into broad sectoral approaches, firmly implanted in the countries’ experience, converge—one might say, almost naturally—in the movement towards an African renaissance, via the Biennial Meetings of Dakar (1997) and Johannesburg (1999).

By joining forces, they will together, help make the twenty-first century the century of Africa. More than a wish, this is a goal; its attainment will depend upon the determination and perseverance of the stakeholders and their partners as they advance in the process which is already under way.

As in the past, the proceedings of the Johannesburg Biennial Meeting will be published.

Readers interested in the proceedings may contact the ADEA Secretariat for a copy of the publication.
Benin Study Tour to Guinea

One of the objectives of the Prospective, Stock-Taking Review is to promote an Intra-African exchange culture of information and experience. This is also the goal of ADEA’s Intra-African Exchange Program. While the Biennale was taking place, a delegation from Benin travelled to Guinea to study policies in place for upgrading education personnel.

A Beninese delegation composed of managers responsible for human resources in the National Ministry of Education and Scientific Research made a study tour to Guinea December 3-14.

Benin is currently engaged in implementing a policy for upgrading education personnel. For this reason, the department of Human Resources in the Ministry of Education organized a study tour to selected African countries having similar educational systems.

Visits were made to technical departments to the Ministries of Pre-University Education, Public Service and to several schools. The delegation identified those experiences with something to add to policies in Benin:

- **The management of temporary teachers:** This one is a model because the terms on the conditions of contract renewal and the criteria for admission to the teaching ranks are spelled out clearly. The State also trains part-time teachers ("contractuels") through its teacher-training schools.

- **The stability of teachers’ positions:** Guinea has instituted a system that ensures stability in each post; thus, after the three years that are obligatory at the start of one’s career, no teacher can be transferred without having requested it except when absolutely necessary.

- **Managing rewards:** Until such time as the awarding of distinctions has been institutionalized by the Grand Chancel- lory of the National Order of Guinea, the Ministries of Education are taking internal measures to reward deserving teachers. A special commission in which everyone participates, takes charge of designating the winners.

- **Community participation in school management:** The community contributes to the national investment effort by partially underwriting the cost of feeding and lodging the entry-level teachers while their financial situation is being sorted out. It also contributes to the end-of-year bonuses.

- **Statistical yearbooks as a decision-making tool:** The delegation noted how much importance the Guinean authorities give to the department of Educational Statistics and its many publications.

- **The decentralization experience:** A whole range of strategies has been put in place to help basic administrative structures become self-sufficient and become fully integrated in the management of local educational institutions.

- **Union participation in managing the educational system:** Also attracted the delegation’s attention because in Guinea, these two, often antagonistic, institutions have established a solid partnership.

- **The experience of redeploying teachers:** Gave positive results in Guinea. This is a major accomplishment because it is well know that this arduous task has caused serious problems in many African countries because of hostile social and political environments.

- **The identification of deprived areas:** By the Council of Ministers and the awarding of a bonus to teachers serving in such posts also attracted attention.

- **Finally, the existence of information sheets and a compendium of laws and regulations:** was noted. This is an internal initiative by the Department of Information, Documentation and Archives.

**Thierry Hountondji**
**Member of the delegation and member of the National Working Group on the Teaching Profession in Benin**

---

**Quotes from Johannesburg**

- "The Prospective, Stock-Taking Exercise has enhanced national expertise, reinforced the confidence of local managers and built capacities. The Ministers expressed the need to institutionalize the process engaged by the Study in order to contribute to the development of a culture of documentation, research and analysis. They also expressed the need to implement follow-up and evaluation mechanisms that would address costs." --- Mr. Bireme Abderrahim Hamid, Minister of National Education, Chad

- "I think we need to share experience, but we also need to share dreams. It is the dream we carry in secret, that something miraculous will happen, that it must happen. To share our experience of what works and what does not work is probably one of the best ways of stimulating development…. In the last 25 years, Nordic cooperation in education has been a formal part of the Nordic cultural agreement. There is no doubt that this exchange of views and experience has been invaluable. It has played an important role in the development of the educational systems of the Nordic countries." --- John Lilletun, Minister of Education, Research and Church Affairs, Norway

- "The sustainability of the education reform programs implemented in Africa, with particular reference to universal primary education, depends on sustainability and on political commitment. Several political parties have their own ways of organizing their activities and their different agenda, but I believe that universal primary education should not be negotiable, all political parties should be made to sign a memorandum of understanding, that whoever comes to power is going to embark and sustain this program. This is very vital." --- Mr. Kwabena Kyereh, Vice-Minister of Education, Ghana
A seminar organized by the International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP) on community and private schools was held December 5, 2000. It was open to anyone present in Johannesburg for the ADEA meetings. Some 50 participants, including several ministers and permanent secretaries, attended the presentations and took part in the debates.

**Community schools: replication of the formal model or something new?**

The morning was devoted to community schools. Four studies on Mali, Senegal, Chad and Togo were presented. These studies were undertaken with IIEP at the request of the World Bank and financed by Norwegian funds available through the United Nations Initiative for Africa.

In the face of a demand for schooling not being met by the State, many communities have gone ahead to create their own schools, especially in rural areas. These are usually modeled on public schools and have few resources, such as the community schools in Chad or Mali and those created by local initiative in Togo. In other cases, the State has persuaded schools to take responsibility for a new type of education, testing out interesting alternative methods of teaching that are adapted to local conditions or that respond to the training needs of out-of-school youth—such as basic education community schools in Senegal or the education for development centers in Mali.

In those alternative community programs where the impetus has come from the State, the teaching is different from practices in formal schools and benefits from methods used in literacy training.

The two approaches are also fundamentally different in their outcomes: offering basic education equivalent to that found in formal public education and with the possibility to go on to secondary school; or offering training based on participation in the rural environment. The differences are also evident in the target audience, which is older in the case of the alternative model. Faced with such choices, families often respond in contradictory ways: they want the school to serve local development needs, yet they may also want their children to have more years of schooling, even at the expense of their leaving home.

Community participation poses its own problems. When it depends on a small number of people, local enthusiasm can dry up over time, causing the erosion of good will and community resources. The teachers, well integrated in the local milieu and often coming from the community, may become dissatisfied with their uncertain status, the absence of a work contract or their poor pay.

Nevertheless, the social dynamism, the developing of local partnerships and the involvement of communities in the definitions of content and outcomes are among the many advantages conferred by supporting and consolidating community initiatives.

**Private education**

The afternoon was devoted to private education. Four IIEP studies based on Cameroon, the province of KwaZulu Natal in South Africa, continental Tanzania, and Zanzibar introduced discussions on the school situation, public policies, conditions and development prospects for the private sector.

Where private education is not well developed, as in KwaZulu Natal, the private schools serve the needs of particular communities, such as Moslems, Indians, Catholics or German-speakers, or they are intended for the wealthiest segments of the population. In Tanzania, where private schools were forbidden for a long time, their numbers are increasing in primary education. This is because they use English as the language of instruction, which allows families to avoid the Kiswahili used in public schools and to prepare their children better for secondary studies.

In continental Tanzania the deliberate limitation of public secondary school openings has led to the development of a market for private schools.

Cameroon is an example of a country where private education is very developed, accommodating more than a fourth of the students in the first or second levels. It serves large segments of the population and not just the wealthiest ones. The economic crisis which has limited family resources, and the reduction of State subsidies, have caused serious financial difficulties. Many private establishments are behind in paying their teachers.

The situations described and the ensuing discussions showed that there is great interest in community and private education. In both cases, the trick is to come up with workable models that ensure education is served while also limiting the financial consequences for the State budget. The studies will be published by IIEP.

---

SERGE PÉANO
INTERNATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR EDUCATIONAL PLANNING
Can Africa Finance Her Education Systems in the 21st Century?


The Working Group on Finance and Education held a regional seminar in Johannesburg from 3 to 4 December 1999. The theme was: “Can Africa Finance Her Educational Systems in the 21st century?”

Attendance

The seminar was attended by some thirty supervisors from the Ministries of Education and Finance—mostly directors of planning, administration, finance and the budget from Benin, Botswana, Burkina Faso, Burundi, Cote d’Ivoire, Ethiopia, Mauritius, Mozambique, South Africa, Tanzania and Zanzibar. Representatives of other organizations also took part: IIEP, the World Bank, UNESCO and the Netherlands Embassy in Burkina Faso.

Purpose

The regional seminar’s main goal was to promote a general debate about future prospects for financing African education systems, through the exchange of ideas and experiences. During the two days of presentations and a roundtable, it set about analyzing the various means and strategies used in different countries, in order to respond to such questions as: Who has been funding education, who is funding it and who will be funding it? How are funds intended for education being managed and how should they be managed in order to ensure quality education for all in the 21st century? What should the State’s role be and what partnerships should be promoted between the state and the other actors in financing education—such as parents, communities, non-governmental organizations, international institutions, businesses and the private sector?

Program

The seminar included presentations on the following topics:

- Will South Africa have the means to educate its children in the 21st century?
- Policies, financing and servicing of education in Ethiopia.
- Financing higher education and equal opportunities for education in Swaziland.
- Aspects of financing education in Swaziland.
- The funding of education in Côte d’Ivoire: opportunities, difficulties, prospects.

The round table discussions were organized around the following introductory presentations on:

- Financing the education of girls in Benin: an alternative to the partnership network.
- Prospects for financing higher education in Africa during the 21st century.

The various presentations gave a good overview of the problems involved in financing education in African countries, the solutions brought to bear and the prospects for the future. The round table provided a summary of presentations and discussions, set forth the conditions without which the financing of education in Africa in the 21st century would be unlikely, and allowed recommendations to be made.

Coiffi Rémy Noumou
CODESRIA
Coordinator of the Working Group on Finance and Education

Quotes from Johannesburg

- When we discuss community participation, we tend to highlight the construction of buildings, financing and access. But we have little information on the relevance of programs. Access is one of the challenges of education; but there is also quality and the coherence between what is learnt in school and the social, cultural and economic environment.

Ahlin Byll-Cataria
Leader of the Working Group on Nonformal Education, Swiss Development Cooperation (SDC), Switzerland

- The question that was posed in Burundi was to develop techniques to improve the quality of community participation, in order for community participation to be directly related to the level of education of its members. The quality of the intervention and participation of the community depends on their level of education and that comes through literacy.

Mr. Aaron Barutwanyo
Director General
Ministry of National Education
Burundi

- When you look at community participation it is mostly in rural areas where people are already very poor. But what kind of participation are we talking about? In most cases, we tend to sacrifice many things, the quality of education for example. We further impoverish our communities and we are not helping in any way to create an equitable education system in Africa.

Non-identified participant

- We need to make a shift, a conceptual shift, that education centers on learning, not on schooling. Once that shift is made governments will then appreciate that their responsibility is to facilitate, to promote, to finance, to regulate learning, wherever it may occur, however it may occur, or whoever the beneficiaries might be. If we continue to reflect along that line on access, we come to another important point which is providing communities with opportunities, with options and with choices. Opportunities not just to build schools, but opportunities to have a say in defining education policy.

Cream Wright
Commonwealth Secretariat
Towards Better Book Distribution in Africa!

The Biennale provided the ADEA Working Group on Books and Learning Materials with the opportunity to disseminate the results of the research on the Intra-African trade in books, which it has been supporting. Given that the Biennale took place at the same time and in the same location as the Sub-Saharan Africa Meeting on Education for All, the Working Group was keen to draw attention to the problems of trying to improve EFA in a context in which the sharing of relevant educational materials is constrained by commercial and fiscal barriers.

Feedback on the publication concerning

Ministers, Permanent Secretaries and Directors of Education from 18 different countries in Africa South of the Sahara came to a breakfast meeting on 7th December for the launch of the pilot edition of Expanding the Book Trade Across Africa. Egidio Mpanga (APNET Board Member and Chair of the Malawian Publishers’ Association), presented the main findings of the study, assisted by Phaswane Mpe (Publishers’ Association of South Africa and Lecturer in Publishing Studies at the University of Witwatersrand). Both Egidio and Phaswane were members of the research team led by Ruth Makotsi, which investigated the problem of importing and exporting books between African countries.

It was appropriate to discuss the implications of the research in Johannesburg because the team of researchers had been selected by APNET mainly from Southern Africa. Nevertheless, Egidio Mpanga pointed out that, although the research had been undertaken mainly in Botswana, Lesotho, Malawi, Namibia, South Africa, Swaziland, Zambia and Zimbabwe (with data on trade with West and East Africa drawn from Nigeria and Kenya); the negative situation in the region also applies to other parts of the continent. The presentation highlighted the most significant barriers to the intra-African trade in books as being the cumbersome export procedures and the continuing reliance on materials imported from outside Africa, as well as expensive postal rates and high taxation on books and printing components. Tax exemption for books is not the norm. Instead, there are many contradictions between the different types of taxes that apply (or may not apply) in neighboring countries. In addition, the absence of import tariffs in some countries works against the growth of national publishing and bookselling industries.

Ministers’ reactions

During the lively discussion that followed the presentation, Ministers expressed support for the campaign with the following comments. One Minister identified the problem as being the cumbersome export procedures and the continuing reliance on materials imported from outside Africa, as well as expensive postal rates and high taxation on books and printing components. Tax exemption for books is not the norm. Instead, there are many contradictions between the different types of taxes that apply (or may not apply) in neighboring countries. In addition, the absence of import tariffs in some countries works against the growth of national publishing and bookselling industries.

The high prices of books produced locally was raised as a prob-
The high prices of books produced locally is a problem in book procurement; but it is compounded by the various ways in which “different components of book production are taxed at every bend and turn”.

TheBookTradeAcrossAfrica will include a complementary study of the implications of regional economic policies for book development and publishing in Africa. It has been undertaken by Ruth Makotsi and Flora Musonda, and is due to go to press during 2000.

**Break down the barriers!**

The campaign message that taxes on books and publishing impede Education for All was taken up later in the day with journalists at a press conference held for both the ADEA Biennale and the Sub-Saharan Africa EFA Conference. In a subsequent plenary session of the Biennale, the ADEA Books Working Group was urged to redouble its efforts to get media support for the campaign. It was also suggested that the Florence Agreement and the Nairobi Protocol should be more widely ratified and implemented, and that ADEA should approach the IMF in order to raise the issue of adverse taxes affecting the book sector.

Posters urging Governments to “Promote reading!” “Break down the barriers!” “Bring down prices of Books through tax breaks on paper, printing equipment and books!” were also distributed. Initial reactions (e.g. from the Kenyan Publishers’ Association) demonstrate that journalists present have carried home the message. Let us hope that it is taken up by participants at the World Education Forum in Dakar at the end of April!

**Expanding the Book Trade Across Africa** will include a complementary study of the implications of regional economic policies for book development and publishing in Africa. It has been undertaken by Ruth Makotsi and Flora Musonda, and is due to go to press during 2000.

The campaign message that taxes on books and publishing impede Education for All was taken up later in the day with journalists at a press conference held for both the ADEA Biennale and the Sub-Saharan Africa EFA Conference. In a subsequent plenary session of the Biennale, the ADEA Books Working Group was urged to redouble its efforts to get media support for the campaign. It was also suggested that the Florence Agreement and the Nairobi Protocol should be more widely ratified and implemented, and that ADEA should approach the IMF in order to raise the issue of adverse taxes affecting the book sector.

Posters urging Governments to “Promote reading!” “Break down the barriers!” “Bring down prices of Books through tax breaks on paper, printing equipment and books!” were also distributed. Initial reactions (e.g. from the Kenyan Publishers’ Association) demonstrate that journalists present have carried home the message. Let us hope that it is taken up by participants at the World Education Forum in Dakar at the end of April!

**Final edition of the study on book trade in Africa**

In conclusion, Egidio Mpanga responded to Ministers, who had argued that they have to compete with cabinet colleagues for limited funds, that Education for All is one of the keystones in development and the role of books and other printed matter is crucial in its implementation. He thanked the Ministers for coming to the meeting and urged them to take up the issue of tax breaks with government on their return. In distributing a limited number of copies of the initial study, he informed them that the final edition of Expanding the Book Trade Across Africa will include a complementary study of the implications of regional economic policies for book development and publishing in Africa. It has been undertaken by Ruth Makotsi and Flora Musonda, and is due to go to press during 2000.

**Break down the barriers!**

The campaign message that taxes on books and publishing impede Education for All was taken up later in the day with journalists at a press conference held for both the ADEA Biennale and the Sub-Saharan Africa EFA Conference. In a subsequent plenary session of the Biennale, the ADEA Books Working Group was urged to redouble its efforts to get media support for the campaign. It was also suggested that the Florence Agreement and the Nairobi Protocol should be more widely ratified and implemented, and that ADEA should approach the IMF in order to raise the issue of adverse taxes affecting the book sector.

Posters urging Governments to “Promote reading!” “Break down the barriers!” “Bring down prices of Books through tax breaks on paper, printing equipment and books!” were also distributed. Initial reactions (e.g. from the Kenyan Publishers’ Association) demonstrate that journalists present have carried home the message. Let us hope that it is taken up by participants at the World Education Forum in Dakar at the end of April!

**Carew Treffgarne**

**Leader of the ADEA Working Group on Books and Learning Materials**

1. The main purpose of the Florence Agreement and the Nairobi Protocol on the Importation of Educational, Scientific and Cultural Materials is to encourage their circulation by reducing import taxes and commercial and fiscal barriers, in accordance with UNESCO’s mandate.

The ADEA Steering Committee held an extraordinary session December 9, immediately after the closing of the ADEA Biennal Meeting. Four new members of the Ministers’ Bureau were welcomed: Hon. Prospère Mpawenayo of Burundi, Hon. Osman Saleh Mohammed of Eritrea, Hon. Lesao Archibald Lehohla of Lesotho and Hon. Evelyn Kandakai of Liberia.

The Biennale was the focus of the Steering Committee’s discussions and members were able to share their immediate impressions. The Steering Committee also mapped out the general work plan for the second phase of the prospective stock-taking. Essentially it would:

- improve the national reports and involve the African research community, when appropriate;
- disseminate the case studies and the synthesis report;
- take note of initiatives for tackling the problem of AIDS; and
- explore further the issue of quality in education.

The plans for the second phase of the prospective stock-taking will be discussed in more detail at the next Steering Committee Meeting.

With Mr Trevor Coombe acting as his spokesman, the Hon. Kader Asmal (who was unable to attend) offered the heartfelt thanks of the Department of Education to ADEA for having chosen South Africa as the meeting place for the Biennale. The President of the Steering Committee then thanked the South African government and the Department of Education in turn for their warm welcome and assistance.

The next meeting of the Steering Committee will take place in Dakar on 29 and 30 April, just after the World Forum on education from 26 to 28 April.
The symposium on Nonformal Education organized by the ADEA Working Group on Nonformal Education (WGNFE) brought together a diverse group of policy makers, researchers, practitioners and development agencies committed to achieving Education for All (EFA) through the diversification of education approaches. There were 79 participants at the symposium coming from 18 African countries and other countries (Bangladesh, India, Canada, Denmark, Sweden, Norway, the U.K and the USA).

**Topics discussed**

The general theme for the symposium was: *The Dynamics of Nonformal Education*. This theme was divided into the following sub-themes:

- From Literacy to Lifelong Learning to the Creation of Learning Societies
- Creating a Reading Environment and Literate Culture (The theme was explored jointly with Working Group on Books and Learning Materials)
- Using Literacy and Nonformal Education for Community Empowerment (a show and tell session followed by questions and answers)
- Alternative Learning Opportunities–The role of Nonformal Education (case studies and models of good practice)
- Linking Formal Education and Nonformal Education for Integrated Diversity
- Nonformal Education in Asia (case studies)

Throughout the symposium, WGNFE activities, concerns and achievements to date were highlighted.

**An exhibition, field visits and plenary and group discussions**

There was an exhibition of nonformal education (NFE) publications, videos, photographs and posters brought by both the symposium organizers and participants. Participants spent time studying and discussing the exhibits and at the same time broadened their networks and information sources.

The first day of the symposium was devoted to a field visit of several NFE programs around Johannesburg and in the Mpumalanga province. After the visit, the participants gathered together for a discussion on the NFE programs they had visited. Comparisons were made between what they observed in South Africa and programs in their own countries. All participants rated the field visits as an excellent start to the symposium and applauded the organisers for including the item in the program. The second and third days of the symposium were spent presenting and discussing papers related to the above listed themes, in plenary sessions. The papers presented were subjected to critical analysis which sparked off heated debates and lively discussions. The program also provided space for group work to allow participants to discuss their own activities, concerns and achievements within the context of the WGNFE activities. The group work and plenary discussions was also an opportunity to chart the way forward for WGNFE.

One of the highlights of the symposium was the Asia Case Study Presentation and Exhibition on December 3, 1999. Three panelists from Bangladesh presented absorbing and innovative case-studies of NFE projects in their communities. The case studies demonstrated the sustaining and empowering nature of community-based projects in the areas of science and technology and basic and continuing education when programs meet the values and needs of the learners. These programs involved the learners in the policy formulation, planning, implementation and monitoring stages of the programs.

**Key resolutions of the meeting**

Important decisions were made at the symposium. South Africa committed itself to setting up procedures to establish a country working group on nonformal education. The symposium underscored the importance of establishing working teams where issues in nonformal education can be raised, addressed and followed up. Key resolutions included:

- the establishment of a policy forum to develop a policy document on NFE. This policy forum should incorporate a wealth of ideas with a focus on democratisation and capacity building. This would promote integration at the level of the system, the institution and micro-level programming. The policy forum and document would address issues of knowledge, values, gender, HIV/AIDS and management of diversified education delivery systems. The Commonwealth Secretariat will
Education Sector Analysis: results and prospects

WGESA organized four days of meetings in conjunction with the ADEA Biennale in Johannesburg. The first two days were devoted to the Steering Committee. The other two were devoted to a seminar featuring the national reviews of education sector analysis and a study of the partnership between governments and international agencies in Burkina Faso, Ghana and Mozambique.

Steering Committee meeting

Future activities and the organization of the Working Group in relation to the new program for 2000-2001 were discussed. The group gave priority to the strengthening of capacities in education sector analysis and is planning a new approach that will be more pro-active than retrospective.

National reviews of education sector analysis

The WGESA has been supporting and financing national reviews since 1996. It has done so in order to improve the quality and use of sector analyses and, over time, to influence the design of educational policies. This seminar provided the opportunity for teams undertaking reviews in different countries to share their experiences.

The presentations focused on two issues: the process of sector analysis and its role in policy-making. One of the major findings was that the teams studying “process” had encountered similar kinds of problems: difficulty getting access to information and documentation, and difficulty getting interviews with key people.

Another result of the national reviews was finding how little impact sector analysis has on educational policy. This could be explained by the under-utilization of national consultants, the weak cooperation existing among all the parties involved and in particular the weak involvement of the research community in the process of drawing up educational policies.

Discussions highlighted the need to develop institutional capacities and to define a global strategy for implementing sector analysis—with stages and responsibilities clearly defined—so that the goal of being able to participate effectively in policy-making would be met.

The WGESA expects to do an evaluation of these reviews and to extract certain lessons for the future.

Partnership between international agencies and Ministries of Education

This study was based on numerous interviews with high level civil servants and other key people in the three countries concerned. Its purpose was to compare the nature of the different relationships between funding agencies involved in the development of education and the governments, in a context of introducing new programs for developing the education sector. Although there seems to be consensus among agencies and ministries about the necessity of changing methods and behaviors relating to aid, initial findings suggest there is still a long way to go. The study claims that the structural conditions that govern aid relations continue to limit the efforts being made to achieve any real and effective partnership.

It appears that despite a shared appreciation of the need to take a global sectoral approach in the three countries, conditions linked to the different contexts put the brakes on efforts to change. According to the study, a number of factors could improve the situation, including: more continuity in government leadership, more effective institutional structures and capacity—as much on the part of governments as the agencies—a greater amount of sharing and dialogue, more transparency about self-interests, and a common definition of roles and strategies. These factors appear to be most present in Mozambique.

Education and to link with all stakeholders in NFE at the national and regional levels. The meeting would include discussions on the integration of formal education and nonformal education and the importance of bridging nonformal education with formal education, allowing people to move in and out of formal or nonformal education and vice versa. This means engaging ministers in a discussion of strategies that can bring the techniques of nonformal to the formal system. In the same way, positive elements from the formal system can be brought into the nonformal System.

CREAM WRIGHT
SECRETARIAT DU COMMONWEALTH
COORDONNATEUR DU GROUPE DE TRAVAIL SUR L’ÉDUCATION NON-FORMELLE

LENE BUCHERT
UNESCO
COORDINATOR OF THE WORKING GROUP ON EDUCATION SECTOR ANALYSIS
### ADEA activities

**Communication for Education and Development (COMED) Program**
- National Training Workshop for Journalists and Communication Officers. Abidjan, Côte d’Ivoire, May (Dates to be determined).
- Regional Training Workshop for Journalists and Communication Officers. Yaoundé, Cameroon, 21-30 June.

**Meeting of the ADEA Leaders and Coordinators**
Nairobi, Kenya, 18-19 June.

**Working Group on Education Sector Analysis (WGESA)**

**Working Group on Early Childhood Development (WGECD)**
- Meeting on AIDS. June (Dates to be determined).

**Working Group on the Teaching Profession, francophone section (WGTP/fs)**
- Meeting for the launching of national reviews. Niamey, Niger, 8-10 May.
- Meeting on AIDS; elaboration of national action plans. Lome, Togo, 29-31 May.

**Working Group on Higher Education (WGHE)**

**Working Group on Finance and Education (WGFE)**
- Dissemination Seminar. Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso, May (Dates and venue to be confirmed).
- Dissemination Seminar. Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso, June (Dates and venue to be confirmed).
- Technical Seminar. June (Dates and venue to be confirmed).

---

**Quarterly Newsletter published by ADEA**
Please address all correspondence to:
The Editor, ADEA Newsletter
Association for the Development of Education in Africa
7-9 rue Eugène-Delacroix, 75116 Paris, France
Tel: +33/ (0) 145.03.37.96
Fax: +33/ (0) 145.03.39.65
E-mail: adea@iiep.unesco.org
Web Site: http://www.adeanet.org